

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21

BALTIMORE CITY DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING  
and COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMISSION

100 Holliday Street  
4 Floor  
Baltimore, Maryland

Tuesday, June 18, 2019

BEFORE: DAVID BOWERS, COMMISSION PRESIDENT

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

- TISHA GUTHRIE
- DAMIEN HAUSSLING
- MATTHEW HILL
- ILLETHA JOYNES
- VERNADINE KIMBALL
- ERNST VALERY
- TIARA WATKINS
- JALAL GREENE
- ALAN INGRAHAM

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21

ALSO PRESENT:  
  
BRANDON SCOTT  
LISA STURTEVANT  
TERREL ASKEW  
JIM MAJORS  
STACY FREED  
CHRISTINA FLOWERS  
AMANDA DESTEFANO  
SAKINA ILYAS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21

INDEX

Page

Opening of Meeting by President Bowers	4
Approval of Minutes	9
Lessons from other jurisdictions Lisa Sturtevant	10
City Spending Policies Jalal Greene Jim Majors Stacy Freed	37
Future meeting structure	73
Public comments	81
Other business	91
Adjournment	99



1 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Tiara Watkins?

2 MS. WATKINS: Present.

3 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Tisha Gutherie?

4 MS. GUTHERIE: Present.

5 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Cindy is not here.

6 Damien Haussling?

7 MR. HAUSSLING: Present.

8 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you.

9 Matt Hill.

10 MR. HILL: Present.

11 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Shanon is not here.

12 And Alan Ingraham.

13 MR. INGRAHAM: Present.

14 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Great. So seeing that we  
15 have more than half of the Members of the Commission  
16 present, we duly have a quorum, and can proceed.

17 Let me say I want to acknowledge, and say  
18 thanks for Councilmember John Bullock for being here this  
19 evening and stopping by. Thank you, Councilmember. Good  
20 to have you here. Thanks for your presence here this  
21 evening.

1           The next thing on our agenda, all Commission  
2 Members should have, I think there are copies in the room  
3 as well, copies of the agenda. We will approve the  
4 minutes, and you will see in our package, and I want to  
5 thank the staff at the Department of Housing for the  
6 assistance in putting this together, and for members of  
7 the public as well. So there is a meeting synopsis that  
8 we will use to approve as minutes the full transcript of  
9 the notes from the meeting that are being taken -- we  
10 thank our gentleman here for taking those -- are  
11 available for folks, for the public. And so what we are  
12 doing, because that is a number of pages, a lot, a lot of  
13 pages of literally an official transcript of the meeting.  
14 So everything is captured.

15           But this meeting synopsis is an attempt to get  
16 at the key points that are taken, and will serve as the  
17 minutes for approval. So I'll allow Members of the  
18 Commission to take a look at the synopsis. And if there  
19 are no questions or issues or corrections to be made, if  
20 there are, please let us know, if not, we will entertain  
21 a motion to approve the synopsis as the minutes.

1           While members are reviewing the synopsis, let  
2 me note the presence of Commission Member Ernest Valery  
3 is now present at the meeting. So we'll let the minutes  
4 reflect that as well.

5           MR. HILL: David, I'm sorry.

6           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Yes.

7           MR. HILL: I just had one thing I should have  
8 noted before under -- didn't see before -- legal  
9 requirements and open meeting act requirements, the fifth  
10 bullet down, restrictions on participation, and possible  
11 financial interests. It says Commissioners should  
12 participate in matter being discussed. In other -- I'm  
13 sorry. So if Commissioners have a possible financial  
14 interest they should participate or they should not  
15 participate -- should read should not?

16           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Should not.

17           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Should not.

18           MR. HILL: Okay.

19           PRESIDENT BOWERS: So the meeting notes, the  
20 fifth bullet -- thank you, Matt Hill, restrictions on  
21 participation, possible financial interest, Commissioners

1 should not -- we'll insert the word not between should  
2 and participate. But please note if there -- and the  
3 rest will remain. Any other questions, suggestions,  
4 edits?

5 (Pause.)

6 PRESIDENT BOWERS: If Members are comfortable,  
7 we'll entertain a motion to approve. Is there a motion  
8 on? So moved?

9 MR. INGRAHAM: So moved.

10 PRESIDENT BOWERS: It's been moved by --

11 MR. HAUSSLING: Second.

12 MR. INGRAHAM: Al Ingraham.

13 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Mr. Al Ingraham.

14 MR. HAUSSLING: Second.

15 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Seconded by Mr. Damien  
16 Haussling.

17 All in -- any discussion on that?

18 All right. There's a motion to approve. Any  
19 -- all in favor of approving the meeting synopsis from  
20 the May 19, 2019, meeting? All in favor say aye.

21 MEMBERS: Aye.

1           PRESIDENT BOWERS: All opposed, nay.

2           All right. All have approved. And so those  
3 minutes are approved.

4           Thank you much. Thank you again to Department  
5 staff for assistance with that. Thank you, Matt, for the  
6 correction. And just a note too for Members, for all of  
7 us, if you ever have a -- when in doubt, consult with the  
8 Ethics Board. So if you ever have a question, not quite  
9 sure, before you pull yourself out or stay in, in a place  
10 where you know you may have conflict or take yourself out  
11 unnecessarily. Want to make sure you consult with Ethics  
12 Board.

13           Great. Okay. Before we move on in our  
14 conversation here in the meeting, we want to recognize  
15 that the Council President, Mr. Scott, is here. Council  
16 President, good to see you. Thank you for being here,  
17 sir. Thank you. We appreciate the fact that you are  
18 here. We are not quite at the point on the agenda of  
19 public comment. But given sir you are President of  
20 Council, if there's a word you would like to say, we'll  
21 put it towards that time later, but allow you to say it

1 now in case you have other business you need to attend  
2 to. Anything you would like to say this evening?

3 MR. SCOTT: Yes. Just very quickly. Don't  
4 want to stop you from your most important work. I just  
5 came by to say thank you. This is very important work  
6 that you guys are undertaking. We know the issues that  
7 are -- and we know how important it is for us. We thank  
8 -- you guys to take your time, dedicate to serve in order  
9 to come before us, to come -- Baltimore. Thank you very  
10 much. You're in great hands with Councilman Bullock. I  
11 know that this is a issue very important to him. It's  
12 also very important to me. Just want to say thank you to  
13 each and every one of you -- so thank you very much.

14 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you, sir. Thank you,  
15 Mr. President. Thank you so much.

16 So as we move on to Item 3 on the agenda, we  
17 will recall that from the conversation from even the  
18 first meeting, the notion of part of the role for the  
19 Commission here, and I will read from the Charter the  
20 Commission duties. The Commission shall make  
21 recommendations, advise and consult with the Department

1 of Housing and Community Development regarding the  
2 establishment of the essential policies, rules and  
3 regulations relating to the implementation, expenditures  
4 and ongoing operation of the Trust Fund. That is the  
5 first bullet. And as it relates to that, we wanted to  
6 start off in the early stages of our work here trying to  
7 get input from folks in our field, who can give us  
8 insights on kind of lessons learned from other  
9 experiences with Trust Funds around the region an/or  
10 around the country. Later in the agenda, we will have a  
11 conversation in number six, where we will talk as a  
12 Commission about other voices that we may want to hear,  
13 other input that we may want to get, and how we may want  
14 to structure that input. But tonight we are blessed to  
15 have Dr. Lisa Sturtevant, who is the President of SL --  
16 LSA, excuse me, who will come and present for us as you  
17 see some key insights from other jurisdictions  
18 experiences with housing Trust Funds.

19           So with that, Dr. Sturtevant, we'll turn it  
20 over to you. And I ask Dr. Sturtevant during her --  
21 she's got a 25-minute block on the agenda, to take maybe

1 half of that time for the presentation, and then leave  
2 time in the second half for any questions, comments or  
3 questions that Commission Members may have so we can also  
4 have a dialog with Dr. Sturtevant.

5           So Dr. Sturtevant the floor is yours.

6           DR. STURTEVANT: Thank you, Mr. Bowers. Do you  
7 mind if I stand here, and then that way I can with you  
8 all, and -- because otherwise I feel like I have my back  
9 to --

10           PRESIDENT BOWERS: That is fine.

11           DR. STURTEVANT: Thank you very much to the  
12 Commission. Thank you, Mr. Bowers, for the chance to be  
13 here. Thank you for -- all of you for being in  
14 attendance. I have some slides that are in the handout.  
15 So we're going to old school tonight, no PowerPoint. So  
16 follow along, and I will try and stay brief knowing that  
17 we have lots of time for more conversation if and when  
18 that comes about.

19           On page 2, just a little bit about myself just  
20 so that you know where I'm coming from. I own a small  
21 consulting firm based in Alexandria. I do a lot of local

1 housing studies. Montgomery County, Prince Georges  
2 County, City of Cambridge, as well as communities in  
3 Virginia, including Arlington and Fairfax and other  
4 places in Delaware and South Carolina. And so really do  
5 a lot of means assessments and policy planning and  
6 forecasts. And at the same time, have a chance to do  
7 some research for national organizations like the Urban  
8 Land Institute, the National -- Housing Council. So I've  
9 been doing this work for a little while, and I constantly  
10 am learning things. And so I really appreciate the  
11 chance to come and learn a little bit about what you all  
12 are doing, and be part of the discussion about it.  
13 Because what you're doing here I think is very innovative  
14 and new, and I think there's things can be learned from  
15 other places, but I think you all have the power to also  
16 be a leader on things, just from the very little that  
17 I've read so far.

18           On the next page, you'll see that -- I'm going  
19 to be very high-level tonight, because, again, we have  
20 lots of time to do this, do more on this. But more and  
21 more local communities are adopting housing Trust Funds.

1 So I want to touch a little bit on what we've learned  
2 from different communities about some of the best  
3 practices in setting up and administering, evaluating and  
4 holding accountable housing Trust Funds. And some things  
5 that may be roadblocks to try and avoid since we've seen  
6 other folks come in contact with them. Might as well  
7 learn from some other folks.

8           So there's nearly 800 local housing Trust Funds  
9 around the country that have generated more than \$2.5  
10 billion for housing locally. That is a huge amount of  
11 money, and it is increasingly a testament to the local  
12 jurisdictions looking for ways to fill the gap that the  
13 federal government isn't filling.

14           I get asked a lot by local communities, that  
15 what one policy should we be adopting in the community to  
16 solve our housing -- I think there is a very small number  
17 of things that all communities should do for sure, and I  
18 think having a locally dedicated source of funding feels  
19 like it is part of the most successful of the communities  
20 housing -- and so there are a few other things that I  
21 think are valuable as well, but certainly the local

1 resources.

2           And then on the next slide, on slide four then,  
3 just the benefits as you well know having had this  
4 conversation in the community, the flexibility, the  
5 consistency of funding with a dedicated source of local  
6 resources, the ability to leverage other federal, state,  
7 -- resources. The economic impact. When you build  
8 housing with local housing Trust Fund dollars there's an  
9 economic multiplier in the economy. That's a benefit  
10 more broadly in the economy.

11           So on the next slide, Dave asked me to kind of  
12 talk a little bit about best practices. And most of the  
13 -- what I want to present I've learned when I was doing  
14 reviews for other communities when they were setting up  
15 their Trust Funds. When I was at the National Housing  
16 Conference in we did a lot of work on Trust Funds. And  
17 so I know you're going to have an opportunity to talk to  
18 the experts, who are running Trust Funds on the ground,  
19 and that will be incredibly valuable. So I just want to  
20 provide a little bit of takeaway more from the research  
21 side, more from the evaluation side. I'm going to talk

1 about four examples.

2           But I think that when you look at some of the  
3 most successful places, and even some of the places that  
4 may not have been successful, but have been trying to  
5 look for new ways to administer Trust Funds, six -- five  
6 things sort of stand out, and I want to just touch on  
7 each of these five things to sort of think about how to  
8 reflect on how those made for a successful local Trust  
9 Fund.

10           So on the next page, a little bit about  
11 regular, predictable funding. I think this more than  
12 anything is the hallmark of the successful local housing  
13 Trust Fund. It's having a source of reliable, dedicated,  
14 consistent funding outside of the annual appropriations  
15 process, which is key. So that it doesn't come up to a  
16 vote every year. So that it is set in regulation or  
17 policy. Knowing that depending on how it is set up it --  
18 the amounts will fluctuate from year-to-year, but the  
19 guarantee of a revenue source is not up for debate with a  
20 change in administration, with a change in council, with  
21 a change in with -- in sentiment. Because there are so

1 many priorities at the local level, it's really hard to  
2 have those conversations every year. We have X dollars.  
3 If we put Y here, it means there's nothing for over here.  
4 And so this dedicated source is really important. And  
5 there's different kinds of sources, which you can see  
6 here from different kinds of taxes, tax increment  
7 financing, condominium conversion fees, inclusionary  
8 zoning in lieu fees, and so on.

9           But I want to mention the bottom two in  
10 particular. Similar to the dedicated source of funding,  
11 it feels to me from what I've read the most successful  
12 local Trust Funds are those that are revolving funds,  
13 where part of the funding each year comes from the  
14 repayment of loans that the fund made prior to projects.  
15 And so that way the loans are -- the money is coming out  
16 in the form of a loan instead of a grant, and so there is  
17 a portion of each allocation to the Trust Fund that is  
18 actually being made by folks who benefited from receiving  
19 monies from the Trust Fund.

20           I will also say that while having annual  
21 appropriations as the sole source of funding can work.

1 It's more common then if there's an annual appropriation  
2 supplement, what comes from a dedicated source.

3           The second thing on the next page then, the  
4 second thing that's really -- I found this really  
5 important that the goals and priorities and the targets  
6 of the funding are very specifically tied to the needs of  
7 the community. And that might sound so basic. You might  
8 say, well, Lisa, of course. Why would we have put this  
9 committee together, if we're not going to address the  
10 needs in the community? But there have been Trust Funds  
11 set up before there's been any type of analysis of what  
12 the actual needs are in the community, and then a  
13 community discussion about where the priorities are. And  
14 so there's different ways to target resources. But the  
15 best way is to connect it to a public needs assessment.  
16 To look for places that other sources of funding aren't  
17 getting met, is one way to prioritize. To look where the  
18 needs are the greatest, and have been neglected for the  
19 longest is another way to prioritize. To look where  
20 there's opportunities. So flexibility is also -- could  
21 be part of this needs assessment to take advantage of

1 opportunities.

2           But I think the successful Trust Funds I've  
3 seen have really come about as part of or following a  
4 really comprehensive assessment of the needs in the  
5 community and a dialog community-wide about where the  
6 funds should be targeted.

7           I will say there's this constraint here about  
8 making -- I'm going to give examples, and hopefully we'll  
9 touch on each of these ideas I'm thinking about. When  
10 you set targets, it's really important that the targets  
11 are consistent with the amount of money you have to work  
12 with because that can come back and bite you too. If you  
13 sort of promise the moon, and then the funding is -- I  
14 don't know what the moon, what would be lower than the  
15 moon, but you know so then there is a challenge with  
16 maintaining community trust. And I'm going to come back  
17 to that issue, actually because that comes back a lot in  
18 the analysis of local Trust Funds.

19           On the next page, one of the things that I  
20 think is really important, and sometimes overlooked,  
21 especially in a place as complicated and sophisticated as

1 Baltimore where there is lots of activity around housing  
2 and land use and transportation, but really making sure  
3 that any activity that the Trust Fund is taking a look at  
4 is not putting money where another source has already  
5 been putting money. So taking advantage of leveraging of  
6 the money for sure, but not coming in and funding the  
7 same projects that already have a funding source. That  
8 happens very easily because we know how to do that,  
9 right, so that that happens.

10 I think it's also important that the criteria  
11 that gets set up for funding projects, and we'll talk  
12 about that as well, that the criteria that gets set up  
13 are not in conflict with other City goals. That's really  
14 important, right? So you can sort of decide that you  
15 have goals of promoting certain kinds of residential  
16 development with funding from the Trust Fund, but if it's  
17 at odds with economic development planning or housing  
18 planning, generally, or transportation planning, then you  
19 could run into problems. But at least sort of make sure  
20 that proactively you are being consistent with a  
21 comprehensive plan if nothing else. But even better

1 would be to reinforce this leverage of the goals in the  
2 community with the Trust Fund. And that's complicated.  
3 That could be challenging. But that's been a hallmark of  
4 some of the most successful programs.

5           On the next slide, number four, you're going to  
6 have a chance to talk with the experts about process,  
7 about folks who are administering Trust Funds on the  
8 ground. But I just want to say that indicative of the  
9 range of different programs and policies that are funded  
10 with local Trust Fund dollars, the types of programs or  
11 projects that are funded often dictate the process.  
12 Okay.

13           So, for example, if the goal was to fund  
14 production of new housing, sometimes what makes the most  
15 sense is one or two time a year RFP process, or notice of  
16 financing -- funding availability process. If you're  
17 looking for projects to come together so they can be  
18 evaluated side by side. If the focus is on rental  
19 assistance to families or home buyer assistance, well,  
20 that should be ongoing. Shouldn't make people wait. So  
21 I think I just raised that to say that the folks who have

1 been successful, I feel like they've looked at the types  
2 of support they want to provide, and created a process  
3 that's consistent with what they're going to do.

4 And five, let's turn quickly.

5 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Sorry, I meant five minutes.  
6 Not hit number five. Just five minutes.

7 DR. STURTEVANT: No, no, I know, I know. I'm  
8 going to say go to six, Consistent with Local Capacity.  
9 We can talk about that more. So for example, so the next  
10 slide is on DC's Trust Fund. Very familiar with it I'm  
11 sure. If you'll notice, they're targeting half of their  
12 funds to families below 80 percent Area Median Income --  
13 lease assessment. They have an ID program that hits  
14 higher income folks. They have a home buyer program that  
15 they're starting that also hits higher income folks. But  
16 their \$130 million fund is focused primarily on those  
17 below 50 percent of Area Median Income.

18 On the next process you can see a little bit  
19 about their NOFA. And they have set up scoring criteria  
20 to provide funding to projects. And as you may have  
21 noticed recently, there's been some conflict over that

1 process. So there are criteria, but then it turns out  
2 that several of the projects that were awarded funding  
3 actually scored lower than those that did receive  
4 funding.

5           So having the criteria were important, but this  
6 discretionary process that came into play I think has  
7 started to make people feel very concerned about the  
8 transparency of the process. So that's just a note.

9           In Arlington, which is the next slide, the  
10 point I'll make from that is they did a really good job  
11 of doing a needs assessment, which came out and said we  
12 need 585 net new affordable units every single year. And  
13 then they funded a fund that supports the construction of  
14 285 homes.

15           And so if you're going to set this goal, and  
16 tie it to the Fund, it's really important that the --  
17 that it's consistent.

18           And then the next slide talks a little bit  
19 about some of the process that Arlington goes through.  
20 One note I'll tell you about Arlington is they have a  
21 very extensive scoring criteria. They're trying to

1 achieve a lot of things from need certification to  
2 digital equity to presence in a transit corridor. Those  
3 things make projects more expensive, and then they get to  
4 fund fewer of them. So I think wanting to do too much  
5 with your criteria can also lend itself to problems.  
6 They've had a hard time fulfilling their intended  
7 targets.

8           I'm going to talk a little bit about Philly.  
9 It's a program I know less about, but there's been some  
10 interesting elements that you, I'm sure you all know.  
11 There's new funding available to the Trust Fund in  
12 Philadelphia. There was a impact tax that was -- was not  
13 passed to support the Fund, but there is a source of  
14 funding. And if you look on the next page, I think one  
15 of the concerns is that a big chunk of the funding is  
16 going to support folks in the middle income graphic when  
17 some of the needs assessments suggest very clearly that  
18 there are significant needs that may not be as completely  
19 addressed as they should be or as many people feel they  
20 should be.

21           And so they're also adopting an inclusionary

1 zoning style density bonus program, and it feels like  
2 there's an opportunity to use that program to target  
3 higher income households, while focusing more of the  
4 Trust Fund resources at the lower income households.  
5 But, again, that's just my read of what's going on in  
6 Philly.

7           Lastly, I just want to mention Denver. They  
8 limit their Trust Fund to 10 years, which I find a little  
9 strange. I'm not exactly sure why did that. But they  
10 are funding their Trust Fund through a commercial linkage  
11 fee, which is basically saying, look, when you build a  
12 new office, you use new commercial space, you're going to  
13 be generating a demand for housing. So if you put some  
14 money in, make sure the folks you're going to bring in  
15 with your new development have a place to live. And it's  
16 a different market because they aren't worried about  
17 dissuading market redevelopment in Denver. They're  
18 having a lot going on. But they on the next page have  
19 set up an Advisory Committee, 23 members. And one of the  
20 lessons learned is 23 members was too many members. They  
21 have had a very hard time getting funding out the door,

1 primarily because of 23 members.

2           So that was a whirlwind. I probably should  
3 have started with the cases and forgotten about the stuff  
4 at the beginning, but would love to hear any reactions or  
5 thoughts or questions on any of that.

6           I have other notes that I didn't say. So if  
7 you have other questions, please let me know.

8           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Let me thank you very much,  
9 Dr. Sturtevant.

10          DR. STURTEVANT: Sure.

11          PRESIDENT BOWERS: Let me start off just with  
12 one question, then open up to Commission Members. Doc,  
13 if you don't mind, your number five --

14          DR. STURTEVANT: Yes.

15          PRESIDENT BOWERS: The process of awarding  
16 funds, the funding criteria. Can you say a word about  
17 that, some of the kind of key lessons learned there,  
18 things that should be kept in mind by the Department and  
19 the Commission? And then we'll open it up to other  
20 questions or comments folks may have.

21          DR. STURTEVANT: Yeah. And I didn't bring a

1 copy of the Arlington's criteria because that was the  
2 most comprehensive. But I think what I've seen in most  
3 places that it just -- you need to be clear on a few very  
4 key things, particularly the populations that are served.  
5 Because there are funds that just say we want to support  
6 affordable housing, and then the developer comes in, and  
7 tells you all what affordable housing is. Well, that's  
8 not -- you want to define it for the project. I think if  
9 there's going to be projects that you want to help to  
10 ensure leverage federal and state funding, it's really  
11 important that the projects meet the criteria that the  
12 federal and state funding would also have you meet. So  
13 making sure those are incorporated.

14           It's really important to decide that -- I mean,  
15 these are the decisions that -- how do you want to  
16 balance affordability term versus income targeting?  
17 There's a tradeoff. The longer you make something  
18 affordable, the -- or the more units you ask for, the  
19 harder it is to go more deeply affordable. And so what  
20 are those terms going to be? Will services be required  
21 as part of projects funded through the Trust Fund? And

1 then how do projects connect with other things going on  
2 in the City.

3           And so, like I said, I think those criteria  
4 have been pretty common across what I've seen. And on  
5 the right-hand side, I think this gets to the  
6 transparency is what is the evaluation? What are  
7 projects or programs being evaluated on? What are the --  
8 you can set it up as either preferences or set-asides or  
9 like a numeric ranking, whoever comes out on top. But  
10 whatever the decision, the thing that's been successful  
11 is to be really transparent.

12           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you.

13           DR. STURTEVANT: Sure.

14           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Anybody else on the  
15 Commission, questions, comments?

16           Yes, sir.

17           MR. INGRAHAM: Well, just an excellent  
18 presentation. I appreciate the data. My question to you  
19 as we embark on this process, do you know of or could you  
20 envision a city that's analogous to what we're dealing  
21 with in Baltimore? It might help us essentially parallel

1 what they're doing to get this started in a more  
2 efficient manner.

3 DR. STURTEVANT: So I tried to think about a  
4 place that would be parallel to Baltimore, and I think, I  
5 mean, maybe you'll appreciate this, but Baltimore is  
6 really unique in a lot of ways, and I think that there  
7 are things that we can learn even from -- I think there  
8 are things you can learn even from a place that doesn't  
9 seem like it has a market like Baltimore's. I was trying  
10 to find places that had a market like Baltimore's. I  
11 said maybe DC is not the best comparison because the  
12 market conditions are very different. But I think the  
13 process is what you want to look at; not necessarily what  
14 they're funding, but how did they decide what to fund.  
15 And I think you can look anywhere for that, any really  
16 good, well-governed Trust Fund. And I think the -- I  
17 don't know as much about Philadelphia's, but certainly  
18 Denver's and DC's and Arlington's are good examples of  
19 thoughtful -- thoughtfulness around setting up the Fund.

20 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Yes, Matt.

21 MR. HILL: Two quick questions. You said one

1 thing that -- you said that longer term affordability is  
2 harder to make more deeply affordable. And if you could  
3 explain a little more about what you meant.

4 DR. STURTEVANT: Sure. Sure. Yes. So, right.  
5 There's like a million things I said way too fast. So if  
6 we're thinking about using Trust Fund dollars to fund the  
7 production of housing, let's say that, right. So housing  
8 costs a certain amount of money to build. And so you  
9 can imagine a home that gets built that targets extremely  
10 low income folks needs a greater subsidy than homes that  
11 are built at 80 percent AMI. Similar, if you ask the  
12 builder to build for a 15-year affordability term, that  
13 needs a short -- a smaller subsidy than if you ask them  
14 to building 99-year affordability term. It's just math.  
15 And so how you sort of pencil those things out will give  
16 you a sense of what the per unit subsidy is going to be.  
17 Arlington calculated their per unit subsidy so they had a  
18 sense of what it was going to be given what they wanted  
19 to fund. And as those choices get made, you can see how  
20 those number change. So I think you could decide though  
21 that permanent affordability is the only kinds of

1 projects you want to fund. Great, perfect, lay it down.  
2 And then -- I'm not advocating -- and then you can go  
3 through and aside like if there are ways you want to  
4 support projects at different income levels, they're  
5 going to require different subsidies. That's all I  
6 meant by that.

7 MR. HILL: Okay. And then real quick, a second  
8 question. DC, I know, has had some difficulty reaching  
9 30 percent of Area Median Income.

10 DR. STURTEVANT: Yeah.

11 MR. HILL: And so what -- you said you looked  
12 at that a little closer.

13 DR. STURTEVANT: Yeah.

14 MR. HILL: And so what would you suggest we  
15 consider as we go forward?

16 DR. STURTEVANT: So DC and , as well have  
17 actually put in place local housing voucher money. So  
18 basically local rental assistance. So you fund a unit  
19 built at 60 percent AMI, and then a family receives local  
20 rental assistance to offset the difference between 30 and  
21 60 percent. Partially because the cost of construction,

1 as you say, makes it so challenging to get at that 30  
2 percent level. Partially because the local rental  
3 assistance programs those folks have in place come  
4 coupled with supportive services that can also be a  
5 benefit to folks at that level.

6 But it feels to me like they have been trying  
7 to combine Trust Fund funding with other kinds of  
8 funding, and then this local rental assistance feels like  
9 a key piece. That's even aside from housing Trust Fund,  
10 I feel like I've seen that more and more. That's the  
11 only way folks are getting to that 30 percent.

12 MR. HILL: And that's a project based rent  
13 supplement?

14 DR. STURTEVANT: And that -- it could be a  
15 project based or like in Arlington there is a housing  
16 grant that moves with the family. So the family can take  
17 it to a committed affordable unit or they can take it to  
18 the market. But taking it to a committed affordable  
19 unit.

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: In Arlington though?

21 DR. STURTEVANT: That's in Arlington. Yeah.

1 You have to take it in Arlington, yes.

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Portable within  
3 Arlington.

4 DR. STURTEVANT: It is only with the county  
5 because it's local county dollars.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

7 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Right.

8 DR. STURTEVANT: So if it was local city  
9 dollars, I could only be used in the city.

10 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Jay.

11 MR. GREENE: Can you -- do you have any insight  
12 of how the cost of that -- what happens over time, and  
13 how did they manage the other jurisdictions --

14 DR. STURTEVANT: Yes.

15 MR. GREENE: -- and reach that component.

16 DR. STURTEVANT: The local rental, yeah. And  
17 so that's a great question, because once you give  
18 assistance -- in this case, it's because it's assistance  
19 to a family, once you give assistance to a family, you  
20 can't pull it back, right. So it's there. And so they  
21 fund their local rental assistance program to a certain

1 level every year for general appropriations. And so then  
2 they manage it similar to the Federal Housing Choice  
3 Voucher Program where people are on wait lists, and --

4 MR. GREENE: So how do they determine how many  
5 vouchers --

6 DR. STURTEVANT: Yeah.

7 MR. GREENE: -- to establish?

8 DR. STURTEVANT: Yeah. That's a great  
9 question. We should get David Casteel (ph.) up here and  
10 ask him. But I think they basically the county said  
11 we're going to put X dollars towards this, and then the  
12 county said we can serve X families. So --

13 MR. GREENE: And work with --

14 DR. STURTEVANT: -- let's do that. Yeah. And  
15 I will say political will to set the money up, I think,  
16 that made that possible in Arlington. It wasn't like the  
17 staff were pushing for it. I think the elected  
18 officials.

19 MR. GREENE: But if you're going to use the  
20 Trust Fund for that --

21 DR. STURTEVANT: Yeah.

1 MR. GREENE: -- then it's a dedicated source  
2 and we --

3 DR. STURTEVANT: That's right.

4 MR. GREENE: -- can determine an amount of  
5 money that goes towards that policy initiative.

6 DR. STURTEVANT: That's right.

7 MR. GREENE: And then work backwards depending  
8 on --

9 DR. STURTEVANT: That's right.

10 MR. GREENE: -- the dollars how many vouchers  
11 can --

12 DR. STURTEVANT: That's right.

13 MR. GREENE: -- actually support.

14 DR. STURTEVANT: And then the only thing about  
15 using the Trust Fund money for rental assistance, again,  
16 is you miss out on leverage, and you miss out on  
17 revolving.

18 MR. GREENE: Right.

19 DR. STURTEVANT: So that's the only -- that's  
20 the tradeoff.

21 MR. GREENE: Right.

1 DR. STURTEVANT: Yeah.

2 MR. GREENE: But it solves the issue because  
3 you have --

4 DR. STURTEVANT: Yep.

5 MR. GREENE: -- the issue because you have  
6 issues there of supporting people at 30 percent of AMI.

7 DR. STURTEVANT: Yeah.

8 MR. GREENE: In those models.

9 PRESIDENT BOWERS: So we've got about two  
10 minutes left in this block. Any other questions,  
11 comments from Commission Members for Dr. Sturtevant?

12 Okay. Dr. Sturtevant, thank you very much for  
13 this.

14 DR. STURTEVANT: Sure.

15 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you for the  
16 presentation --

17 DR. STURTEVANT: Sure.

18 PRESIDENT BOWERS: -- for the information.

19 Obviously, she is available as a resource --

20 DR. STURTEVANT: Any time, please.

21 PRESIDENT BOWERS: -- for us. We appreciate

1 that.

2 DR. STURTEVANT: If you guys have questions,  
3 and you just -- like the question you asked about good  
4 examples, we're talking about X can you show -- I would  
5 be happy to send information.

6 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Great. Thank you so much.  
7 Thank you, Dr. Sturtevant. Appreciate it.

8 PRESIDENT BOWERS: So next on our agenda is to  
9 really get into a conversation about the City -- it's on  
10 the agenda, City spending policies and priorities, and  
11 get some insights into what is happening at the  
12 Department of Housing, and some of the other City pieces  
13 that are going on. So Jay Greene, who is a Member of the  
14 Commission and also at the Department, will take it over  
15 here. And, again, we've built in time, enough time for  
16 Jay to present and also to have questions and dialog and  
17 comments with Members of the Commission.

18 So, Jay, turn it over to you.

19 MR. GREENE: Well, thank you, David. And,  
20 again, it's always a pleasure to be here. With me are  
21 two staff members of the Department: the Assistant

1 Commissioner Jim Majors, and he's going to address some  
2 of the issues here, particularly around the NOFA update  
3 and staffing, and things of that nature; and then we have  
4 Stacy Freed, who is the special advisor, senior advisor  
5 to the Chief Operations Officer, which is me, and she'll  
6 fill in and help us get through, and make sure I touch  
7 everything I'm supposed to touch.

8           But I just wanted to kind of -- this is first  
9 attempt to kind of go over some of our funding sources,  
10 how they're used. We can always take a deeper dive as we  
11 go on, but I just wanted to make the Commission and the  
12 public aware of some of our other funding sources. We  
13 have local funding sources, and we have primarily federal  
14 funding sources. And we also work with the State to  
15 utilize some of their funding. So some of the key local  
16 funding sources is we have CIP funding that's awarded or  
17 appropriated through the budget process from the -- the  
18 Mayor proposes the budget, and the Council approves, and  
19 we have usually money that's targeted towards either  
20 specific projects or our Affordable Housing Program Fund.  
21 For example, I think in this year it was proposed to be

1 \$5 million in Affordable Housing Program Fund. We have  
2 money in CIP for ongoing projects, and RFPs that we have  
3 already put out on the street and awarded for -- recently  
4 we made awards for Harlem Park and Edmondson RFP. We  
5 made awards for the Tivoli RFP. And some of those have  
6 CI -- specific CIP funding. And some of them have some  
7 State funding attached.

8           We also have federal funds that come through  
9 the Department. Our primary source, and Jim will talk a  
10 little bit more about that, is our -- the federal funds  
11 through the Home Program, which we use primarily to fund  
12 multi-family rental housing, new construction primarily.  
13 And we have our CDBG, Community Block Grant money, that  
14 we have. And the Department has primarily used the CDBG  
15 money to fund community organizations and community kind  
16 of activities. We're doing some reevaluation of that to  
17 see what opportunities we'd have to use our CDBG money  
18 for housing development and other community development  
19 activities.

20           I think for the home money, for example, in  
21 this year's budget, we have an appropriation of about \$9

1 million for the home money.

2 MR. MAJORS: Approximately 10 million.

3 MR. GREENE: And for CDBG money, I think it's  
4 20 plus, 21.

5 So those -- that gives you some idea of the  
6 magnitude of those funding. I had mentioned the  
7 Affordable Housing Program Fund that's locally funded.  
8 That's -- for this year has been proposed. Hasn't been  
9 approved yet by the Council. But that's proposed at the  
10 \$5 million mark.

11 And we have other programs that we've just  
12 recently instituted. We started last year with the  
13 Community Catalyst Grant Program, which is a total of \$5  
14 million. Two million is targeted towards community  
15 organizations that are operating -- for operating  
16 activities of their organizations. That's through an RFP  
17 process. We issued that RFP the end of last year. We  
18 made awards the beginning of this year, and we'll be  
19 signing our grant agreement soon.

20 And subsequent to that, in March, we have  
21 3 million of that 5 million is for capital programs. We

1 received back those responses. We're making evaluations  
2 now, and hopefully next month we'll be announcing awards.

3 And this year's budget, hopefully, if it's  
4 approved as is, we'll have the \$5 million again to -- for  
5 that program, the Community Catalyst Grant Programs.

6 And the Department, we run a number of other  
7 programs that are federally funded. Like we have a  
8 Weatherization Program that we run. We have a --  
9 Homeownership Programs that we run where we have money  
10 available for some rehab for homeowners of moderate and  
11 low incomes. And we have subsidies that we actually give  
12 to provide for homeownership.

13 MR. HAUSSLING: Those sources are federal?

14 MR. GREENE: I'm sorry?

15 MR. HAUSSLING: Those sources are federal?

16 MR. GREENE: The weatherization is both federal  
17 and state. Some of the money comes from the Department  
18 of Energy, and for the federal side it's through the  
19 Empowerment Program and some other programs. So it's  
20 both federal and state money. We have money for a lead  
21 program to reduce the amount of lead in our homes.

1 That's primarily a federal program --

2 MS. FREED: HUD.

3 MR. GREENE: -- through HUD. And so those --  
4 it gives you a sense of some of the other programs that  
5 we have. Again, our home program, and Jim will talk more  
6 about this, as I said, it goes primarily into new  
7 construction, rental housing, and we try to marry that  
8 program with state funding and their nine percent Low  
9 Income Housing Tax Credit Program.

10 So just from a policy level, we are promoting  
11 both homeownership. The Department tries to support  
12 homeownership programs. We try to support programs that  
13 keep homeowners in place, existing homeowners in place.  
14 We have programs to -- for preservation where we help  
15 with the rehabilitation of existing homes, vacant homes.  
16 And we also support through some of our programs new  
17 construction. And the range of incomes that the  
18 Department serves is very low income, 30 percent and  
19 below. And our Affordable Housing Program we can use for  
20 probably up to, like, workforce housing income levels of  
21 80 to 100 percent of Area Median Incomes. Having said

1 that, most of our funding is probably for low income.  
2 40, 50, 60 percent of AMI, that's probably where most of  
3 our funding is targeted towards. That's why I was asking  
4 Lisa about some of the programs around 30 percent of AMI,  
5 is that target -- if you target that income level, it  
6 becomes more challenging in a number of different ways.  
7 I mean, Lisa talked about, and we can get into this  
8 later, that you try to some extent you try to make the  
9 Fund a revolving loan fund so that some of the funding in  
10 the future for these funds is not just what your  
11 dedicated revenue source is, but it's also payments from  
12 the loans that you've made, and some of that money comes  
13 back to you, and you get to recycle it again into other  
14 projects.

15           Having said that, when you get into supporting  
16 families of 30 percent of Area Median Income that becomes  
17 extremely difficult to do. And when -- and I think with  
18 Lisa as you get into long-term affordability, which is, I  
19 think, a policy goal the Department supports, and we  
20 understand that goal, it's not the only goal you have,  
21 but that becomes also very expensive as you go forward.

1 And you have to just understand what those -- what that  
2 financial commitment is going to look like. Especially as  
3 you try to match up how much you're going to spend to  
4 support production, and how many families you're going to  
5 help, and what targets you have for units you're going to  
6 create. Because, again, she, I think, mentioned that if  
7 you have a target of -- you're going to have an  
8 unrealistic target that you can't make because of the  
9 type of subsidies that you're giving out to reach your  
10 target market.

11           So we'll be working with the Commission, and it  
12 will be something that the Department will seek to have a  
13 balance, and make rational kind of policy decisions to  
14 help as many families as we can, and to be most effective  
15 in how we use the funding of the Trust Fund. It's a  
16 great resource. Because part of it is then -- as she  
17 talked about leveraging, is how we can use some of this  
18 fund to leverage other sources of money, whether it's  
19 additional federal monies, additional state monies or --  
20 and private financing.

21           So I know that's a lot. I'm going to stop

1 there, but I'm going to let Jim do his presentation about  
2 where we are with staffing, the NOFA, and then we can  
3 open it up to questions. Is that good?

4 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Sure.

5 And, Mr. Majors, if you don't mind just stating  
6 your name for the record so we'll have it in the record.

7 MR. MAJORS: Can everyone hear me?

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

9 MR. MAJORS: I'm going to stand up. So my name  
10 is Jim Majors, and I am the Assistant Commissioner for  
11 Project Finance and Development at HCD. My background,  
12 I'm an underwriter. I'm a numbers person. I've been  
13 with the City approximately 32 years now. I run the Home  
14 Program, and I also run the Tax Credit Program for the  
15 Agency. So I think I know a little bit about  
16 underwriting and how to put deals together.

17 So as Jay mentioned, we receive an allocation  
18 of federal dollars each year, right. Those federal  
19 dollars are home dollars, consider it like a block grant.  
20 So the Home Program was first on the federal books in  
21 1992 is when the legislation was enacted. Funds became

1 available starting in 1994. In the beginning of the  
2 program, the city would receive anywhere between  
3 7, 8 and 10 million dollars each year for production of  
4 affordable housing.

5           Since then over the years the funds have been  
6 decreasing year-by-year. In 2013, there was a change in  
7 the regulations with the Home Program, and the  
8 jurisdictions were receiving less and less funds.  
9 Baltimore's allocation dropped down to around 3.1 of 3.3  
10 million. The allocation that we're going to receive this  
11 year for this upcoming federal fiscal year is \$4.4  
12 million. So what happens when we get these home funds?  
13 We have to get the money out on the street to produce  
14 affordable housing. So how do we get the money out? We  
15 put a NOFA. A NOFA is called -- it means Notice of  
16 Funding Availability. So let me be real, real clear. We  
17 want to be very transparent. We want to be open, and we  
18 also want it to be a competitive process. So when the  
19 NOFA goes out, it's normally tied into when the state  
20 does the nine percent Low Income Housing Tax Credit  
21 deals. Normally, a NOFA will go out about 90 to 120 days

1 before a developer submits their application for tax  
2 credits.

3           You put the NOFA out -- well, first of all we  
4 post it. We post it on the Web. We post it on social  
5 media. We then give the pre-proposal conference where  
6 anyone can come in, ask any type of questions they want  
7 about the NOFA. When applications are due, we get  
8 together, and we review them. So what makes up a good  
9 NOFA? Think of a NOFA like a loan application. They  
10 have basic information, who the players are, who the  
11 lenders are. Take a look at letters of intent, your  
12 financing letters. Does it support the objectives of the  
13 City? Is it in an area that we want to do development  
14 in? Does it comply with all the City requirements? And  
15 does it require -- does it comply with all federal  
16 requirements, meaning Davis-Bacon, MBE, WBE? Davis-Bacon  
17 is applicable for projects that have four or more units.  
18 So under the Home Program, we do large-scale development  
19 projects, 50, 60, 70 plus units. Those projects use tax  
20 credits, and you're looking at multiple sources of funds,  
21 anywhere 6, 7 or 8 different sources of funds to get

1 these projects built. So I am enthusiastic about this  
2 program because it's my understanding it's going to be  
3 run out of my office, and I understand that the program  
4 is going to be geared towards individuals whose incomes  
5 are at 30 and 50 percent. So that will open up the pool  
6 a little bit more, and it will allow smaller developers  
7 to come in and do development.

8           We still are in the process of putting that  
9 program together. We're talking about certain concepts.  
10 We're talking about what the NOFA would look like; when  
11 would we put one out on the street? I'm envisioning  
12 maybe two NOFAs to start out with. I'm thinking that  
13 maybe we will -- no, not maybe, no. We will have a NOFA  
14 out let fall this year for the affordable housing. I  
15 don't know exactly how much we're going to have in the  
16 kitty. We don't know what the curriculum and subsidy is,  
17 but we're still working through all of that.

18           MR. GREENE: Just a point there. When you  
19 publish a NOFA, funding availability, you have to have  
20 the money in hand. Right now the -- if the budget is  
21 approved, we'll have X dollars in appropriation. And I

1 believe we'll have \$17 million in appropriation. But  
2 because this is a dedicated revenue stream to this fund,  
3 it's actually a collection of these tax revenues based on  
4 the economic activity. So at the time that we are ready  
5 to publish this NOFA, it will be based on how much money  
6 we have collected up until that point. We can't put a  
7 NOFA out on the street for funds that we don't actually  
8 have, money we don't actually have. Appropriation,  
9 again, this is a little -- appropriation is the ability  
10 -- gives us the authority to spend up to an amount. But  
11 in order to actually fund projects, we actually have to  
12 have the money in hand.

13 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you.

14 MR. MAJORS: All right. So one of the things  
15 that we look for when we put a NOFA out and it comes in,  
16 we review it, and we take a look at the financing. We  
17 want to make sure that we're not over subsidizing the  
18 project with any of the money that we're putting in. We  
19 want to make sure that there are other sources of funds  
20 in the project. We also want to make sure that the  
21 developer is deferring some of their fee. This is -- we

1 all get to share in this. If we're going to be a lender,  
2 all right, we have to share the costs. So if the  
3 developer defers some of their fee, that's a driving  
4 force for them to have a very good and successful  
5 project. I don't want to get too deep in the weeds on  
6 how much of their fee they should defer, but it's always  
7 open for discussion. We always look at that. We want to  
8 make sure that each and every developer has what we'll  
9 call skin in the game. We take a look at the general  
10 contractor, and we do not select the general contractors.  
11 It's the developer that selects the general contractor.  
12 And we just vet the general contractor. That's all we  
13 do. We take a look at the architect. We take a look at  
14 the plans, the drawings, things of that nature. So when  
15 the application comes in, we have a committee. The  
16 committee gets together. We review the applications. We  
17 look for the deficiencies. We look for the strengths and  
18 the weaknesses. We then send letters out to all the  
19 applicants inviting them in for a presentation in front  
20 of the committee. The committee consists of folks from  
21 different city agencies and Housing. After that, the

1 committee gets together. We make a recommendation. We  
2 come up with recommendations on who the -- of the project  
3 should be. We then send -- our recommendation goes up  
4 through me. It goes to James, the Chief Operations  
5 Officer, who then meets with the Commissioner to get the  
6 Commissioner onboard. Then the Commissioner meets with  
7 the Mayor and other elected officials to say this is what  
8 we plan on doing.

9           Once those final decisions are made, we then  
10 issue what we call letters of support for developers to  
11 submit their packages to the State.

12           Now, as far as the Affordable Housing Program  
13 is concerned, we're going to need more staff to run this  
14 program. So right now, we've already advertised. We've  
15 gotten the approval for three positions already. Two  
16 positions we've already advertised for. One is for a  
17 project manager. The other is for a project director.  
18 Then I think the third position we want to hire we'll  
19 being in a fiscal person that will be able to track our  
20 expenses, put together year-end reports, reports to the  
21 Commission.

1           MR. GREENE: Then at some point, we will also  
2 need some compliance person to make sure that how we  
3 spent our money and the purpose for which we spent our  
4 money is being achieved. So whatever project we invest  
5 in, whether it's home ownership or rental product, we  
6 want to make sure that it's serving the population that  
7 has been targeted.

8           MR. MAJORS: So with the Home Program, those  
9 funds -- we'll utilize those funds for rehab, new  
10 construction. And specifically, for rental projects  
11 only. And that's because there was a change in the  
12 regulations with the Home Program, meaning, if you can't  
13 get the new installed home ownership -- the rental, and  
14 you can't put it back out. The good thing about the  
15 affordable housing, we're going to be able to do home  
16 ownership, we're going to be able to do rehab and new  
17 construction. I'm looking when I'm talking to the staff  
18 and Jay about minimum -- but it's still up for  
19 discussion. Other than that, then, basically, that's  
20 what we do.

21           PRESIDENT BOWERS: That's great. Appreciate

1 that.

2           Let me do an inflection point. We've got about  
3 15 minutes in this block of time, 16 minutes. So let me  
4 pause. Thank you both very much. And see if there are  
5 questions, comments, feedback from Members of the  
6 Commission, and start going in and out.

7           Anybody have questions or comments or --

8           Yep.

9           MR. HILL: I'll start off. So that was really  
10 helpful. Thank you. Appreciate it.

11           I think, so I spoke with a couple of colleagues  
12 up in the Philadelphia Housing Trust Fund, members of  
13 their equivalent of the Commission. And to have that  
14 kind of overview is really helpful. They mentioned that  
15 it was even more helpful to have -- kind of drill down on  
16 each of those a little bit more in terms of the number of  
17 units, the locations, income levels. How many projects  
18 get turned away? Lisa was talking about the unmet need.  
19 And so as a measure of sort of what's the need out there,  
20 how many are preservation versus new construction?  
21 What's the affordability terms? Those kinds of things

1 will help, I think, to give us a bigger picture of what's  
2 already going on so that we can understand how this money  
3 could fit into some of the different goals out there.

4 MR. GREENE: And I think that's a good idea.  
5 And we can also bring back to the Commission here other  
6 information. For example, in this year's round for nine  
7 percent funding from the State, the 12 -- 12 projects  
8 were submitted by -- from the City alone. And I think  
9 over 40 --

10 MR. MAJORS: Overall in this current tax credit  
11 round, the State received 44 applications State-wide. Of  
12 those 44 applications, I believe it was 14, yeah, 14 came  
13 from the City, and of those 14, 11 actually went through  
14 the NOFA process, and then we had 3, as I stated, went  
15 off reservation, came up directly to the State.

16 MR. GREENE: So but to put it in perspective  
17 for the last year, which was a good year for the City, we  
18 had four projects approved through the State. And it  
19 wasn't as many projects that had been applied for last  
20 year, but we had four out of a smaller number, which was  
21 a good year for us. So we'll see how many are approved

1 through the State process this year. And some of those  
2 projects may be very worthwhile projects that we would  
3 potentially consider funding them through our process.  
4 But just to give you a magnitude when we talk about need  
5 of what the need is. And so for the Commission and the  
6 public, the nine percent of tax credit round for the  
7 State is for families that need deeper subsidies. And so  
8 it's a larger amount of equity that the State provides  
9 for those projects.

10 MR. HILL: So that would be helpful. Now, are  
11 you still thinking about September for the next NOFA or  
12 has that changed?

13 MR. GREENE: Well, fall.

14 MR. HILL: Fall. Okay.

15 MR. GREENE: Fall. So we -- so that's  
16 September-ish maybe --

17 MR. HILL: Got it.

18 MR. GREENE: -- at the latest October.

19 MR. HILL: Got it.

20 MR. GREENE: Thank you, Matt.

21 MR. HILL: No, no, just asking. And then

1 following up on that, I guess, the bigger question is --  
2 I don't know if this is the place to raise it, but what's  
3 the process for the Commission to have some input, and to  
4 have a dialog about what the NOFA should look like for  
5 DHCD?

6           PRESIDENT BOWERS: And can I add, can I add  
7 onto that question, Jay, also? What would be the  
8 deadline for the Commission to be able to get input?  
9 Understanding that there's not a date certain yet for the  
10 NOFA to go out. So it's kind of flexible. But when  
11 should we be thinking about as Commission Members we  
12 really need to get input from us and from public to the  
13 Department by X date in order for it to realistically  
14 give some real influence and for consideration for what  
15 would be in the NOFA? If that helps.

16           MR. MAJORS: Mind if I respond? I think that  
17 that's a good question. We have given some consideration  
18 to that. We have had some preliminary discussions about  
19 it. We still need to tie up a few things on our end, but  
20 I think we could probably have some kind of answer for  
21 you maybe by the next meeting. Some type of timeframe or

1 exactly what the goal would be.

2 MR. GREENE: I think -- sure. We welcome the  
3 input. And some of the major input, who is it going to  
4 serve has been established by the Charter. Will be  
5 serving 50 percent and under. So that's one major  
6 factor. The other major factor that we're considering,  
7 and that we kind of threw out tonight was that we would  
8 open this up to projects that are as small as 10 units.  
9 And whether it should be 5 or 7, that's still -- we're --  
10 it's up for discussion, and we'll certainly listen to  
11 whatever input we have.

12 And so we're going to have further discussion  
13 about what we're trying to achieve with the NOFA. I  
14 think that's the major thing. I think the first one that  
15 we put out would probably be for new construction. Then  
16 we'd have to have another discussion if we've structured  
17 one for rehab and preservation. It's possible we can  
18 combine them. It's a little tricky to evaluate one  
19 against the other. So I think the first round would be  
20 primarily for new construction, and then we can talk  
21 about another round for just preservation. But we can

1 come back with some of the major -- once we put it  
2 together, and we have one for our home, and we'll print  
3 that, and make it available for the Commission Members to  
4 at least look at and comment on.

5 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Jay, is there a thought that  
6 there would be one or -- how many NOFAs you anticipate in  
7 each calendar year that might be provided?

8 MR. GREENE: Again, it's -- this is the first  
9 year.

10 PRESIDENT BOWERS: For each fiscal year. I'm  
11 sorry.

12 MR. GREENE: It's predicated on how the revenue  
13 stream happens, and how the market reacts, and what we  
14 perceive as need. And so it's a number of factors. We  
15 may put a NOFA out on the street, and so much need out  
16 there fore the new construction we'd have to make  
17 adjustments about when and how often we would want to put  
18 NOFAs out. But probably at least in my experience  
19 because it takes a lot to evaluate them, you probably  
20 wouldn't want to have more than two a year. If you start  
21 having more than two a year, from an administrative point

1 of view, that's a lot of work, lot of committees, lot of  
2 review time. So the question is -- and right now I think  
3 my thinking is that we would have probably two a year,  
4 and we just have to see what would go into the second  
5 NOFA and how we would structure it.

6           And then all of our programs, and this is  
7 something we will work on as we go along, all of the  
8 policy initiatives and the programs that has been  
9 mentioned may not lend themselves well to a NOFA process.  
10 Like the Rent Supplement Program. That's just going to  
11 be something that we come back -- the Department comes  
12 back, and say, here's our proposal for what we think this  
13 program should look like and who our partners should be.  
14 And that doesn't necessarily lend itself to a competitive  
15 process.

16           Now who is the administrator of that project  
17 may be a competitive process. Or but it's not that many  
18 entities that can actually do this very well. So that's  
19 another thing that we would have to talk about. But every  
20 policy initiative that the Commission -- that occurred  
21 from the Commission, all of them may not lend themselves

1 neatly to fit into these two NOFAs. And then so we'll be  
2 coming back with other ways to achieve our goals.

3 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Other questions?

4 Yes, ma'am.

5 MS. JOYNES: I just want to go back to the  
6 point that Matt made about, like, the process for  
7 participation, the Commission participation in the  
8 creation of the NOFA and, like, the criteria. September  
9 and October isn't really that far away. It's coming up  
10 quickly. So I just want to be clear. I feel we should  
11 have a active participation role in the creation of the  
12 NOFA and the criteria that are going to be used for  
13 applicants for the money. So I don't know, is there a  
14 way that we can actually start talking about this and  
15 participate in sooner than next meeting?

16 MR. VALERY: Can I add on to your question?

17 MS. JOYNES: Yes.

18 MR. VALERY: I just want to know exactly, I  
19 mean, like, when this was described, it goes from  
20 Mr. Majors' office to Mr. Greene's office to the  
21 Commissioner's office, and to the Mayor and the City

1 Council. So what's the role of the Commission?

2 MR. GREENE: It's policy. It's a policy  
3 guideline. So your point is a fair one, but -- and we  
4 can start working on that for something that the  
5 Commissioners can review. We haven't started that  
6 process. We're still trying to gear up from a staffing  
7 point of view. We do have examples of what we use for  
8 the home, but we're going to have to work on that. But  
9 we'll try to get something to at least -- an outline of  
10 what our thinking is as soon as possible.

11 MR. VALERY: Can I add another piece to that.

12 MR. GREENE: Sure.

13 MR. VALERY: That's fair. And so with this  
14 Commission, I mean, like we're forward facing. We're the  
15 ones that are in front of the public, hearing the public.  
16 Our meetings are open to the public. And so our  
17 questions, I think, are fair in terms of, like, having  
18 influence on that NOFA because we are the ones that are  
19 going to have to kind of respond to the public in a very  
20 direct way. And so it's a little bit tricky situation to  
21 be in as Commissioners where we hear the public. We

1 understand. We're also from the public as well. And  
2 then this entire NOFA process from what I'm seeing  
3 doesn't include us. And, like, our comments are sort of,  
4 like, reactive. It's sort of like here's a NOFA. And  
5 this is how things are being done, and it's really sort  
6 of -- I just encourage us to be a little more innovative  
7 than that. Because we can just do things the way we've  
8 done them for the last 32 years or we can be a little bit  
9 more creative and a little bit more open to some new  
10 ideas. And I would encourage us to consider that in the  
11 way we move forward.

12           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Appreciate that. Thank you  
13 Illetha and Ernst. Let me make a comment to the  
14 Commission and the public, and kind of a comment by way  
15 of reminder, and then a suggestion. I keep this -- I  
16 keep the Charter front and center in terms of what duties  
17 we have been empowered to have. It's to make  
18 recommendations, advise and consult. So I always tell  
19 folks, I said at the first meeting, and I'll say it at  
20 this meeting. I always like to be real clear about what  
21 powers, what cards I do or don't have in my hand. So as

1 a Commission, we are not empowered to make final  
2 decisions. We cannot tell the Department what to do.  
3 What we can do is make recommendations and advise, and it  
4 has the weight that really flows from community, from  
5 public and through and to the elected officials who  
6 created this thing. And so we should be clear about the  
7 powers that we do and don't have, and where those powers  
8 flow from. My sense from experience in another  
9 jurisdiction working on this is that this Commission is  
10 being taken seriously. I have been on a housing Trust  
11 Fund commission when it was not. So I know what that  
12 looks and feels like.

13           The other thing I would say by way of just  
14 recommendation to us, to those points is that we can  
15 start right now right here during this time of dialog.  
16 If there are recommendations that members, any of us have  
17 to the Commission on criteria, priorities that should be  
18 set we start -- people may remember at the first meeting  
19 one of the questions that was asked was what do you want  
20 to see? What do we want to see come out of this? That's  
21 informing the process. If any of us -- and I'm looking

1 at Dr. Sturtevant's slide deck, the process of awarding  
2 funds, funding criteria. If we want to recommend any of  
3 these or other things, we should do it -- we can start  
4 tonight on the record saying as a member of the  
5 Commission to members of the Department we suggest or  
6 recommend this. As a formal body, that -- and that  
7 carries the weight of a Commission Member. And then we  
8 can ask do we all agree? And that can go on the record  
9 as a recommendation even starting here tonight.

10 We can also go as far as doing things that  
11 could be in writing to the Department, right, where we  
12 have consultation and conversation here in public and at  
13 future meetings, any of the meetings we have, whether  
14 they're the regularly scheduled or other special meetings  
15 that we have they'll all be open to the public. Where we  
16 can then send recommendations in.

17 So Ernst, I appreciate what you said, and I  
18 want the public to know and us as Commission Members to  
19 know and as the President of the Commission to say it --  
20 the game is on. We don't have to wait. And there is a  
21 process of getting recommendations, and it can come in

1 various forms. So I don't want folks -- any of us to  
2 feel as though we got to wait to get input. Start now,  
3 and we will continue. And even on the next part of the  
4 agenda where we talk about future meetings structure  
5 where we can talk about what kind of input do we want to  
6 get from whom, about what, and how do we want to deliver  
7 that, so that we can get as creative as we can getting  
8 input from a range of different stakeholders on that.

9           We've got a couple more minutes in this block.  
10 Other questions, comments, suggestions that anyone has to  
11 our --

12           MR. GREENE: David, can --

13           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Yeah.

14           MR. GREENE: Mr. President, can I -- and I  
15 think you made a really good point. It doesn't -- you  
16 don't have to wait for us to bring you something, if you  
17 make suggestions about what you're -- from a policy  
18 standpoint things you may want to accomplish, and through  
19 the NOFA process, and that would be helpful.

20           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Right. Damien.

21           MR. HAUSSLING: Well, I just want to -- my --

1 I'm, like, I'm going to advocate for the hardest one, and  
2 that is very deeply affordable long-term affordable.  
3 That's going to be what I'm going to be erring in on. I  
4 know that's the hardest, but it's the only way to keep  
5 people from returning to homelessness or couch surfing.  
6 I'm going to be couch surfing very soon. But so it's not  
7 fun. So deeply affordable, permanently affordable.

8           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Deeply affordable and  
9 permanently affordable.

10           Does any -- and I'm going to try this as a  
11 process. Is there anyone on the Commission who objects  
12 to that just being stated into the record as a position  
13 of the Board -- of the Commission that it's a goal that  
14 we encourage the Department to try to work towards? Does  
15 anybody have an objection to that?

16           MR. HAUSSLING: To just to say, I mean, maybe  
17 that would be -- if we go by -- the doctor said earlier  
18 that there could be priorities. There could be -- I  
19 forget what she said. Set-asides or anything. But, I  
20 mean, a priority could be -- I vote for that's one of the  
21 priorities.

1           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Sure. And I'm just asking  
2 if anybody has an objection to -- mindful that these  
3 things are not binding, these are suggestions to the  
4 Department. But does anyone on the Commission object to  
5 a suggestion recommendation to the Department through --  
6 for the use of the funds to try to achieve the deepest  
7 income targeting maximum periods of affordability in  
8 terms of term, affordability as a general goal to work  
9 towards? Does anybody object to that on the Commission?

10           Okay. Well, let the minutes reflect that at  
11 this meeting tonight that was a recommendation made to  
12 the Department to seek as a goal deep income targeting  
13 and maximizing affordability terms.

14           Anybody else? Oh, Matt, I saw your hand. Did  
15 you have another comment or question before we move to  
16 the next part of the agenda?

17           MR. HILL: Well, Damien more or less made the  
18 same point I was going to make. I think that deep  
19 affordability is really important. I think that as  
20 Dr. Sturtevant was saying it's very difficult sometimes  
21 for these Trust Funds to reach deeply affordable. And I

1 think we need to focus on that, and to do it in a way  
2 that promotes some of the other goals that I think the  
3 Commission has, the Department has. And permanently  
4 affordable is very important too, and we've done -- I've  
5 done a little bit of research on that and, hopefully, can  
6 present on that at a future meeting. But other Trust  
7 Funds are moving to prioritize permanently affordable  
8 housing. And I think it's because from my own experience  
9 we see sometimes that when affordability restrictions  
10 expire, I'm thinking of the Chapel NDP project over on  
11 Fayette Street near Hopkins. Unless there's that kind of  
12 community-driven permanently affordable housing, those  
13 projects tend to just get demolished. And this City has  
14 a long history of demolition and urban renewal and  
15 displacement that falls the hardest on black  
16 neighborhoods. And so when we think about permanently  
17 affordable housing, it's a way to kind of interrupt that  
18 cycle, and make sure that it's a community-driven process  
19 that we're going to invest one time in housing and keep  
20 it affordable. So I want to echo the recommendation of  
21 the Commission.

1 MS. GUTHERIE: I would like to --

2 MS. KIMBALL: If we -- I'm sorry.

3 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Let me real quick. I saw  
4 Jay's hand, and then I'll go to Mr. Majors.

5 Go ahead, Jay.

6 MR. GREENE: No, I just, again the -- my  
7 understanding is that half of this fund is targeted to  
8 families at 30 percent or less of AMI. And so as the  
9 department managing, that's the goal of -- certainly the  
10 goal of managing the Fund is to meet the initial -- and  
11 it's a requirement of how we manage the portfolio that  
12 half of the Fund is going to be targeted for deeply  
13 affordable. So I think what the recommendation that was  
14 made is certainly consistent with how the Fund has  
15 already been decided from the beginning how it wants to  
16 be used.

17 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Mr. Majors -- I'm going to  
18 -- oh, hold on one -- Mr. Majors, Ms. Guthrie, and then  
19 we'll go to Ms. Kimball, and then we're going to  
20 transition to the next part of the agenda. Because this  
21 will tie in.

1           Yes, sir.

2           MR. MAJORS: I just want to make sure that I'm  
3 clear on this. So when we're talking about deeply  
4 affordable, we're talking about 30 percent?

5           MR. HAUSSLING: I'm actually talking about even  
6 someone at zero percent. I mean even somebody --

7           UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Exactly, exactly.

8           MR. HAUSSLING: 30 percent and away, yes, but I  
9 mean I understand -- but I'm talking about even zero  
10 percent.

11           PRESIDENT BOWERS: I think it would be safe to  
12 say that zero to 30 is going to be the -- is as deep as  
13 you're going to get.

14           Ms. Guthrie.

15           MS. GUTHERIE: Yes. And really to echo what  
16 Damien and Matt have just reiterated, we really need to  
17 -- and also the doctor indicated our approach, our  
18 process has to mirror or has to address what this  
19 particular municipality is dealing with. And we have --  
20 we need to also incorporate dealing with the racial  
21 inequities that the City has dealt with, what is being --

1 what you see on a daily basis as you walk the streets of  
2 Baltimore. The racial inequity is a demonstration or a  
3 result of -- is manifested in the homelessness that we  
4 see that's proliferating in our community, the  
5 displacement that has happened in our history, that  
6 continues to happen as we -- as community gentrify and  
7 push people out, people who have been there for  
8 generations. And to find themselves pushed out of  
9 communities, and then end up homeless. This is  
10 happening. It continues to happen. And we have to put a  
11 end to it. So the racial inequities have to be  
12 addressed.

13 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you, Ms. Guthrie.

14 Ms. Kimball.

15 MS. KIMBALL: What's very important to me is  
16 permanent affordability, permanent. I'm not saying that  
17 you can move into this unit for the next 10 years at this  
18 cost, this cheap, that's affordable, but within 15 years  
19 you have to make a certain amount of money to stay there,  
20 and if you can't afford that, you're going to have to  
21 move out. I would like to see permanent affordability of

1 Baltimore is very important. Because when you are  
2 homeless and you go into a housing program, they give you  
3 a certain amount of years to do -- to make a certain  
4 amount of money. If you don't make that money, that  
5 property goes back on the market as marketable -- as the  
6 market cost of that unit. I personally was involved in  
7 something like that, and it's not a good feeling when you  
8 are in affordable housing, and after a certain amount of  
9 time it becomes three and four times as much as you -- it  
10 was when you first moved in there. In Baltimore City, we  
11 do not get raises like that. So we -- and I was working  
12 for the City at the time. And the money wasn't there.  
13 So I had to make a decision. I had to move out of that  
14 apartment because I couldn't afford it. I had to move in  
15 a situation to do house sharing that I still do. Because  
16 it wasn't permanent affordability.

17 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you, Ms. Kimball.

18 It's a good transition for us. And thank you,  
19 Mr. Greene, Mr. Majors. Thank you for that input and  
20 feedback. And we know we will continue as we go along to  
21 look for input. We'll be in constant dialog as a

1 Commission with the Agency for sure. And we'll actually  
2 talk about information from the Agency as we go into our  
3 discussion a little bit later at our next meeting.

4           But speaking of future meetings, we want to  
5 talk some about -- as a Commission about what do we want  
6 to accomplish in these meetings? What kind of input do  
7 we want to get? So this notion of where, from whom, how  
8 is it structured. And what I mean by terms like how it's  
9 structured, a lot of times you have official kind of  
10 government bodies, and they'll get input. Somebody comes  
11 and does a three-minute testimony, then they're out.  
12 And it's hard to get real kind of constructive input and  
13 dialog sometimes in that kind of setting.

14           So wanted to have -- open the floor here for a  
15 little discussion on what are some -- what is some of the  
16 kind of information that we want to get, and are there  
17 folks we want to bring in to be a part of these  
18 conversations? And that includes also where and whom.

19           Ms. Guthrie, I saw your hand first.

20           MS. GUTHERIE: Yes.

21           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Yes, ma'am.

1 MS. GUTHERIE: I personally would like to have  
2 someone come and speak in-depth about community land  
3 trusts, and how community land trusts can serve as a way  
4 to not only address the affordable housing issue, but  
5 also address, like I mentioned, addressing the racial  
6 inequities. So it's a manner of building community,  
7 keeping the ownership of the land in the community --  
8 within the community, but also affording families and  
9 individuals to build equity. So it's not so much driven  
10 by personal profitability, but building and developing  
11 communities, and how community land trusts have  
12 flourished in other areas of the country. We're in a  
13 time right now where -- and I've never heard so many  
14 people on the political stage talk about reparations.  
15 That is a -- Baltimore could be an innovator in dealing  
16 -- addressing reparations using community land trusts as  
17 a way to return the property to the people. I would like  
18 to hear some come and talk about land trusts in a very  
19 deep way.

20 PRESIDENT BOWERS: All right, thank you,  
21 Ms. Gutherie.

1           And let me just say to the -- into the record  
2 so that folks will know again referring to the handy-  
3 dandy Baltimore City Charter and the Fund established the  
4 scope. Number three talks about providing capital and  
5 operating assistance for the creation of community land  
6 trusts that will develop, own, and operate permanently  
7 affordable rental housing and assist low income  
8 residents, and build a path to home ownership. So folks  
9 should know, and I want the record to reflect, that in  
10 the Charter that established all of this that land trusts  
11 are explicitly called out. So thank you for that.

12           Other thoughts, ideas, suggestions. Let me  
13 speak as a Member of the Commission, I encourage us to  
14 hear from a few different categories of folks,  
15 developers, for profits and non-profits. Inspector  
16 General -- I in particular have in mind the IG down in  
17 Washington, DC, who has done several audits over time of  
18 the Trust Fund in DC. Other folks from actual other  
19 housing departments in other jurisdictions, who have run  
20 Trust Funds to hear directly from the. Financial  
21 institutions that fund these developments, as well as the

1 foundation, philanthropic community. So that as we think  
2 about leveraging these dollars, it would be good to hear  
3 from the folks who do the deals, developers, and the  
4 folks who have to finance the deals on the private side,  
5 and because we're talking about particularly having the  
6 goals of permanent affordability, long-term  
7 affordability, and deep income targeting, that hearing  
8 from other money. It's going to take money to make that  
9 happen, and to get it at a scale -- a level of scale in  
10 this City is going to require two things. More money  
11 from the public, the government, and private dollars.

12           So, Ernst, you were reporting earlier about we  
13 have to get creative if we're going to really get long-  
14 term affordability and deep income targeting at any level  
15 of scale. When I say level of scale, what I mean is so  
16 that a lot of households benefit we're going to do that.  
17 So that would be -- those are my suggestions.

18           Other thoughts on -- that folks have in this  
19 part of the agenda, who we ought to be trying to hear  
20 from, and topics we ought to be trying to focus on.

21           MR. VALERY: Can we --

1 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Yes, sir.

2 MR. VALERY: Can we get a copy of, like, a  
3 draft of the NOFA so that we can make recommendations and  
4 consult?

5 MR. GREENE: Well, we have one we'll share with  
6 the Commissioners.

7 MR. VALERY: Right. Because it's going out in  
8 September?

9 MR. MAJORS: Sometime in the fall.

10 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Yeah. And I want us to be  
11 clear. I know it was mentioned at our first meeting the  
12 notion of September as a target date. We're hearing  
13 today is the target is fall. What I'm hearing is that  
14 there is not a NOFA that's been created. And so this --  
15 we have this opportunity to, like I said, continue to  
16 give input. Appreciate the offer. So that once a NOFA  
17 is developed, whenever that's developed, that we will get  
18 a copy of it, a working draft. We should get on the  
19 gitty-up to get as much input as we can to the  
20 Department.

21 MR. GREENE: Yeah. We're open to suggestions,

1 policy standpoints.

2 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Other ideas on locations,  
3 stakeholders to hear from, constituencies to hear from?

4 Yes, Matt.

5 MR. HILL: So just on the constituencies, the  
6 topics, I guess, that you were listing, David, additional  
7 ought to be race equity in affordable housing. I think  
8 Tisha spoke eloquently to that. And I know Stephanie  
9 Smith from Planning has produced a report about how to  
10 analyze race equity in capital decisions. And that could  
11 be really useful, I think, for us in this context.  
12 Because this Trust Fund along with the rest of the DHCD  
13 is mandated to do so by council president's recently  
14 enacted legislation. And then, let's see, in terms of  
15 the needs of folks who are homeless or just coming out of  
16 homelessness, I think it would be really important to  
17 understand a little bit more about what the Mayor's  
18 Office of Human Services funds and does on that level.  
19 So that would be helpful.

20 In terms of locations, I mean, I'd love to hear  
21 a little bit more because I know there's been some back

1 and forth about where we could hold these. And I'd  
2 really, again, like to raise the issue of trying to go  
3 out in the community. And I don't know if that's the  
4 right time to bring that up, but I think we should come  
5 back to that, and have that discussion.

6 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Sure. And I know the City  
7 -- Stacy, is there any update we have on that from the  
8 city in terms of what the frameworks may be there or --

9 MS. FREED: Since it's a public meeting. We  
10 can hold it in the State. Our department is really  
11 encouraging that these meetings be held in public  
12 buildings for a number of reasons. One, we have to meet  
13 ADA requirements and city buildings are more likely to do  
14 that. Two, use the private facility there are questions  
15 -- that there are fees associated with rent, security,  
16 cleanup, other types of things. The Law Department is  
17 working on an opinion for us. They are just getting back  
18 up online.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

20 MS. FREED: I say. They're just getting back  
21 up online. And the attorney who we work with has been

1 out for a couple of days to a family illness, but she is  
2 working on it.

3           PRESIDENT BOWERS: So I think to that point  
4 what we might suggest -- it sounds like we're being  
5 encouraged, but so far we haven't been told we have to,  
6 but are being encouraged to think of public locations.  
7 So what I might ask Members of the Commission is that if  
8 folks can start to think of recommendations on various  
9 places around the city that we could hold meetings, would  
10 ask that if you can think of public buildings that might  
11 make it a little easier for us, public buildings around  
12 the city. And then we can work in consult with the city  
13 staff to see if those places would be available. That  
14 might be the easiest way. But certainly would ask folks  
15 to come with recommendations. If people have  
16 recommendations, you can certainly bring them to our next  
17 meeting, and we can have consideration to see if there is  
18 any objection that folks may have to whatever locations  
19 as a body. I want to make sure that we can put locations  
20 on the table for us as a body to consider around the city  
21 to make sure everyone is good on whatever the

1 recommendations are for those.

2 Yes, ma'am.

3 MS. JOYNES: Well, I just want to put the one  
4 location on the table already that I looked into. The  
5 Curtis Bay Rec Center. They had had previous Commission  
6 meetings there. So that's --

7 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Great.

8 MS. JOYNES: -- a possible place that we can  
9 meet.

10 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Curtis Bay Rec Center --  
11 thank you.

12 Any other thoughts, ideas on locations  
13 stakeholders, constituencies on this?

14 MS. WATKINS: I was thinking maybe --

15 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Yes, ma'am.

16 MS. WATKINS: -- public libraries.

17 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Public libraries. Okay.

18 I'm going to ask before we go into the public  
19 comment piece -- or actually, no, it's in the other  
20 business. So we're good. So this is the point in the  
21 meeting where we will pause, and see if there are any

1 comments from the public. We've got a 10-minute block  
2 here for any comments from the public open. For people  
3 who may not have been at the first meeting, just by way  
4 of reminder, that the City laws don't require a body like  
5 this to have public comment. The Commission made the  
6 decision that we wanted to build into every meeting a  
7 period of time for public comment. And, again, the  
8 conversation we just had, we want to think also about  
9 ways in addition to these brief times where people have a  
10 couple of minutes to say brief comments, to also find  
11 opportunities to engage where folks from various  
12 constituencies in the public can have an opportunity to  
13 have longer dialog and be a part of longer dialog and  
14 input. So if there any comments, if folks wouldn't mind,  
15 if you are able to stand or at a minimum project your  
16 voice, let us know who you are, and any comment you may  
17 have. So the floor is open.

18 MR. HILL: Dave, before we lose the thread on  
19 location real quick, David, I'm -- could I move that we  
20 -- I will look into whether or not the Curtis Bay Rec  
21 Center is open, and I move that if it is, that we hold

1 the next Commission meeting at that location.

2 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Make the move. Is there --  
3 if that --

4 MR. HAUSSLING: Second.

5 PRESIDENT BOWERS: -- Curtis Bay, is there a  
6 second on that?

7 MR. HAUSSLING: Second.

8 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Damien seconds that. Any  
9 discussion? So one point of discussion I would say so  
10 the move here is if we'll check to see if the Curtis Bay  
11 Recreation Center would be available for the next meeting  
12 time. If so, the next meeting would be there. Is there  
13 any objection to that? It's been moved, properly second.  
14 Vote all in favor aye.

15 MEMBERS: Aye.

16 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Any opposed?

17 Okay. And we'll make the provision, obviously,  
18 if it's not available, we'll be back here. But, great.  
19 Thank you on that.

20 Any comments from the public?

21 I see one, and then the hand in the back. Yes,

1 sir. Yes, sir.

2 MR. ASKEW: Okay. I have a series of  
3 questions. Mr. Bowers, you here today stated, and I  
4 believe the elephant in the room is the City's  
5 proliferation of vacant and abandoned housing. So my  
6 question is would the -- is it the Commission's, one of  
7 the Commission's goals to actually ask DHC what they  
8 intend to do in order to make those properties easier to  
9 acquire? Because acquisition and site control is a very  
10 difficult part of the process. So if we're encouraging  
11 smaller developers to actually -- community developers to  
12 actually build in their communities, then it doesn't  
13 really make sense that we have -- which should be use to  
14 now allow properties to sit there vacant, but it's not  
15 going to be used that way. And those bad developers or  
16 bad owners have the ability to hold the process up when  
17 we're trying -- if the purpose of the Commission is to  
18 make this money go as far as they can, then how is the  
19 Commission going to address that issue is my first  
20 question.

21 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Sure. So I'll just say, and

1 I don't know if the Departments wants to speak to this.  
2 One of the mandates is around production of new housing.  
3 So it is on the table. We heard even during the  
4 presentation from the Department and today around -- Jay  
5 made reference, Mr. Greene made reference to vacants. So  
6 it is one of the kind of resources that's out there.  
7 It's appropriate. We know the City's vacancy value. So  
8 I would assume that part of the ongoing dialog with the  
9 Department about the different programs they have and  
10 where they're putting monies, that will be part of the  
11 ongoing conversation how these funds may connect with  
12 either parallel or in conjunction with dollars that are  
13 going for those pieces. And for the development  
14 community, if they are looking to that stock as stock  
15 that they can use to further housing affordability for  
16 folks below 50 and below 30 percent of AMI per the  
17 charter, that's absolutely something we'll want to hear  
18 in part of those community dialogues.

19 And you had a second question?

20 MR. ASKEW: Yes.

21 PRESIDENT BOWERS: We'll let you go to your

1 second one, and then we have the young lady behind you.  
2 Go ahead.

3 MR. ASKEW: Okay. Area Median Income has been  
4 going around quite a bit. I have a two-part question on  
5 that. One, how is Baltimore City's Area Median Income  
6 determined? And how -- the federal government determines  
7 what affordable -- what is supposed to be affordable as  
8 to various income? Is the AMI for Baltimore City  
9 actually reflective of Baltimore City as it actually is?  
10 Because to expect people to be able to live in these  
11 properties then we have to know who they actually are,  
12 not what they think they are, if it's not --

13 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Sure.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Well, I mean --

15 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Anybody from the City want  
16 to take a stab at what the AMI is, and how it's  
17 determined for Baltimore?

18 MR. MAJORS: So --

19 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you, Mr. Majors.

20 MR. MAJORS: Income for Baltimore City, AMI for  
21 Baltimore City, it's what they call MSA, Metropolitan

1 Statistical Area. And Baltimore, that includes in our  
2 region Baltimore, Columbia and Towson. So for  
3 individuals whose income is at 30 percent or less of AMI,  
4 they cannot make more than \$21,250 per year. That's at  
5 the 30 percent.

6 MR. ASKEW: Okay.

7 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Let me hold that thought  
8 real quick. Let me make sure I get the young lady behind  
9 you, and the -- and I will say just as a follow-up to  
10 that, that is a constant concern that folks have in  
11 cities around the country.

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

13 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Is that often times the AMI  
14 for a region is just that for a region, and often times  
15 the income of folks in a city proper is less than the  
16 incomes in the suburbs. So that is a constant challenge  
17 that is definitely not unique to Baltimore, but is a  
18 challenge.

19 Let me get to the young lady behind. Yes,  
20 ma'am.

21 MS. FLOWERS: Good evening everyone. We

1 actually asked one of the questions. My name is  
2 Christina Flowers. I'm actually a housing provider for  
3 Baltimore City. I currently operate a nonprofit  
4 organization -- and I liked hearing Ms. Tisa, she made  
5 the statement about having the opportunity of funding  
6 different type of programs, because all programs may not  
7 fit into the cracker jack box, and that's just not any  
8 term that I use. I realize how -- all the streets is a  
9 -- it's a specialty when it comes to -- population. Some  
10 may not ever be ready for -- but it's good to know that  
11 we can help create developments and ideas. And  
12 everything is in the room. I mean, when you think of  
13 some of the entities in the room, we're not just building  
14 for housing, it's just a matter of collaborating and  
15 bringing in the resources that's needed. So I do look  
16 forward to being a participant.

17           Also, I'm on the Executive Board at WACP  
18 (Phonetic sp.), which I take a very, very good interest  
19 in about the events for -- it's really important to me,  
20 because there are so many different agencies and entities  
21 that speak about homelessness, but then, like the --

1 said, we increasing homelessness in Baltimore City. So  
2 it should be prioritized affordable housing. And like  
3 Damien said, some people outside don't have no income,  
4 but they are waiting independently. So just to have a  
5 open fund set up for different type of housing that can  
6 be done, and to note that it is doable, and then I think  
7 that you guys need to be a good -- to ending  
8 homelessness. Thank you very much.

9           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you, Minister.  
10 Appreciate you.

11           PRESIDENT BOWERS: We've got a couple more  
12 minutes. I see a hand here. Yes, ma'am.

13           MS. DESTEFANO: Yeah. Hi. My name is  
14 Amanda DeStefano. I'm a coordinating member of the Fair  
15 Housing Roundtable, formerly the Baltimore Housing  
16 Roundtable. I've been working on this Affordable Housing  
17 Trust Fund for about the last four years. I'm very  
18 excited that we're all meeting at this point. We're  
19 sitting in this room together. We're talking about  
20 permanent affordability.

21           Every single -- researching the Montgomery

1 County's MPDU program, that's Moderately Priced  
2 Development Unit Program. It was started in 1976. They  
3 did a 30-year review a couple years ago back in 2016.  
4 And what they found is that of the 11,000 units that they  
5 created over that time period, they lost 82 percent of  
6 them due to affordability periods lapsing. And so I  
7 would just really, really praise the folks on the  
8 Commission who are recognized, and this is a very serious  
9 challenge, and that permanent affordability is something  
10 that needs to be addressed.

11           Montgomery County passed legislation in 2005  
12 that expanded the affordability requirements of all  
13 rental units created for that program to 99 years -- and  
14 so I would just really urge you all to look at what's  
15 happened around the state and around the country, and to  
16 learn from that. Thank you.

17           PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you. Thank you very  
18 much. Appreciate it.

19           We've got about a minute and a half left in  
20 this section. Any other comments from the public?

21           Yes, ma'am.

1 MS. ILYAS: Yes. My name is Sakina Ilyas. I  
2 work -- Community Project. Our house we live in,  
3 affordable housing, under the -- they try to push you  
4 out, they harass us. People lives in the shelters. They  
5 refuse to go into those types of programs because of the  
6 harassment. They treat the women like they're in prison.  
7 We don't feel like that's our home. They constantly  
8 harassing.

9 You going to find a lot of women that's  
10 homeless who's not -- a few that are on the street before  
11 they go into a home where they're paying rent. They're  
12 not able to rest. Not able to feel like they're at home.  
13 They got to walk on eggshells. They need -- these homes  
14 need a oversight. They need someone who can look into  
15 how these houses are run. That's my question.

16 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you, ma'am. Thank  
17 you. I know that the Agency staff is here, and is  
18 listening to that for sure.

19 I think that will be our last comment, public  
20 comment. I want to thank folks from the public for that.

21 Other business. Last item on the agenda.

1 There are a couple of things here printed and not  
2 printed. One, Stacy, I'm going to ask, is there -- the  
3 ethics training and financial reporting, an update that  
4 you may have for the Commission on that, anything?

5 MS. FREED: So we sent around the information  
6 for this meeting. We sent a link to the financial  
7 disclosure report. It works. They're back online. We  
8 need all of the Commission Members to fill that out, and  
9 submit it. They are waiving -- we have an e-mail from  
10 the City -- they are waiving any late fees. Members have  
11 the option of submitting a hard copy, and they'll waive  
12 the fees for that. Keep in mind if you submit a hard  
13 copy, you need to have it notarized.

14 Ethics training. The Ethics Department is  
15 willing to come and do a training. It has to be here.  
16 And the latest that they can do it is at four o'clock,  
17 and it's a two-hour -- it's a full two-hour training.  
18 The other option is they offer training a couple of times  
19 a year. It is during the day. Typically, it's between  
20 11 and 2. And folks can just make arrangements and  
21 register the next time that their department -- general

1 trainings.

2 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Thank you, Stacy.

3 For the ethics training, we wanted to see if  
4 there was a general will of the body. Do folks prefer to  
5 do group training 4 to 6 or folks want to do a kind of on  
6 their honor finding time that works for you individually  
7 to go to the ethics training? It's a critical piece that  
8 needs to be done. So if there's anybody or any kind of  
9 preferences one way or the other do it as a group, and  
10 I'll say we can do it as a group 4 to 6, and then have  
11 our normal body meeting after. So it's a four-hour  
12 block. Or we could look for a time 4 to 6 for us as a  
13 group not on our regular meeting day, again, or folks can  
14 do it individually. Anybody have strong feeling?

15 Yes, ma'am.

16 MS. WATKINS: How often --

17 MS. FREED: They just finished. It's usually  
18 once or twice a year.

19 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Once or twice a year if we  
20 wanted to do it individually?

21 MS. FREED: Correct.

1 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Okay.

2 MS. FREED: They offered -- they just finished  
3 offering I think in the spring. Sometimes they offer a  
4 full round; sometimes it's just once a year.

5 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Okay. Matt.

6 MR. HILL: Tiara, is your question you only  
7 have to be trained once, is that right? You only have to  
8 go --

9 MS. FREED: Yeah. You only have to go once.

10 MR. HILL: Once. Yeah. Okay. I prefer group  
11 training personally.

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Me too.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I like the group idea.

14 MR. HAUSSLING: I think I like the group idea,  
15 and I also think, well, no, just changed my mind. I was  
16 about to say that have it separate from the general  
17 meeting, but let's actually see if we can try to do it at  
18 the same time that we have one of our meetings.

19 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Yeah. I'm glad you brought  
20 that up, made that point, Damien. That was the second  
21 question. So it seems like there's a general sense of a

1 group training. Is there a general sense do it on the  
2 same day so we're here for a four-hour block or do it on  
3 a separate day.

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's a long time.

5 MS. GUTHRIE: Four hours is a long time.

6 MS. KIMBALL: You don't want to see us for four  
7 hours?

8 MS. GUTHERIE: No. It's not that. It's  
9 setting for four hours.

10 PRESIDENT BOWERS: You hurt feelings --

11 MS. GUTHERIE: I'm sorry. I've got to be  
12 honest. I got to be honest about it. Two hours for the  
13 training, and then another --

14 PRESIDENT BOWERS: So we'll try to -- it seems  
15 like there's a little split. We'll see if we can  
16 identify. We may go in and do the -- about a separate, a  
17 day separate from when we have our morning meeting.

18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I know how those go.

19 PRESIDENT BOWERS: Speaking of -- the one other  
20 thing I was going to request, so for in terms of the next  
21 meeting, a recommendation and then a request to the body.

1 For our next meeting, I'm going to suggest that we look  
2 at having some input from folks who can talk about land  
3 trusts and -- that we have folks who can talk about land  
4 trusts and also some conversation with at a minimum  
5 developers, potentially developers and financiers.  
6 Because if we want to get into this notion of getting  
7 more input to the Department as it considers things in  
8 the NOFA, I think having a robust conversation around  
9 what are the realities that it takes to make that kind of  
10 thing happen? And so having, I think, folks from the  
11 development community, certainly the land trust is a  
12 discrete thing, the financing community, public and  
13 private, right, public and private, to really be in  
14 dialog with us in a chunk of time at our next meeting.  
15 Making that the meat of the meeting might inform the  
16 thinking that we have as a body around what we may want  
17 to recommend beyond what's already been recommended to  
18 the Agency. So I wanted to see if anybody has any  
19 objection to that or any addition to that for our next  
20 meeting, with a note that I think at the meeting after  
21 that -- one of the meetings not too long after that, that

1 I would encourage us to bring in someone who works --  
2 other folks from agencies that are running programs as  
3 well as the IG. It's very, very important for me, and I  
4 said this at the first meeting, that we as a Commission  
5 can give guidance, recommendation, suggestions to the  
6 Department as it relates to the things related to  
7 compliance. How to actually make the thing run. And we  
8 heard that, I think, from Dr. Sturtevant. We heard the  
9 Department tonight talking about they're trying to staff  
10 up, but really hearing from folks about what are some of  
11 the pitfalls that people, agencies run into when the  
12 compliance doesn't happen; i.e., money doesn't move,  
13 money is not tracked or money moves and doesn't meet the  
14 income targeting that's required by law, and what are the  
15 things that folks can do to try to -- agencies can do to  
16 make sure that happens. So just thinking about the next  
17 couple meetings, wanted to make those suggestions.

18 Does anybody object to us at the next meeting  
19 having -- trying to get in folks who can talk about the  
20 land trust component and the developer, financier piece?

21 Okay. Then the last thing is I wanted to ask

1 if I can get two or three volunteers, and I'm hoping we  
2 can get kind of a range, a developer, someone who is a  
3 end beneficiary at a minimum, and someone from maybe one  
4 of the other categories on the Board who would be willing  
5 to do a follow-up meeting. We will schedule something  
6 shortly on a regular basis within a week after each  
7 monthly meeting for us to have a conversation that will  
8 include also Agency staff to plan out the agenda for the  
9 following meeting. So I certainly don't want to do that  
10 in a vacuum. Did it out of necessary, and I appreciate  
11 the Agency working with me on that. But as we get into a  
12 regular rhythm, I'd like to have two or three folks who  
13 are willing to hop on a call within a few days after each  
14 meeting for us to kind of digest what was heard, and then  
15 start to really think through and plan out what the  
16 agenda is in some level of detail. When we leave  
17 meetings, we'll have a general sense of where we're  
18 going, but to, like, think of who is the guest or who do  
19 we call or that kind of thing. So any volunteers on that  
20 piece?

21 Ernst, thank you. From the developer side. Is

1 there -- Ms. Kimball. So Ernst, Ms. Kimball -- did I --  
2 and Matt. Is that okay?

3 Okay. Illetha, did you ant to jump in on that  
4 or no?

5 Okay. So I have Ernst, Ms. Kimball, Matt and  
6 Ms. Joynes. All right, thank you.

7 I believe that is it for tonight. It is  
8 7:55 p.m., and this meeting is officially adjourned. You  
9 all have a blessed night.

10 (Whereupon, the meeting closed at 7:55 p.m., on  
11 June 18, 2019.)

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21

C E R T I F I C A T E

This is to certify that the foregoing transcript in the matter of:

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMISSION

BEFORE: David Bowers

DATE: June 18, 2019

PLACE: Baltimore, Maryland

Represents the full and complete proceedings of the aforementioned matter as reported and reduced to typewriting by Free State Reporting, Inc.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Tom Bowman, Reporter  
Free State Reporting, Inc.