

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

BALTIMORE CITY DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMISSION MEETING

Virtual via Webex
Tuesday, April 23, 2024

BEFORE: KEVIN DANIELS, President

MEMBERS PRESENT:

- CATHERINE STOKES
- BREE JONES
- AMY MCCLAIN
- RAMSEY HARRIS
- MATT HILL
- KATE EDWARDS
- TISHA GUTHRIE
- STACI GRIFFIN

Proceeding recorded by electronic sound recording;
transcript produced by Free State Reporting, Inc.

1 Also Present:

2 STEPHANI ESTRADA, Program Manager, Affordable Housing
Trust Fund, DHCD

3 EBONY RECTOR EBONY RECTOR, Project Coordinator,
4 Affordable Housing Trust Fund, DHCD

5 KRYSTLE WARD, Project Coordinator
DHCD

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

1	<u>INDEX</u>	
2		<u>Page</u>
3	Meeting Called to Order	5
4	Roll Call	4
5	February Meeting Summary	6
6	DHCD Updates	7
7	Commission Q&A Dialogue	11
8	Public Comment	36
9	Other Business	45
10	Adjournment	48
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		

P R O C E E D I N G S

(6:06 p.m.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

PRESIDENT DANIELS: Good evening everybody.
This is the Affordable Housing Trust Fund Commission
meeting for April 23, 2024. We want to call the meeting
to order with the roll call.

PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Catherine
Stokes.

Commissioner Ramsey Harris.

Commissioner Kate Edwards.

COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Present.

PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Iletha Joynes.

Commissioner Vernadine Kimball.

Commissioner Stacy Griffin.

Commissioner Erika Fox.

Commissioner Matt Hill.

COMMISSIONER HILL: Present.

PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Amy McClain.

Commissioner Tisha Guthrie.

And Commissioner Bree Jones.

COMMISSIONER JONES: Present.

1 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Thank you.

2 The meeting is called to order.

3 We want to just vote on the December meeting
4 summary. Any questions concerning the December meeting
5 summary? And if so we can get a motion to accept it.

6 COMMISSIONER HILL: Kevin, you're referring to
7 the February meeting summary, right?

8 PRESIDENT DANIELS: I have the -- okay. Is it
9 the February? I see on the agenda it's the December.

10 MS. ESTRADA: Oh, that, that shouldn't be
11 right. It should be February.

12 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Oh, okay, good, good. Yes.
13 It's the February meeting summary. Can we get a motion?

14 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Amy.

15 PRESIDENT DANIELS: I believe moved. And can
16 we get a second?

17 COMMISSIONER HILL: Second.

18 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Properly moved and second.
19 All in favor.

20 MEMBERS: Aye, aye, aye.

21 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Any opposed?

1 Any abstentions?

2 The motion carries.

3 We're going to have some DHCD updates.

4 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: It sounds like there was
5 an abstention.

6 PRESIDENT DANIELS: There was?

7 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yes. Tisha Guthrie
8 (indiscernible).

9 COMMISSIONER HILL: Oh, I apologize. I have to
10 abstain too. I'm just now remembering that I was not at
11 this meeting either.

12 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. So we do, so we do
13 have two abstentions from the February, the February
14 meeting, 2024. That's Matt Hill, Commissioner Matt Hill,
15 and Commissioner Tisha Guthrie.

16 Okay, can we get the DHCD updates?

17 MS. ESTRADA: Trying to get those.
18 (indiscernible) not going to share my screen. It's not
19 allowing me to (indiscernible). All right. Here we go.
20 Okay. Let me know if you can see it. Can you all see?

21 PRESIDENT DANIELS: I can.

1 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yes.

2 MS. ESTRADA: Perfect, perfect, perfect. All
3 right. Hi everybody. My name is Stephanie Estrada, and
4 I am the program manager for Affordable Housing Trust
5 Fund. Today is the revenue update for -- good through
6 March of 2024. So in the presentation we'll do Trust
7 Fund revenue that was collected for February and March,
8 the commitments and expenditures, and some of the Trust
9 Fund activities.

10 As of to date, February 2024, we received
11 \$853,605. March 2024 revenue is \$913,439. The revenue
12 collected to date for FY '24 is \$12,356,705. That gives
13 us a total of \$80,692,805 collected since inception.

14 The revenue contribution type by year for FY
15 '24 is the 7 million City contribution. This has also
16 not been confirmed still. We are still waiting for our
17 Fiscal Department to give us the update on this. We
18 still have not got it. So as of now, we're still going
19 to state it as 7 million.

20 The tax revenue collected to date is 5.3
21 million. That gives us a total of 12.3 million.

1 The revenue, tax revenue collected to date
2 since inception is \$55,442,800, and the City's
3 contribution is \$25,250,000.

4 And the commitments and expenditures that are
5 good through March '24, the CLT has expended 2.1 million.
6 The rental projects have expended 1.5 million. Senior
7 homeownership has expended 6.1 million. Choice
8 neighborhoods 1.5. Rent supplement 1.7. The
9 inclusionary housing 100,000. The Flex Fund has not
10 spent or drawn down. The Pandemic Homelessness has spent
11 all of its funds that was transferred which was 2.7. The
12 administrative cost to date is 2.7 million as well.

13 These are the projects awarded thus far; 49
14 projects. 35 are in the middle of term negotiations. 28
15 point grant agreements have been drafted. Audits
16 reviewed 21. Audits approved 20. BOE requested 20. BOE
17 approved 19. Disbursements 10 and compliance 3.

18 NOFA information New Construction, Preservation
19 of Existing Rental Housing NOFAs Round 1, 2, 3 and 4 are
20 in the middle of deal structuring and preparing for
21 settlement. Round 5 the NOFA opened February 2, 2024.

1 The deadline for the submission was March 19, 2024. DHCD
2 made up to 7 million available. One million of that
3 money was set aside for Community Land Trust rental
4 projects. We received 27 applications. 22 of the 27
5 passed threshold, and were forwarded for review. The
6 total amount requested is 19,865,000. We hope to make
7 award announcements the week of May the 22nd.

8 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Stephani, I' sorry. Can
9 I interrupt?

10 Catherine is trying to connect in to the call.
11 (indiscernible) using are not working. I don't know if
12 you have --

13 MS. ESTRADA: Okay. Krystle or Ebony can you
14 reach out to Catherine, please?

15 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Thank you.

16 MS. ESTRADA: Okay. Huh?

17 MS. WARD: Yes. This is Krystle. Yes, I can.

18 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Okay. Thank you.

19 MS. ESTRADA: Community Land Trust, Single-
20 Family Homeownership NOFA Round 1, 2 and 3 are in the
21 middle of deal structuring. The Community Land Trust

1 Rental NOFA is -- that was Round 1. That's in the middle
2 of deal structuring. Operating NOFA Round 1, all
3 agreements have been approved by the BOE. Operating NOFA
4 Round 2, the grant agreements have been drafted, and are
5 being submitted for BOE.

6 And the Community Land Trust Single-Family
7 Homeownership NOFA Round 4, rolling NOFA opened on
8 June 30th. DHCD made up to 4 million available.
9 Community Land Trust projects can request up to
10 one million. The NOFA will run until June 30, 2024, or
11 until the funds run out. If there are funds left, it
12 will roll over to the next fiscal year. Two applications
13 have been submitted. And SHARE Baltimore is continuing
14 to work with CLTs to help with their submissions.

15 Long-Term Voucher Program. DHCD posted the RFP
16 to request a consultant for a Long-Term Voucher Program
17 on April the 1st. The link was sent to all the
18 Commissioners. We had the pre-proposal conference on
19 April the 5th. And the deadline to submit proposals to
20 the RFP is April the 29th.

21 The Affordable Housing Trust Fund Commission

1 Bylaws. The first draft has been sent to all the
2 Commissioners for their review. We had our first
3 Commission workgroup meeting to discuss the Bylaws.
4 Commissioner Guthrie suggested that we discuss another
5 governing rules for the Commission other than the Robert
6 Rules of Order, and we decided that we would bring that
7 issue here today to Commission meeting.

8 For Inclusionary Housing I still have the same
9 update. If there's any Commissioners that want to give
10 additional updates, please do. That's all I know thus
11 far.

12 And for Commissioner nominations updates, the
13 Commission is still working with MOHS to identify a
14 representative from the Continuum of Care. And this is
15 the same update. So I don't have any recent updates on
16 this.

17 And we can take questions now from the
18 Commissioners.

19 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Early on in the PowerPoint
20 you mentioned something about -- you talked about
21 something in the red in the PowerPoint the -- I'm trying

1 to go back and see --

2 MS. ESTRADA: Want me to go back to the --

3 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Yeah, that first, that
4 first slide. I'm sorry. I wanted to -- you mentioned
5 something -- right there. You mentioned something about
6 the 26 million being that we were -- you said something
7 about a shortfall? Is that what I heard you say?

8 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. The 7 million contribution
9 that's the City's contribution that they give us, it
10 normally takes them some time to confirm the exact amount
11 that the City is able to contribute for the year, but
12 normally we have it by now. But I still do not have an
13 update on it. I was told probably last week that I
14 should be getting it shortly but --

15 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay.

16 MS. ESTRADA: -- I still have not got a
17 confirmation. So once I do then I'll let you all know.

18 COMMISSIONER HARRIS: Okay, yeah. That was my
19 question.

20 But anybody have anything else Commissioners?

21 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yes. This is

1 Commissioner Guthrie. With regards to the City's
2 contribution (indiscernible) taxpayer's night, and from
3 my recollection we will not be getting the seven million.
4 I think it's 4.5 million, something around there. But
5 what I -- the figure I heard was not seven million.

6 MS. ESTRADA: Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: So it might, it might
8 make sense to review the proposed budget. That might be
9 something that just as a matter of clarification.

10 MS. ESTRADA: So, we, yeah, we'll -- I'll
11 confirm that with fiscal. So they'll let me know the
12 exact number, but I will confirm, and hopefully by the
13 next meeting I should have some information for you.

14 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Tisha, did
15 they, did they -- well, they didn't address the
16 7 million. They just -- did they address that it was a
17 shortfall, the 4 million? Or was that, that the figure
18 that they gave, the 4 million?

19 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: That was, yeah, that was
20 just the figure that was provided during the hearing,
21 yes. And just as a matter of inclusion there will be

1 another hearing on the budget on May 16th. So that
2 (indiscernible) to attend, and make sure your voice is
3 heard.

4 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: This is Commissioner
5 Edwards, and I hadn't heard that it had been -- that it
6 was only going to be the lower amount four point four
7 five million. So I really do want to make sure that we
8 confirm that before we go any further, and discuss the
9 amount because I have not heard that figure. So that's
10 new information. So I just want to make sure that we're
11 -- before we go too far in discussing it we're talking
12 about the correct figures.

13 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Of course.

14 COMMISSIONER HILL: If I could real quick. So
15 Kate and Stephani, will you work to confirm the -- what
16 the -- similar time when FY '25 is the proposed
17 allocation going to be 7 million or something lower, I
18 guess is the question?

19 MS. ESTRADA: For right now, no. This is FY
20 '24s. So FY '25 starts after July 1st. So we're still
21 waiting to get confirmation for FY '24. So if she -- and

1 I guess that's for you Tisha was that stating for FY '25?
2 Is that the meeting?

3 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: The City is, is working
4 the Fiscal Year '25 project. So --

5 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. So that's not -- yeah,
6 that's not what we're discussing. Okay. Okay. So we
7 will -- yeah, we'll definitely follow-up with that. So
8 '25 and '24 but -- yeah. Yeah, '24.

9 COMMISSIONER HILL: Thank you.

10 (Simultaneous comments.)

11 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: So since we're on that
12 topic, so since we're on that topic, what, what timeframe
13 are we working with to get confirmation of what the
14 contribution is it -- for Fiscal Year '24. We're
15 currently meeting about next year's budget.

16 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. It normally doesn't take
17 that long.

18 (Simultaneous comments.)

19 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: I mean --

20 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. It normally doesn't take
21 this long, but it has been a lot of, of positions being

1 moved around in the Fiscal Office. So I'm pretty sure
2 that's the cause of it. They're running short of staff,
3 and yeah. I think that they're just trying to get that
4 whole thing together. But, yeah, we'll follow-up though.

5 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Okay. Thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER HILL: I got a quick question too,
7 if I could.

8 MS. ESTRADA: Um-hmm.

9 COMMISSIONER HILL: So and Stephani, if you
10 don't mind, if you could turn back to the, the slide, I
11 think it's Slide 7, the March 24 commitments and
12 expenditures. And I think if you don't mind, if you have
13 an ability to put it back up there --

14 MS. ESTRADA: Um-hmm.

15 COMMISSIONER HILL: -- that would be helpful
16 just because -- thank you.

17 MS. ESTRADA: This one?

18 COMMISSIONER HILL: Thank you. Yes, I
19 appreciate it. And I think just like the general
20 observation is that we have a lot of amounts allocated to
21 these different buckets, and in some buckets the spend

1 down has been significantly slower than others. So I
2 know that you're about to make a big award on the rental
3 side, and that will make that amount go up. And for the,
4 the CLT side sounds like there's some movement there, but
5 obviously there's still quite a bit of money in that
6 bucket. And then particularly for Choice Neighborhoods,
7 Rent Supplement, Inclusionary Housing. I don't know if
8 there will be any plan to spend more money on the
9 Inclusionary Housing bucket from that amount allocated
10 given that the studies have all wrapped up, and that the
11 law has passed, and I don't think the law requires some
12 sort of funding from the Trust Fund, the Flex Fund. All
13 of those are ones where I'm just -- I'm constantly
14 reminded about the need to get people into affordable
15 housing now. And so I'm just wanting to -- if we can
16 brainstorm for a minute if anyone has ideas about how to
17 expedite moving more of that money more quickly.

18 MS. ESTRADA: I'm open to -- as for the CLT
19 projects and the rental that's, that's the project. So
20 those are actually -- the awards are going out. I think
21 just the expended amount is just based off of real estate

1 development, and them getting to closing, and, and
2 breaking ground for construction. And once they do that,
3 then we can start drawing down on funds.

4 For Choice Neighborhoods that's another
5 program, and I, I know that they are -- they're moving,
6 but they, I believe, they have other funds that they're
7 using as well, and then they, they will -- they let me
8 know as they start using the funds in that one.

9 Rent Supplement, yes, we have the Long-Term
10 Voucher Program that we would like to use the balance.
11 And funds can move forward for the Long-Term Voucher
12 Program.

13 Inclusionary Housing, I really do not have an
14 update on that. As we begin getting the Spending Plan
15 together I think we'll start making plans for those,
16 those funds when we get the spending -- the FY '25
17 Spending Plan together which I hope to have that at the
18 June meeting.

19 Flex Funds, that's another one that it is a
20 possibility to maybe even push that into other buckets of
21 money because we have not made a decision on what we are

1 going to use the Flex Funds for. It may need to go into
2 Rent Supplement for the Long-Term Voucher Program, but
3 we're open to ideas.

4 Any comments from the rest of the
5 Commissioners?

6 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yeah, this is
7 Commissioner Guthrie. There are quite a few models that
8 we've talked about, but they just generally speaking
9 there's -- homeless is a, is a growing problem. And
10 we've talked about those individuals who are not in need
11 of the wrap-around services, but still in need of
12 (indiscernible) that can be provided to, to keep them out
13 of homelessness. So that to me seems like one of the
14 most immediate ways of using some of these funds. And,
15 obviously, with what's in -- with what's going on across
16 the nation, and what's being heard in the Supreme Court
17 now allowing the communalization of homelessness, I know
18 it's not something that we're immediately dealing with in
19 Baltimore, but the day is today, and we don't know what,
20 what is coming down the pike tomorrow. So if we could
21 really figure out how to use some of these funds to shift

1 those or like transition those who no longer need the
2 wrap-around services so that we're freeing up
3 (indiscernible) those additional services just to keep
4 that pipeline flowing, I think that will be a good use of
5 our efforts.

6 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Which we can identify
7 people who do not need, quote, wrap-around services in
8 our community is there a process to deploy those funds on
9 a coffer that we can tap into or do we need to think
10 about that as well? Because I think your point is a good
11 one, Tisha, that we all make sure that we're doing
12 (indiscernible) organized and efficient, and get some
13 people that are intended.

14 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I think that the voucher
15 program that we've -- were -- that we've been talking
16 about would be what would provide the money, unless
17 you're thinking of some other kind of program as well.
18 But I think that's the program that would help. It's
19 been called in the past the Move On Voucher Program. But
20 would be to provide rent supplements in some form to
21 people who don't necessarily need all of the wrap-around

1 services. So I think that that's the program. We just
2 need to get it. That's why we have the RFP that we were
3 -- put out to get that designed because we don't
4 currently have the in-house capacity to (indiscernible).

5 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yeah. I would just
6 (indiscernible) we've been having (indiscernible) quite
7 some time, and I do appreciate (indiscernible) concern
8 for that being -- that contributing to the timeline that
9 we're currently looking at. But, I mean, quite honestly
10 I'm (indiscernible) what is being done around the country
11 kind of, I mean, there have been whole communities that
12 have burned down like literally in paradise, and within
13 18 months they got 15 buildings built. It's like we, we
14 -- and I don't (indiscernible) but that's all I have
15 right now. That's the only means by which I can really
16 with some diplomacy express kind of my (indiscernible)
17 the time is for us to get from Point A to Point B. It
18 just it seems like there's not a lot of urgency around
19 this. And based on what (indiscernible) there, there
20 needs to be some urgency. And I get -- by no means am I
21 suggesting that we throw something together or we don't

1 do our due diligence, but I think that we need to have
2 some kind of timeline.

3 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Right. So maybe that's
4 helpful. Stephani, remind us again the RFP went out in
5 beginning of April. What's the timeline for getting
6 responses back?

7 MS. ESTRADA: The 29th. Yes. The deadline for
8 them to submit their proposal is the 29th.

9 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: 29th?

10 MS. ESTRADA: Yes, of April.

11 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Oh, April 29th. Okay.
12 And then after that submission of proposals what's the
13 timeline for reviewing and vetting those proposals and
14 making a selection?

15 MS. ESTRADA: That will probably take between
16 three to four weeks. We have to get a review panel
17 together to review the same as we do as the NOFA, and
18 that normally takes three to four weeks. And then we
19 make the decision on who the consultant will be. And
20 then we have to do the BOE which that takes four to six
21 weeks to get approved by the BOE. And then they, I mean,

1 they can start working. They just can't start getting
2 paid until it's BOE approved. So I would say another two
3 to three months.

4 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Okay. So --

5 MS. ESTRADA: Consultant to start proposing.

6 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: So vetting the
7 applicants, I think one question would be are you
8 comfortable beginning work prior to BOE approval? So
9 that would mitigate that issue. And then is it possible
10 to include a member of the Commission on the committee
11 that reviews and, you know, a member or more, that
12 reviews the proposals, and provides some support to the
13 Commission's team?

14 MS. ESTRADA: I'm not sure. I mean, it would
15 be nice to have some addition -- some volunteers to help
16 because we normally have to go out of our department, and
17 get people to volunteer their time to review these
18 proposals, and that sometimes can be challenging. So I
19 would have to ask Kate is it okay for the Commissioners
20 to be on the review panel?

21 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: We have to figure out

1 the composition of the review panel. I don't know that
2 we've even figured out how many people we're having and
3 who they are. But I would definitely be open to having
4 one or two Commissioners on the review panel if that
5 makes sense.

6 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. And I think the size of
7 that review panel just depends on how many proposals we
8 get. So we normally have like for the rental round we
9 have eight people that are reviewing the applications,
10 and that's 22 applications. So I think it just depends
11 on how many --

12 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Yeah. I think we have
13 to see what we get on the 29th. I kind of don't expect
14 us to get as many, you know, for this type of RFP. It's
15 pretty specific, and not the same type at all of what --
16 you have to have some specialties to be able to do this.
17 So I don't expect to get a large number of responses, but
18 we'll see on the 29th, and then we can figure out how
19 many people we need to have on that review panel. It
20 will be a mixture of internal DHCD people, and then I
21 think having one or two of the Commissioners depending on

1 the number of applications makes sense.

2 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Do we have any, anymore
3 updates or questions, Commissioners?

4 This is our dialog time, Q&A. Any further?

5 So we can go to public comment.

6 MS. ESTRADA: Oh, yeah. So go ahead, Tisha,
7 because I was just going to mention about the bylaws, but
8 Tisha, go ahead.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, yeah, yeah, yeah.

10 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: One thing, well, two
11 things. One of the suggestions I wanted to make with
12 regards to the summary meeting minutes posted online. I
13 (indiscernible) that when we're speaking acronym that
14 because (indiscernible) but one suggestion I'd like to
15 make is, I mean, it's just -- just usually the proper
16 protocol when we use acronyms like (indiscernible) for
17 the first time just spell it out, and then from there on
18 use the acronym. Because the we're posting things which
19 we want to make sure that they can actually -- that the
20 information is accessible to them. And there may be
21 people trying to get informed who may not, may not have

1 that -- haven't been introduced to what the acronym, or
2 these acronyms being. So that's one thing just make the
3 information as accessible as possible. And then more to
4 the point of information that is provided for us, you
5 know, when we made the transition from whatever software
6 program that you were using to provide us with the
7 revenue information to -- from the old to the new, we
8 never really got a tutorial (indiscernible) this new
9 information. And I, I don't know (indiscernible) if we
10 could use -- if we could take a couple (indiscernible) to
11 go over the revenue report, go to the other transactions,
12 and just kind of break down what some of these, these
13 acronyms mean. Because I have no idea.

14 MS. ESTRADA: Okay.

15 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Ms. Guthrie, I think I
16 missed the first -- Commissioner, I think I missed the
17 first one, your first point. The -- you were talking
18 about the -- when you said the acronyms you were talking
19 about what report?

20 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: My first comment was
21 really with regard to the minutes that are posted online.

1 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Oh, okay.

2 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Everyone here is
3 familiar with, with NOFA and STICKT (ph.), and these
4 different acronyms means, but when we're posting minutes,
5 as, as many of us have been instructed like if we're
6 making a manual to be trained, you want to make it so
7 that the person off the street who has no idea what your
8 company is doing (indiscernible) they can read it, and
9 they can follow it. And as it stands, I'm not sure that
10 is, that is the, is the case for the minutes that
11 (indiscernible) if you're introducing a community land
12 trust, you write it out, and then in parentheses you just
13 have CLT, and you kind of know from that point on.
14 Community land trust is CLT. Just so people can actually
15 -- it's accessible, you know, the information is
16 accessible, and people know what we're talking about.

17 And then the second part where I mentioned
18 (indiscernible) the transaction report, the spreadsheet,
19 and some of the numbers and the letters that are, that
20 are used. I just, I don't know anything about. I really
21 don't. And I refuse to pretend they're all good. So

1 (indiscernible) my ignorance, and I'm asking for help.

2 MS. ESTRADA: I think that maybe what --
3 because I actually send you all what, what they send me.
4 So I can probably make it where I kind of like can
5 summarize it, and break it down a little bit, and then
6 maybe that could be their revenue report. I can try to
7 create a template that I think -- and pull some of that
8 stuff from it, and then send it around, and if you have
9 questions or if you want to add something in or
10 something, and then we can kind of work that out. I'll
11 send you that same document that they send me, but I can
12 kind of try to break it down on, on a simplified form, if
13 that makes sense.

14 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Can you pull up the
15 revenue report slide as to --

16 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: That's what I was about
17 to ask.

18 MS. ESTRADA: Oh, the slide that I, that's from
19 DHCD or on --

20 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: The one from today's
21 report.

1 MS. ESTRADA: Oh, the updates?

2 COMMISSIONER HILL: I'm so sorry, but I have to
3 leave the meeting. Thank you.

4 MS. ESTRADA: Okay.

5 Are you talking about this?

6 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: No, no. I'm talking
7 about the spreadsheet --

8 MS. ESTRADA: So at some --

9 (Simultaneous comments.)

10 MS. ESTRADA: -- separately to you all?

11 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yes.

12 MS. ESTRADA: Right? Yes. Okay. So let me
13 see how I can pull up. Let's see if I can. This what
14 you're talking about?

15 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yes.

16 MS. ESTRADA: And if I'm not mistaken, I think
17 this is the amount. Well, that's actually the same
18 amount over there. And then if you, which I guess I
19 could add totals in here. It should total out. But this
20 is so drastically -- I do agree with you. We have even
21 mentioned about how the old revenue report was just

1 easier to decipher. We have pointed that out that we
2 would prefer that way because if I'm not mistaken I think
3 the last one we was able to see addresses and all that
4 stuff.

5 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Right.

6 MS. ESTRADA: But, yeah, this one is literally
7 like an accountant ledger and yeah. These are the
8 amounts though that they have listed the revenue.

9 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: So (indiscernible) for
10 one second. So under sales item. So that, that number
11 is, it's \$ 1,706?

12 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah.

13 (Simultaneous comments.)

14 MS. ESTRADA: That's some, yeah, that's some
15 internal number that they, that they're using to identify
16 affordable housing surtax. But that doesn't -- I don't,
17 I don't know what that number is. I can't -- I couldn't
18 tell you. It's just some internal accounting number that

19 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: It's a line item that
20 they use --

21 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. And I'm just, I'm letting

1 you know like this is literally the Accounting
2 Department's form. I literally pull what they send me,
3 and give it to you. So this is not anything that I'm
4 doing these numbers. I don't know what this account
5 number is for, but to me it looks like it's just
6 identifying that this is affordable housing surtax that
7 comes -- that's what I would take from it. And the only
8 thing to add what I ask because I'm like you I'm not an
9 accountant so I don't know what all this stuff is. I
10 just ask what are the amounts? And these are the amounts
11 is what I'm told that came in. And so the total of it is
12 what we -- is what I put on the -- our DHCD updates of
13 how much came in for the month.

14 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Okay.

15 MS. ESTRADA: But, yeah. What else? It's
16 confusing I'll let you know if I'm confused too.

17 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: So, yeah, I guess, I
18 guess this other number under -- revenue --

19 MS. ESTRADA: Under category?

20 (Simultaneous comments.)

21 MS. ESTRADA: -- middle one?

1 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Okay. So
2 (indiscernible) item line for line item (indiscernible).

3 MS. ESTRADA: That's just to identify our
4 funds, but other than that, I think the, the main thing
5 is this number here, the amounts that's coming in. These
6 are -- this is the amount that came in. This is the
7 credit to the Affordable Housing Trust Fund which is
8 identical.

9 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Okay.

10 MS. ESTRADA: But that would be the only thing
11 I think you should -- that really pertains to the
12 information that you need is the amount that's coming in.
13 Yeah, the rest is just all internal stuff.

14 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Okay. Yeah, and like
15 you indicated before, I mean, it would be great to have
16 that pertinent information (indiscernible) that
17 information is relevant, and for the reason --

18 MS. ESTRADA: I do know that it's because of
19 the new system that we got is why that old sheet isn't
20 the same as what's coming out of it because of the new
21 system with Workday. And we have asked about getting it

1 like it was before, but they are saying that that's not
2 possible with the new system. So I don't know. I can
3 have some conversations on how they may can see, see if
4 they can break down some stuff or give us the
5 information. I'm not really sure if that's possible for
6 them to do, but I don't have a problem with reaching out
7 asking them if we can get some more details on the
8 transactions.

9 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Okay. I mean, that
10 would be helpful (indiscernible) I think. Sorry to bring
11 up history, but (indiscernible) transparent -- being as
12 much transparency as possible should be what we're
13 leaning towards.

14 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Do we have --

15 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Tisha, what was the
16 information in the old format that you've found helpful
17 that's not here?

18 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Like I said, the, the
19 LLC is associated (indiscernible) the name and address.

20 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Okay. So, Stephani, at
21 some point that might be more, more to your point.

1 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. I don't even know if I can
2 do that because that comes from a whole another
3 department. I think that's the Department of Finance,
4 and they send these over to our fiscal accountants, and
5 then our accountants send it to us. And we've had that
6 conversation about kind of going back to the old form
7 because we liked it too. But because of the new system,
8 like we're now in Workday. Prior to Workday we was in
9 City -- I believe it was City --

10 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: But the point is there's
11 some tie-out between the money that's in that report that
12 we just went through, and the recipients of the money.
13 So it would be helpful to know that for these line items
14 X amount went to Entity A, and Y amount went to Entity B.
15 So that's, and it may not be spit out by Workday, but is
16 there a way to determine for our understanding how these
17 funds were allocated? Something where in your
18 presentation we have X number of CNI, can we connect it
19 back to the report that you get from Workday?

20 MS. ESTRADA: Well, the report that you're
21 talking about the tax revenue that comes in. The report

1 that I'm sending you is connected back toward. So those
2 numbers that's in that line that's rather being to the
3 Affordable Housing Trust Fund calculates out to the total
4 revenue that I report to you every month. So those are
5 the transactions that happen. Tisha is just stating that
6 we have more detail to those transactions. So you're
7 getting the transaction sheet. You're just not getting
8 as much detail as you used to get with the old system.
9 And that would entail that I guess them manually putting
10 that stuff in because clearly it's not coming out like it
11 used to. So I don't know if that is even possible for
12 them to do because that would mean they would have to
13 task -- I don't even know. Like that's a -- again, I'll
14 reach out to them again and ask them, but I don't even
15 know if that's possible because that would just be
16 manually writing it out is, is what it appears to be to
17 me. And then that -- yeah, well, if they break down and
18 send it to me, then that would be great because then I'll
19 just forward it to you, but I don't know if it's
20 possible. So, again, I'll just reach out to them, and
21 we'll see how --

1 (Simultaneous comments.)

2 MS. ESTRADA: -- and yeah.

3 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. So you're just going
4 to check back in with us for the, possibly the just
5 update us so in the -- when we do the agenda setting?

6 MS. ESTRADA: Um-hmm, yeah.

7 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. I think we're going
8 to public comment. Do we have anybody?

9 MS. ESTRADA: I don't see any.

10 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: I'm sorry. I still --
11 there's still business. Another matter I wanted to bring
12 up.

13 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay, sure.

14 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: So I think most of us
15 realize that we, we're ending our meetings a lot earlier
16 than the allotted two hours which is time. There's a
17 possibility I wanted to bring to the table of revisiting
18 our monthly meetings especially with there being a gap
19 between the amount of time we have allocated for the
20 meetings, and the amount of business that we actually are
21 conducting during these monthly meetings. So I'm

1 wondering if we would like to discuss or entertain the
2 possibility of bimonthly meetings. I mean, I'm sorry. I
3 don't want to say quarterly meetings because --

4 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Meeting every other
5 month?

6 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yeah.

7 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah, it's up to you guys.

8 PRESIDENT DANIELS: What does the -- do we have
9 -- what's the -- do we have any precedence as far as the
10 what the, what the Charter says about that or do we have
11 to have a meeting every month or I can go back and check,
12 but do we have to have a meeting every month or?

13 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: No. It's not required
14 by the Charter. I think it would be something you would
15 include in the Bylaws that --

16 MS. ESTRADA: Right.

17 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: -- we've been working
18 on, and that's where it discusses how many meetings we
19 are planning to have (indiscernible).

20 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. So that's something
21 we can, we can kind of take into -- take back the comment

1 into the, the -- with the agenda setting comment?

2 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Or the Bylaws Committee.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: The Bylaws.

4 MS. ESTRADA: Which brings us to that issue
5 that you guys were talking about with the Bylaws about
6 possibly using another rules, not Robert's Rules of
7 Order. Tisha you have brought it up in the Bylaws
8 meeting.

9 PRESIDENT DANIELS: I think it was two -- I
10 think she gave me two (indiscernible) gave two
11 alternatives possibly.

12 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. Where you are kind of like
13 creating your own minutes then, I guess, and just really
14 to start with how you're handling, handling the meeting.
15 So instead of --

16 (Simultaneous comments.)

17 MS. ESTRADA: -- like using -- even though the
18 Robert Rules of -- say in a motion for this and all of
19 that, I think it's more so that did you guys get a chance
20 to look at the Bylaws though? Are there any other things
21 in the Bylaws that was listed that you guys want to

1 discuss, that you want to take in, take out?

2 COMMISSIONER HARRIS: Harris. I think we need
3 to go back stick with like this conversation around the
4 cadence of meetings first before we address any other
5 Bylaw topics. Because my question would be is there an
6 expectation from the general public for us to be meeting
7 on a monthly basis? Or if we go to an every other month
8 type of cadence, would we need to ensure that those
9 meetings are happening in public indefinitely? So that
10 the general public is not, I guess, short-changed for
11 lack of a better word for us just lessening or decreasing
12 the amount of meetings. I just wanted to throw that out
13 there for consideration.

14 PRESIDENT DANIELS: So you're referring to just
15 -- Commissioner, you're referring to being able to just
16 kind of go in the queue, and ask them what their thought
17 is as well?

18 COMMISSIONER HARRIS: Yeah. I think we
19 (indiscernible) consideration the public comment, public
20 commentary around changing our meeting cadence before we
21 make a final decision.

1 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Any other Commissioner have
2 any comment on that?

3 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: (indiscernible) approach
4 and a fair request. (indiscernible) I think but if we --
5 on that point, and for the ancillary to it, if we modify
6 -- if we approach our meetings through means of
7 management, but not Robert's Rules, I think we need to
8 allow for reflection and consideration of the issues
9 between meetings, and not present, say, (indiscernible)
10 first impression during a meeting, and expect a
11 determination about it. So I think it's important for us
12 to have the ability as Commissioners to consider the
13 approaches, I mean, (indiscernible) so I think along
14 those lines to Commissioner Harris' point we should
15 reflect on our approach, get some input, and make sure
16 that we're meeting the public expectations.

17 PRESIDENT DANIELS: So the public comment would
18 really be asking about the changing the format of monthly
19 meetings to some kind of (indiscernible) to see what
20 their thoughts are. But then though the two -- did I
21 hear something about not the Bylaws themselves, but I

1 thought it was something else mentioned as far as the --
2 another format.

3 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Yeah. What it would get
4 inserted into the Bylaws for the way we conduct our
5 meetings. It should allow for interim meeting
6 considerations and reflection by the Commissioners. No
7 meetings -- no issues should be raised and decided within
8 the same --

9 COMMISSIONER HARRIS: Right, sure.

10 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: I think that's a
11 conversation, and I apologize, I'll become more engaged
12 in the Bylaws discussion, but I think that's
13 appropriately addressed in what we update the Bylaws.

14 PRESIDENT DANIELS: When is that next meeting?
15 When is the next meeting slated to be for the Bylaws?

16 MS. ESTRADA: I don't think we have anything on
17 the books.

18 MS. WARD: We don't have anything -- sorry,
19 Stephani. But, yeah, we don't have anything. We have
20 kind of been on (indiscernible) what did we like combine
21 the meetings last time? I'm trying to remember. But,

1 yeah, no, we don't have --

2 (Simultaneous comments.)

3 MS. ESTRADA: -- the Bylaws. We combined --

4 MS. WARD: Oh, right, that's what that was,
5 yeah. No, we don't have a, we don't have a Bylaws on the
6 calendar right now.

7 MS. ESTRADA: I think it's important to you
8 guys responding though because we're not getting
9 responses from you on your timing, and your schedules.
10 And so we don't know when you are available to do it.
11 And then when we have the meetings we're not getting a
12 like a big show up. So I think it's that you guys come
13 to a consensus on what is good for you all. I know
14 everybody is busy but --

15 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: That's fair. And I --
16 it would help me if you're not seeing a response from me,
17 and I won't take callers, if you call me just because if
18 I'm not responding it's not because I'm just blowing you
19 off, but I haven't been -- I've missed the e-mail, and
20 I've been pulled into other directions, and haven't had a
21 chance to review and respond. And I'd welcome a call,

1 and I would probably be properly embarrassed and
2 chagrined for not being responsive.

3 MS. ESTRADA: Okay. I will call you.

4 PRESIDENT DANIELS: So that's something that we
5 can try again for the purpose of giving it to the public
6 for comment. I know we've done that before as far as
7 meeting, monthly meeting, bimonthly. What's that process
8 again?

9 MS. ESTRADA: We've never done that for the
10 Commission where it's --

11 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. Okay.

12 MS. ESTRADA: -- public comment to talk about
13 what the Commission should do. We've done public
14 comments for our NOFAs, right --

15 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay, right, right.

16 MS. ESTRADA: -- yeah, but not for --

17 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I was going to suggest
18 so since we're working kind of this little Bylaws, right,
19 maybe there's a section of the Bylaws that have to do
20 with public meeting, and other ways that we interact with
21 the public, and so it's not just a posting what do you

1 think about us switching from monthly to bimonthly, but
2 it's kind of any portion of the Bylaws that have --
3 relate to how we kind of interact with the public, and
4 then we can post that on the website, and have a --
5 either a two-week or a 30-day period where people could
6 submit comments. And it will be similar to what we do
7 for the NOFAs, but it would be the Bylaws.

8 COMMISSIONER HARRIS: I would agree with that,
9 Commissioner Edwards. I guess I'm just, just trying to
10 avoid any backlash, backlash from the public on any
11 decisions we make to change formats or meeting cadences
12 or, or the like. But I would agree maybe we need a more
13 all (indiscernible) approach on when it's necessary to
14 engage the public, and do it all at once, and give them
15 an opportunity to respond versus these one-offs. I would
16 agree with that as well.

17 MS. ESTRADA: Okay. So let me just get that
18 real quick, quick. So, Kate, posting like a portion of
19 the Bylaws about the meetings on, online, and then going
20 like a form where they can say yes, no, or --

21 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: It may be broader than

1 the meetings. I don't know exactly what I have in mind,
2 but I'm thinking --

3 MS. ESTRADA: Okay.

4 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: -- parts of the Bylaws.
5 Like I think in the Bylaw Committee we should have a
6 discussion where we look through the Bylaws and determine
7 which portions of it we think relate to kind of our
8 interaction with the public, and that would be what we
9 could put together as something that could be posted and
10 reacted to.

11 MS. ESTRADA: Okay.

12 PRESIDENT DANIELS: So --

13 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah, Tisha, you had your hand
14 up.

15 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: I'm fine.

16 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. Do we have any, any
17 public comment? Not public. I'm sorry. Any other
18 business. I'm sorry.

19 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yes. So next month
20 being May I am wondering -- let me see, 1, 2, 3, 4. Okay
21 now the fourth Tuesday is actually the 23rd. So I just

1 wanted to make sure that everyone is okay with us meeting
2 on the 23rd knowing that the Memorial Day holiday I think
3 is the -- it's the following week. So I think we should
4 be all right, but as far as to bring that up.

5 MS. ESTRADA: Okay. Well, actually it's
6 actually that week because ours is 1, 2, 3, 4. It's May
7 the 28th, Tuesday, May the 28th. So Memorial is normally
8 Monday, right? I believe it's Monday the 27th, the last
9 Monday of the month. Am I right or no?

10 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: I think you're right.

11 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. So it is the day after
12 Memorial Day.

13 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: No, I thought -- I think
14 that -- 1, 2, 3 -- I think our -- we're usually on the
15 4th Tuesday, right?

16 MS. ESTRADA: Um-hmm, of the month.

17 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Yeah. So I'm looking at
18 April (indiscernible).

19 MS. ESTRADA: Yes. So, yes, it's the day after
20 Memorial Day. You are right.

21 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Okay.

1 (Simultaneous comments.)

2 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: I guess that's fine.

3 MS. ESTRADA: That you guys should have this
4 (indiscernible).

5 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Do you want to -- is that a
6 meeting that we want to (indiscernible) because of the
7 holiday is that a meeting that we want to forego until
8 June?

9 COMMISSIONER JONES: This is Commissioner Bree.
10 I'll (indiscernible).

11 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Thank you for being clear.
12 Any other pleasure of the Commission for next, for next
13 time for this coming the 28th --

14 (Indiscernible).

15 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Forego the meeting, and
16 resume in June.

17 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. Moved and second.

18 Let's just hear from Commissioners. Can we
19 just do -- can we just hear from the Commissioners on
20 properly moved and second, all in favor?

21 COMMISSIONERS: Aye, aye, aye.

1 (Indiscernible).

2 Any opposed?

3 Any abstain, abstentions?

4 The motion carries.

5 Is that all we have for business today? We can
6 roll call to adjourn.

7 Commissioner Catherine Stokes.

8 COMMISSIONER STOKES: Aye.

9 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Harris.

10 COMMISSIONER HARRIS: Aye.

11 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Edwards.

12 Commissioner Griffin.

13 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: Aye.

14 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner McClain.

15 Commissioner Guthrie.

16 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Aye.

17 PRESIDENT DANIELS: And Commissioner Jones.

18 It's been properly moved and second. And I
19 think we -- and the motion carries.

20 Thank you everybody.

21 (Whereupon, at 7:08 p.m., on April 23, 2024,

1 the meeting was adjourned.)

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

C E R T I F I C A T E

14

This is to certify that the foregoing

15

transcript in the matter of:

16

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMISSION MEETING

17

BEFORE: Kevin Daniels, President

18

DATE: April 23, 2024

19

PLACE: Virtual via Webex

20

Represents the full and complete proceedings of the


21

aforementioned matter as reported and reduced to

1 typewriting by Free State Reporting, Inc.

2

3



4

Roland Thomas Bowman, III
Court Reporter

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21