

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

BALTIMORE CITY DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMISSION MEETING

Our Daily Bread Employment Center
725 Fallsway
Baltimore, MD 21202

Tuesday, February 28, 2023

BEFORE: KEVIN DANIELS, President

MEMBERS PRESENT:

- KATE EDWARDS
- KATE EDWARDS
- TISHA GUTHRIE
- CATHERINE STOKES
- STACY GRIFFIN
- ERIKA FOX
- AMY MCCLAIN
- VERNADINE KIMBALL
- ANTHONY WILLIAMS
- BREE JONES

Proceeding recorded by electronic sound recording;
transcript produced by Free State Reporting, Inc.

1 Also Present:

2 STEPHANI ESTRADA, Program Manager, Affordable Housing
Trust Fund, DHCD

3
4 TAMMY HAWLEY

5 PAUL STANFORD

6 Public Speakers:

7 KIRK NOWLIN

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

	<u>INDEX</u>	<u>Page</u>
1		
2		
3	Meeting Called to Order	4
4	Roll Call	4
5	January Meeting Summary Approval	5
6	DHCD Updates	6
7	Commission Q&A Dialogue with DHCD	11
8	Public Comment	14
9	Other Business	14
10	Continuum of Care Discussion	38
11	Adjournment	49
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		

P R O C E E D I N G S

(6:10 p.m.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

PRESIDENT DANIELS: Good evening everybody.
This is the Affordable Housing Trust Fund Commission
Meeting, February 28th. We want to, just to call the
meeting to an order, to the order by calling Commissioner
Catherine Stokes.

Commissioner Ramsey Harris.
Commissioner Kate Edwards.

COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Present.

PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Joynes.
Commissioner Kimball.

COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Here.

PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Griffin, Stacy
Griffin.

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: Present.

PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Erika Fox.
Commissioner Anthony Williams.

Commissioner Matt Hill.
Commissioner Bree Jones.

Commissioner Amy McClain.

1 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Here.

2 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Tisha Guthrie.

3 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: Here.

4 PRESIDENT DANIELS: We want to have someone
5 make a motion to approve the meeting summary from
6 January.

7 Any discussion?

8 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: I'll motion for approval
9 of the minutes.

10 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: I second, Commissioner
11 Griffin.

12 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Properly moved and second.
13 All in favor.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: Aye, aye.

15 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Any opposed?

16 Any abstentions?

17 The motion carries.

18 The Continuum of Care presentation by
19 Ms. Carolyn Johnson, it is -- we will not have that
20 tonight. What we will do is just go into the DHCD
21 updates.

1 Now are we looking -- is she -- are we looking
2 to reschedule?

3 MS. ESTRADA: I think so.

4 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Reschedule.

5 MS. ESTRADA: (Indiscernible).

6 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay.

7 MS. ESTRADA: Okay. Good evening everyone.
8 This is the Affordable Housing Trust Fund DHCD updates.
9 I'm Stephani Estrada, the program manager for the
10 Affordable Housing Trust Fund.

11 Presentation is going to go through the Trust
12 Fund revenue, the commitments and expenditures, and all
13 of the activities of the Trust Fund.

14 Our first slide is the revenue that came in for
15 January which was \$1,128,645. Our revenue collected
16 through January 23 is \$63,923,239, with a total of -- in
17 Fiscal Year '23, \$14,193,112.

18 This is the revenue contribution type by year
19 through January 23rd. Actually added a section here to
20 show the surplus that was put into the FY '23. The
21 surplus from FY '22 that was put into FY '23 which made

1 our revenue to date is \$21,363,489.

2 Our next slide is showing the tax revenue
3 collected to date, and the City of Baltimore contribution
4 is \$45,173,334 on tax revenue, and the \$18,750,000 is
5 contingent on the City's contribution for FY '23 of
6 \$7 million. We have not got confirmation on that yet,
7 but that is the estimate.

8 This is the commitments and expenditures to
9 date. This does not have FY '23 money in the amount
10 allocated yet. Probably by the next meeting I will have
11 those numbers updated.

12 Our project status overview. Total of projects
13 awarded 36. Total due diligence in terms negotiations is
14 28. Rent agreement drafts -- 20. Audit review was sent
15 for audits with 13 projects audits approved; 13 BOE
16 requested; 13 BOE approved 13. Disbursements 5,
17 compliance 3.

18 This is the AMI spending breakdown. There were
19 allocations -- 36. The total amount awarded is
20 \$27,396,230. Totals 30 percent AMI unit is 493. Total
21 amount spent on 30 percent AMI units is \$11,396,674.

1 Total 50 percent AMI units is \$459. Total amount spent
2 on 50 percent AMI is \$15,214,614.

3 NOFA information. The New Construction,
4 Preservation of Existing Rental Housing NOFAs Round 1, 2
5 and 3 summary -- is we're deal structuring, presenting
6 agreements to the BOE for approval, and preparing for
7 settlement. NOFA 4, NOFA -- the NOFA opened on
8 February 10, 2023. DHCD made up to \$10,750,000
9 available. The NOFA does include a set-aside for
10 Community Land Trust projects in the amount of \$2
11 million. All rental projects can -- up to \$1 million per
12 project. Any money that CLT set-aside will be applied to
13 other rental projects.

14 Community Land Trust NOFAs, Single-Family
15 Homeownership NOFA, Round 1 and 2 summary info is we're
16 deal structuring, presenting agreements to the BOE for
17 approval, and preparing for settlement. The Community
18 Land Trust NOFAs Homeownership Round 3, Rental Round 1,
19 Operating NOFA Round 1. Awards were announced at the
20 awards ceremony. 11 applications were received. Total
21 amount requested was 5 million. Seven applications were

1 awarded, and total amount of awarded funded was 328
2 million.

3 Community Land Trust NOFA Round 3 awardees was
4 NEHI for homeownership, NEHI Buyer's Choice
5 Homeownership, South Baltimore Community Land Trust
6 Homeownership, NEHI Rental Project, NEHI (indiscernible),
7 South Baltimore Community Land Trust operating, Charm
8 City Community Land Trust operating, Harbor West
9 operating.

10 The Community Land Trust Single-Family
11 Homeownership NOFA, Round 4, it will be a rolling NOFA.
12 The NOFA will be put out for public comment on March 1st.
13 Public comment will run for two months. Work group will
14 be -- will discuss public comment, and make adjustments
15 approved by Housing Commissioner. The NOFA will go live
16 July 1st, and run until June 30, 2024, or until the funds
17 run out. The NOFA will open back up every August 1st
18 thereafter.

19 The Inclusion Housing legislation expired on
20 June 30, 2022. New Inclusionary Housing requirements are
21 being considered by Baltimore City. That is our latest

1 update on Inclusionary Housing.

2 Commissioner nomination updates. Stacy Freed
3 is not here tonight. So we'll get those at -- for the
4 next meeting.

5 And that is it.

6 Would you like me to go back to a particular
7 slide?

8 MS. GUTHRIE: So this may sound like a -- I
9 don't even know if this is an appropriate question, but I
10 was actually wondering when I was looking at the, the
11 material you sent ahead of time, is there a way to
12 indicate when accounting for the number of units which
13 projects are doing rentals or apartment -- apartments as
14 opposed to single homes?

15 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. Can you send me that
16 request in an e-mail?

17 MS. GUTHRIE: Yes.

18 MS. ESTRADA: Any other questions?

19 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: So the Round 4 of -- for
20 the new construction was opened on the 10th. What's --
21 how long does that run?

1 MS. ESTRADA: That, the deadline for that is
2 March the 17th.

3 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Have you received any
4 applications so far?

5 MS. ESTRADA: Yes.

6 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: How's it looking?

7 MS. ESTRADA: About 60 of them in progress, and
8 two of them have submitted a completed application.

9 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Okay.

10 PRESIDENT DANIELS: I didn't hear the question.
11 What was that again?

12 MS. ESTRADA: How many applications have we
13 received so far? It was about 60 of them that are in
14 progress, and two have already been completed.

15 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Thank you.

16 MS. ESTRADA: Yes.

17 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Do you see it's a cross-
18 section location in the City and communities of
19 opportunity, or, like, what's the -- generally speaking
20 the location are -- is it well scattered across the City
21 or -- and if you don't know, that's okay.

1 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. I haven't gone through
2 them.

3 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Okay. Okay.

4 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah, no.

5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: And for that the CLTs
6 can request up to a million dollars as well --

7 MS. ESTRADA: Yes.

8 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: -- out of that two
9 million?

10 MS. ESTRADA: Yes.

11 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: Okay.

12 COMMISSIONER STOKES: Stephani, I was wondering
13 do you know based on the -- when you factor in the last
14 round where you stand with the 30 percent unit because I
15 know, I know that the 30 percent units was below the
16 target --

17 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah.

18 COMMISSIONER STOKES: -- the last time when we
19 talked about it in the fall that hadn't been factored in.
20 I wasn't sure.

21 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. You mean like where

1 they're at now or --

2 COMMISSIONER STOKES: Yes, um-hmm.

3 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. That was on --

4 COMMISSIONER STOKES: It was. I'm sorry.

5 MS. ESTRADA: No, you're fine.

6 COMMISSIONER STOKES: Yeah.

7 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah, this slide. This includes
8 all the projects that we have seen thus far, plus Senior
9 Homeownership and the pandemic money. And so far 493
10 units out of those projects the total amount spent was
11 11 million.

12 COMMISSIONER STOKES: And how does that compare
13 to what the goal was in terms of --

14 MS. ESTRADA: The goal is for them to be equal.

15 COMMISSIONER STOKES: Okay.

16 MS. ESTRADA: 30 percent and 50 percent to be
17 equal.

18 COMMISSIONER STOKES: Great. Thank you.

19 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Any further questions Q&A,
20 DHCD?

21 Okay. Moving right along. Any public comment?

1 How many do we have on the --

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Three, which -- and no
3 comment --

4 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. Any public comment?

5 MR. NOWLIN: This is my first time here. So I
6 don't -- I'm just trying to feel what's going on here.

7 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Sure.

8 MR. NOWLIN: Right? Trying to see where's my
9 place in this situation that you're talking about. How
10 can I expand that to myself as well? So I don't really
11 know. I'm just -- hear what you're saying. So also
12 going through all this, do you -- would I be able to get,
13 like, a slide here or a PowerPoint of this --

14 MS. ESTRADA: Yes.

15 MR. NOWLIN: -- copy of this stuff?

16 MS. ESTRADA: It will be posted on the website
17 tomorrow.

18 MR. NOWLIN: Okay.

19 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Anybody else?

20 Okay. Next on the agenda is other business,
21 emergency rental assistance.

1 Any updates?

2 MS. ESTRADA: Tisha, did you want to speak?
3 You want to bring that up in other business?

4 MS. GUTHRIE: Yes. So during the meeting that
5 we had with the Department, well, with the City, some
6 different agencies, the question around direct to tenants
7 payments has come up. The fact that, that revenue has
8 expired, has depleted actually, and what we can do around
9 alternative resources so that individuals whose landlords
10 are not willing to take payments directly from the City
11 those tenants can actually be paid, and manage their,
12 their rent payments accordingly. So we were actually,
13 since we don't -- we have such a kind of a skeleton
14 Commission right now, we were going to bring it up next
15 month. But just for the sake of the Commission at large
16 knowing their -- so as you all know the, the revenue that
17 comes through the Trust Fund after -- was it, I think
18 13 million after we reach a certain point -- half those
19 states with the, the trust fund, the other half goes to
20 the Mayor's --

21 MS. ESTRADA: General --

1 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: The Mayor's what now?

2 MS. ESTRADA: Baltimore City's General Fund.

3 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Okay. Thank you.

4 MS. ESTRADA: So once we hit 16 million --

5 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Okay.

6 MS. ESTRADA: -- it will stop.

7 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Thank you.

8 MS. ESTRADA: It will stop splitting.

9 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: So one of the
10 suggestions that was made during our meeting last week
11 was consulting with the Mayor, the Mayor's office, and
12 proposing that if not, if not a -- that compete amount,
13 at least a percentage of that -- those funds that were
14 transferred due to the increased revenue be allocated for
15 the direct to tenant payments. Because there are just so
16 many people who are, who are waiting, and really are at a
17 -- they're at a loss right now. And this is a way to
18 prevent them being evicted or having -- dealing with
19 that, that kind of trauma, and that kind of housing
20 violence. So --

21 PRESIDENT DANIELS: -- mentioned something

1 about the -- they can't, they can't get payments from the
2 City. Could you just expand upon that a little bit?

3 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: So some of the landlords
4 just don't want to enter an agreement with the City. So
5 we, we had -- there's already established a fund the
6 direct to tenants fund so that those individuals who are,
7 who are leased with landlords who don't want to enter
8 that third-party agreement with the City, they can
9 actually be paid -- they go through the same paperwork,
10 and I mean the City can detail what that entails, but
11 they can actually get paid directly so that it's almost
12 just like the tenant is paying their landlord directly so
13 that it's not that -- because some landlords for whatever
14 reason, I don't know, they don't like engaging with
15 government directly for their payment. So that's a
16 workaround, and it's -- many families have benefited from
17 that, and they -- it's helped them to remain housing
18 stable during this, during this crisis.

19 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: And so you're saying
20 that those funds are being depleted, that we don't have -
21 -

1 MS. GUTHRIE: They're gone.

2 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: They're gone.

3 MS. GUTHRIE: Yeah.

4 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: And so the thought is
5 that when we hit the 15, 6 -- what was the threshold?

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 16 --

7 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: 16 million, and half of
8 the funds go to the City General Revenue Fund. So a
9 portion of that go to support --

10 MS. GUTHRIE: So that's what we're, that's what
11 we're suggesting.

12 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Okay.

13 MS. GUTHRIE: That that be looked into as an
14 option.

15 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Okay.

16 MS. GUTHRIE: Yeah.

17 MR. NOWLIN: I've had at least 25 women call me
18 within the past two weeks looking for housing.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And I'm sorry. Who are
20 you?

21 MR. NOWLIN: I'm Kirk.

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And who do you
2 represent?

3 MR. NOWLIN: N3, LLC. I have my own company.
4 So I have several tenants, and either it's word of mouth
5 because I try to do affordable housing, but it has to be
6 a certain way. It has to look a certain way. It has to
7 be comfortable enough for me to live in there to give to
8 them. So most of my houses are really laid out pretty
9 nice. So they're either telling other tenants about it.
10 So they're calling. I'm getting Section 8. I'm getting
11 House of Ruth. So I'm here trying to figure out what I
12 can do to build a portfolio to help some of these women,
13 but I can only go but so far with my own cash getting
14 these houses. And I see a lot of vacant properties in
15 Baltimore, and I went to some auction, buying some
16 houses, having to gut them out, fix them to try to make
17 sure the foundation is where it needs to be. Because
18 when they move in shouldn't have any problems. I don't
19 have a problem with -- the City, and I guess I'm on some
20 sort of database list as well. So I'm just trying to
21 figure out what you all are doing, and what can happen

1 for me to help them. And because I mean I'm telling you I
2 will get off from work, and I will have on my voice mail
3 three calls per day. So I know it must be something out
4 there that's in desperate need. And it's -- I'd just
5 like to make something better, right?

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

7 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Just for the sake of -- you
8 were going to say something?

9 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Go ahead, go ahead.

10 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Just for the sake of
11 discussion, why would the landlord not want to navigate
12 -- just for the case of discussion.

13 MR. NOWLIN: I can probably tell you why.
14 Because you have very strict rules when it comes down to
15 inspections. I mean, you know, a lot of things need to
16 be in place. And as you can see it's a lot of slumlords
17 out there. So if you -- basically people want to get the
18 money, and they don't really care about the tenant. And
19 that's the complaints that I get from people, right? So
20 you get the City involved, you've got to go through all
21 this inspection, and things got to be right, you've got

1 to have the right kind of amenities in order to get the
2 money. People don't want to do that. They don't want to
3 go that far. They just want to be able to get what they
4 can get, and not worry about it. They can put people in
5 the houses, but then no one's fixing the problems if
6 there's a heat problem or a water problem. They don't
7 want to come and fix it, right? That's what I see in
8 Baltimore City. I mean, you drive through Westport half
9 the people up there are renting. And people ask me do
10 you have any more houses that I, that I can move in? So
11 it's a lack of respect, right? The landlords don't
12 respect the tenants. They feel as basically you don't
13 have the money, so I'm not going to put the money in it.
14 That's my opinion, right?

15 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: So I would suggest if
16 you got a card, leave your card.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

18 MR. NOWLIN: Do I have a business card?

19 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Yeah. If you've got a
20 business card, leave your card.

21 MR. NOWLIN: I can leave you number.

1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

2 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: And give me the number,
3 and we'll get in touch with you.

4 MR. NOWLIN: Absolutely.

5 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: We'll definitely get in
6 touch with you.

7 MR. NOWLIN: Absolutely.

8 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: And so -- so for folks.
9 I'm -- my name is Anthony Williams. I'm one of the
10 Commissioners on the Affordable Housing Trust Fund. So I
11 represent 30 percent area median income, that population
12 of people which predominantly are homeless, but there are
13 also subsidies, and people that have subsidies as well.
14 So I'm a Commissioner through the Continuum of Care who
15 funds the City about 25 million a year for services and
16 programs. So they had -- they had put me up for this
17 position, and I was appointed by the Mayor to be on this
18 Commission for that specific population of people.

19 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: So question back on the
20 tenant -- the direct to tenant payment. To the -- what
21 does, what's the safeguard to ensure that the tenant is

1 in a safe unit? Is there a sort of a housing quality
2 inspection given that the payment is to the tenant, and
3 not to the owner? I mean, to the point, right? That is
4 a concern. Landlords want to -- some are hesitant
5 because of the inspection process, but the inspection
6 process is an important process to ensure that people are
7 in sanitary dwellings. So when there's a direct to
8 tenant payment what do we do to ensure that the tenant is
9 using that for a unit that will not harm them? Do we
10 know that?

11 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: We haven't -- we don't
12 administer the program in our section. So I don't know
13 exactly what the standards are. I know when we do
14 relocations and all kinds of things we have to make sure
15 that it's safe, decent and sanitary.

16 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Right.

17 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: But I'm not sure for
18 that particular program how they're ensuring that. I
19 would assume that something would be built in, but we'd
20 have to get some more information on the program, and how
21 it was run when it had funding to get more details on

1 that.

2 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Okay. Thanks.

3 PRESIDENT DANIELS: I think we -- for the sake
4 of discussion, particularly if we're going to make a
5 recommendation to the City for directed payments, what do
6 we see as an accountability structure?

7 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I think it might be
8 good, like, if we're going to discuss this further maybe
9 we have somebody from the office that --

10 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay.

11 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: -- administers it. They
12 can maybe give a presentation first --

13 (Simultaneous comments.)

14 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: -- and then it could be
15 kind of discussion. So maybe at the next meeting we
16 could try to get somebody to come, and then they could
17 answer those questions.

18 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: And just for the sake
19 of, like, answering a question with a question. This is
20 temporary assistance.

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

1 COMMISSIONER GUTHRIE: This is to pay rent in
2 arrears and to get them up-to-date. And so to answer a
3 question with a question even if the -- even if there may
4 be some kind of violation, some kind of -- maybe there is
5 dampness or something like that, that the inspector -- so
6 would we rather the person be in stable or would we
7 rather have that -- those financial resources provided so
8 that that family can stay where they are right now until
9 they decide that they need to go somewhere else? Because
10 that's what this is really about. It's about housing
11 stability for them.

12 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: I have a question.
13 Vernadine Kimball, Commissioner. This might be a little
14 off, but how often do they come out to check to make sure
15 that everything is going okay in the apartments and
16 houses, the inspections? How often do they come out?

17 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Typically I've only
18 seen someone come out once.

19 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: That's not enough.

20 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: First time. Once it
21 happens I've never seen anyone come out after that. But

1 for me in particular, I, I like to inspect my house at
2 least every three months because I like to exterminate.

3 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yes.

4 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: I like to make sure
5 things are moving. But I also like to make sure people
6 are taking care of the property. Because I --

7 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Exactly.

8 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: -- personally. So
9 things kind of happen, right? So I personally come out
10 to just to -- because it's still my property.

11 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Of course.

12 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: And I want to make sure
13 that it's maintained, right?

14 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yes.

15 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: But I've never had an
16 experience where I had an inspector come out the first
17 time and see them the second time. After that, that's
18 it.

19 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Well, that is something
20 that needs to be brought to this Commissioner's attention
21 because even with the newer dwellings that they have

1 built already here in Baltimore City, and they are
2 constantly building, things go wrong in these apartment
3 buildings, brand new, such as elevators not working,
4 rodents. They have a lot of tenants in the building, and
5 they don't have efficient trash, trashcans, trash rooms.
6 I visit a building brand new, Renaissance Building, and
7 I'm going to make sure I say the name. The trash room,
8 they had trash outside the trash room. And the notice on
9 the manager's office said you cannot put trash in front
10 of the trash room. So what do you do with this trash?
11 Do you take it back in your home? These are the things
12 that we have to stay on top of for our new buildings. We
13 have spent so much money in building these dwellings why
14 should we sit aside and watch these buildings go to the
15 dogs?

16 MR. NOWLIN: You know what the problem is, is
17 the area, right? Now I have, I have a dump truck. I
18 bring my dump truck up. I have to move trash from each
19 side of the neighbors because I've called 311 over and
20 over and over. Things don't happen, right? So I'm,
21 like, no, I have to get this stuff out of here because --

1 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yes.

2 MR. NOWLIN: -- what's going to happen is you
3 get rats, right? And then that's a problem, right? But
4 the difference is when I have a house over in Federal
5 Hill, I had tenants in there, right, but they were
6 traveling nurses, right. I said put your trashcans in
7 the back because I don't know why people putting their
8 trashcans in the front of the house. Everybody does it.
9 I got a call one day from the City that said do you need
10 another trashcan because the lid was up? The lid is up
11 on the trashcan. You called me because the lid is up?
12 Yeah, because a rat can get in there, right. So I work
13 all the way into Langley, Virginia. So I'm on my way
14 home. You called me because -- so I called the tenants,
15 said, hey, can you make sure the lid is down on the
16 trashcan because the City's calling me? She said, well,
17 the guy that moved in next door he threw his trash in my
18 garbage, right? He just moved in. So then I had to go,
19 I said, hey, can you not throw your garbage in mine? And
20 then I told him please take the stuff in the back, right?
21 It's fenced in. When it comes you put it in the alley.

1 The difference between that and going somewhere like
2 Westport nobody cares. That's why I have to keep calling
3 311 so --

4 COMMISSIONER JONES: I have a question.

5 MR. NOWLIN: -- trash.

6 COMMISSIONER JONES: Where are we in the
7 agenda? I think I'm a little bit lost as to --

8 (Simultaneous comments.)

9 MS. ESTRADA: Other business.

10 COMMISSIONER JONES: Oh, okay. Oh, okay.

11 MS. GUTHRIE: One of the things that -- to get
12 back to what Ms. -- Commissioner Kimball mentioned. This
13 was brought up at least -- this is before the pandemic
14 even started. So three years ago. And just it was so
15 far back that we were still under -- we were working with
16 Commissioner Breaverman. The poor maintenance and upkeep
17 of especially multi-family dwellings --

18 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yes.

19 MS. GUTHRIE: -- is a habitual issue that we've
20 been dealing with in Baltimore. And one of the things
21 that I brought up was we really need to do a better job

1 with oversight, and really the vetting of property
2 management companies.

3 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Exactly.

4 MS. GUTHRIE: Because there's -- first of all,
5 there's too much money in the gig for there not to be
6 accountability. The national statistic is that 70 -- 17
7 percent of the revenue within real estate is going to
8 property management companies. That's a pretty penny.

9 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: That's right.

10 MS. GUTHRIE: And as you said, there's -- there
11 are millions of dollars that not only the City, but --
12 well, I will say the City is subsidizing for apartment
13 complexes to support not just affordable housing, but
14 also luxury housing.

15 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Um-hmm, yes.

16 MS. GUTHRIE: As money is being poured into
17 -- as money is being invested, tax dollars are being
18 invested, and then there's no, there's no way of tracking
19 just how well they're being maintained. There really
20 isn't. So you have plenty of poor actors. You have
21 plenty of bad actors as far as management companies.

1 They have horrible records.

2 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Um-hmm.

3 MS. GUTHRIE: There needs to be some way of
4 tracking them, and indicating that because your portfolio
5 is so horrible, because you were in DC, and DC kicked you
6 out, they're the property management company in this, in
7 this here town --

8 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yeah.

9 MS. GUTHRIE: -- that after, after Capitol
10 Heights did what they did in 2019, they were -- the city
11 forced them to sell, I think, 75 percent of their, their
12 portfolio and kicked them out of town, but now they're
13 here. That's a problem.

14 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: It is a problem.

15 MS. GUTHRIE: So we really -- if you're willing
16 to invest, you need to also invest in making sure that
17 the entities, the companies that are managing these
18 properties are, are good actors. If they're not, they
19 have no place here.

20 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: That's right.

21 COMMISSIONER JONES: Commissioner Tisha, is the

1 recommendation that for any funds disbursed through the
2 Affordable Housing Trust Fund that we monitor the
3 property managers and their performance or is this a
4 broader --

5 MS. GUTHRIE: Yeah, almost --

6 COMMISSIONER JONES: -- for the City?

7 MS. GUTHRIE: Almost like creating a licensure,
8 but --

9 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: So we do have a
10 licensing. We have rental licensing for the City.

11 (Simultaneous comments.)

12 MS. GUTHRIE: For -- no. I'm talking about for
13 property management companies.

14 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Management companies.

15 MS. GUTHRIE: Not just for landlords but --

16 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yeah.

17 MS. GUTHRIE: -- a licensure for management
18 companies.

19 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Yeah, that's a big
20 issue.

21 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: That's a big --

1 MS. GUTHRIE: Because, I mean, like
2 Ms. Kimball's saying, after, after they, they're
3 inspected, what property management companies do on a
4 regular basis is really what ensures that a property
5 maintains its -- its, its structure and its integrity, or
6 the, the exact opposite happens. And then we have these
7 20-year cycles.

8 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: So I think you, your
9 Capitol Heights example is a good one. And I think we do
10 have that happen in Maryland because if property owners,
11 the sponsors of those projects, want to obtain other
12 funding, they have to go through a due diligence and
13 vetting process, and part of that is looking at the
14 property management company that they would have, their
15 track record, and their reputation, and their ability to
16 manage and maintain good properties at a standard that
17 would be expected. So I would say that it may not be an
18 immediate response or immediate solution, but eventually
19 bad actors are not getting any additional funding to put
20 new units in -- on a service. That being said, there is
21 which we know the City has a backlog in doing sort of

1 inspections and that sort of thing, but there is a
2 process. And so part of it may be -- and I don't know if
3 it's within this Commission's purview, but ensuring that
4 the City has the funds, the resources, the inspectors,
5 and the wherewithal to follow-up on derelict buildings
6 that are poorly managed.

7 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: So in dealing with that,
8 I think this might be a issue for the Planning Department
9 developing some type of plan to deal with the management
10 companies, and making sure that they treat Baltimore
11 citizens properly, and treating them with dignity.
12 Because when I go to a brand new facility that's not even
13 a year old, and I see stains on the carpet, and I see
14 stuff on the wall, and the elevator's broken, the trash
15 is outside the trash room, that upsets me that they're
16 not treating these people with human rights far as being
17 able to live like a human being right here in Baltimore
18 City. I don't think our citizens here should have to
19 live like that. They fought tooth and nail to get those
20 brand new facilities, to get in there, and then the
21 property manager is going to talk trash to them. That's

1 not right, people. Commissioners, that's not right.

2 It's just not. I'm done.

3 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Any other discussion with
4 -- we are on the final discussion item, agenda item for
5 the other business or emergency rental. Any other
6 further discussion? I do like the suggestion from
7 Commissioner Edwards to have someone in for presentation.

8 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yes.

9 PRESIDENT DANIELS: It's a real issue,
10 obviously. So have someone in for the presentation on
11 the next meeting.

12 Any other further comment?

13 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: I just think maybe if we
14 can get together, and try to do a walk-through of some of
15 these brand new facilities. I don't know how we could do
16 a surprise, but I think we need to walk through. Because
17 we've worked hard. And I don't know whether you guys
18 know me or not, but I'm one of the ones that walked
19 through Baltimore City to get signatures to make
20 affordable housing legal, okay. And for all the work for
21 my colleagues and I to do, I'll be doggone if I'm going

1 to sit back, and see brand new facilities run down
2 because of poor management. So if there's any way we can
3 get in there and see what I see, let's do it. Let's do
4 it for the sake of the people here in Baltimore City.
5 Okay?

6 PRESIDENT DANIELS: We will continue the
7 discussion in the next meeting. And because I think the
8 original comment that you made, Commissioner Guthrie, was
9 to see whether or not funding could be made available,
10 temporary funding. And everything else -- I think the
11 rest of the conversation just stemmed from that
12 particular comment.

13 Any other, any other comment?

14 Do we have a motion to adjourn?

15 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Oh, we -- oh, excuse
16 me.

17 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Yes, sir.

18 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: The reason why I was
19 late is because we didn't have refreshments --

20 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay.

21 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: -- at this meeting.

1 That was the reason why I left and got water and drinks
2 for this meeting. I'm on the Commission to share. We
3 should always have that type of thing ready to go. Okay?
4 I'm supposed to speak on behalf of Carolyn Johnson. Is
5 that in the agenda, right? Is that -- Carolyn Johnson.

6 (Simultaneous comments.)

7 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: I'm here. And I was
8 appointed to speak on her behalf.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: Okay. Okay.

10 PRESIDENT DANIELS: We didn't know that.

11 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Well, that's what I'm
12 bringing it up for.

13 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay

14 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: But, again, I probably
15 wouldn't have missed it if I didn't have to go and get
16 water for this meeting. These things should be at every
17 meeting when we go out in the community. Those things
18 should be there, period.

19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. Well, thank you
20 for -- thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: I just want to make

1 that clear. Don't hurry up and shut me up either. Just
2 it should be done period.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That was nice of you to
4 do that. Okay.

5 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: It's not nice.

6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Just make sure it's
8 done.

9 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. You said that you,
10 you want to discuss the Continuum of Care?

11 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: No. Discuss the
12 housing, the whole program. Discussion around the whole
13 program.

14 MS. ESTRADA: That's the presentation for the
15 Continuum of Care.

16 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Right. So I think we
17 had enough of programs being created, subsidized programs
18 like the Rapid Re-Housing Program which has failed
19 horribly in the City. When we give people 18 months of
20 real support -- it's great when we give tenants rental
21 support for 18 months, particularly homeless folks. But

1 what's at the end of the -- tunnel? We got people in
2 droves right now falling back into homelessness after 18
3 months of rental support. This whole program is parallel
4 to the Rapid Re-Housing Program. This program, the two
5 million that the Affordable Housing Trust Fund is going
6 to spend on this whole program was originally dedicated
7 for a local voucher program with a local voucher subsidy
8 as the regular tenant-based for project-based subsidy for
9 housing for tenants in Baltimore, which is federal. But
10 we were asking for a local voucher program that has the
11 same amenities as that.

12 We went through the City Council, numerous
13 hearings. And so we got the funding to do it, but it
14 never got passed. So now this whole program is what DHCD
15 has decided with, I guess, the Mayor's Office of Homeless
16 Services and other entities. But the main issue with
17 this program is that, number one, they did not talk to
18 the Continuum of Care's Experience Committee which is
19 compiled of homeless folks that's experiencing
20 homelessness either on a daily basis or formerly homeless
21 like myself. They didn't talk to people with that kind

1 of experience. And they didn't talk to any people that
2 were formerly or, or in Rapid Re-Housing that are
3 homeless now again, which we have people on our committee
4 that is homeless again because of the Rapid Re-Housing
5 Program.

6 See, when you don't talk to the community, just
7 like Ms. Vern said, I also went out and signed signatures
8 for the Affordable Housing Trust Fund, and worked
9 alongside of Ms. Vern and with the, the Housing
10 Roundtable and other community leaders, United Workers.
11 We put a lot of work into this to get this established,
12 and it always needs to be community controlled. That
13 means people from the community making these decisions at
14 the table. That's important because we implemented that.

15 And the problem with this program is that we
16 can't keep creating programs that fail people. 1500 a
17 month for 12 months or for 18 months. What's going to
18 happen after that? What we're asking is that when you
19 create a program create it without time limits. Don't
20 initiate time limits on people at the lowest levels
21 because anything could happen. I'll use myself as an

1 example. When I got my voucher I was paying \$47 a month
2 for rent. I went because I was happy, and got a \$15 an
3 hour job. Guess what happened? I was punished for it.
4 They cut my food stamps. My rent went from \$47 a month
5 to 380 a month part-time working. I worked that job for
6 three years, and I maintained my rent. When I lost my
7 job, right, the three -- I worked there for three years.
8 I lost my job. I had an eviction notice, right? It took
9 the City three months before they could give me a rental
10 adjustment. When I got the rental adjustment my rental
11 adjustment went to zero, but I almost got evicted in that
12 process. So HABC had to pay that extra month that I
13 wasn't able to pay. You see? But the subsidy is what
14 saved my butt, right? So I was able to go rent free for
15 close to another additional two years, right? Until I
16 got back on TDAP which my rent went to \$63 a month. Now,
17 because I got approved for Social Security I'm waiting
18 for another rent adjustment from that because I'm getting
19 \$1,068 a month. But the subsidy is what's keeping me
20 housed. If I didn't have those subsidies, I would be
21 homeless again.

1 So we can't create program that make people
2 homeless again. We have to create programs that keep
3 them housed no matter what. Because I think this
4 Affordable Housing Trust Fund this is what --

5 (Intercom announcement interrupts audio.)

6 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: If you're going to do a
7 program like HOPE, no time limits. We'll figure it out.
8 We can figure it out. We've done it in other ways, other
9 subsidies, other monies, other funding. But let's stop
10 creating these programs, and start talking to people in
11 the community. This RAD program which Ms. Vern was
12 talking about Resident Assistance Demonstration Program,
13 we're going to be in a crisis because the management
14 companies aren't, aren't doing what they supposed to do,
15 and the developers look the other way. That's exactly
16 what she's talking about. The developers look the other
17 way. The management company does what it wants. Once
18 they get enough complaints, right, then what happens is
19 the LLC changes.

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Exactly.

21 Um-hmm.

1 Exactly.

2 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: And then we got a new
3 management company in with new security, but does it get
4 any better? No. Again, this is the system we in. By
5 2032, public housing is going to be completely eliminated
6 in Baltimore City. I'm telling you these are facts. All
7 we got is low-risers now. We got Latrol (ph.), we got
8 Douglas, we got (indiscernible) homes and a couple others
9 left. These people where they going to go once we take
10 away those subsidies? And when we put a card on the
11 street for people that are -- the developments that have
12 went RAD already, Rental Assistance Demonstration
13 Program, which is run and owned by private developers,
14 all the high-rises we got is having all these problems.
15 But the elevators brake shaft breaking. Why because of
16 tax credits. We have to put together a campaign to
17 address RAD. And I'll leave it at that. And that's what
18 the RAD Board and other attendant councils are going to
19 be working on, a campaign to address RAD. We have to do
20 that. And I'll leave it at that.

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: I just have one addition

1 to that. I do think that at our last meeting Nicole Hart
2 had to jump off, but I think it was suggested that we
3 have her come back to address some of those issues.

4 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yes.

5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: So I'm not sure when
6 that will be, but I do know that we are hoping to have
7 her come back and address some of this.

8 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. We spoke about it. So we
9 want to do this Continuum of Care presentation to talk
10 about the Rapid Re-Housing, and have Nicole come back and
11 address it.

12 COMMISSIONER JONES: I guess my question is
13 within this Commission do we have the ability to impact
14 policy or regulations or requirements of the, the RAD
15 developers and property managers that you all talking
16 about, and also the HOPE program? Like, do we have any
17 ability to impact the extension of the housing subsidy?

18 MS. ESTRADA: The HOPE program, yes, we're
19 funding that. So, yes, the suggestions that you give us,
20 yes, we --

21 COMMISSIONER JONES: For which program? I'm

1 sorry.

2 MS. ESTRADA: The HOPE program. That's the one
3 that just started. So definitely they're open to
4 suggestions on how to run that better because it's brand
5 new. So that's not a problem. The RAD program is not
6 under us. So --

7 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: It's under HABC.

8 MS. ESTRADA: Yes. So you would have to
9 address them with that. But the Affordable Housing Trust
10 Fund, we're new. So all of your suggestions get taken
11 into consideration, and we go from there.

12 MS. GUTHRIE: And I mean concerning both of
13 your comments, the fact of the matter is that these funds
14 are supposed to go to projects that have a minimum
15 lifespan of, what, 30 or 40 years?

16 (Simultaneous comments.)

17 MS. GUTHRIE: Yeah. That needs to be
18 considered because like Anthony is saying, the time, the
19 time limit is counterintuitive. It's really
20 counterproductive.

21 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. All our projects have 30-

1 year projections.

2 COMMISSIONER JONES: Okay. So maybe if -- can
3 bring back up around for HOPE. Is it currently at 18
4 months for HOPE for the subsidy support?

5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: HOPE is 12 months.

7 COMMISSIONER JONES: Hope is 12 months, okay.

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, it's 12 months.

9 COMMISSIONER JONES: Okay. So maybe we should,
10 I don't know, make that like a recurring agenda item or
11 just make sure that that doesn't fall off the radar in
12 terms of extending the timeline.

13 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah. So we have our Commission
14 Work Group meeting next week.

15 COMMISSIONER JONES: Okay.

16 MS. ESTRADA: So we can make suggestions in
17 there on what you all would like to do on the next
18 meeting. So if either you want to bring back the --
19 Nicole --

20 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Please.

21 MS. ESTRADA: -- for the HOPE rent program, or

1 we also can address the -- and I don't know what the
2 department that is that does the -- what you were
3 speaking on the emergency rental --

4 (Simultaneous comments.)

5 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Direct to tenant
6 payments.

7 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah, direct to tenant payment.
8 So we can -- so that either can be in the next month or
9 the month after, but we can, we can get out -- when it's
10 within the City we can reach out to them to have them
11 come to a meeting, and get, like, their, their
12 availability to come.

13 MR. STANFORD: And would it be good for us to,
14 like, have someone from inspections come out too just
15 give a presentation on how often they do it, whether it's
16 annually --

17 MS. ESTRADA: Right.

18 MR. STANFORD: -- whether it's biannually. And
19 then how it relates to the, the HABC inspections that
20 will come out of voucher holders.

21 MS. ESTRADA: Yeah, and like the program that

1 actually administers the direct payments, they may even
2 have information on inspections. So, like, it's
3 basically just learning how their program works, and what
4 they do for the clients.

5 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Anybody else have anything?
6 Motion to adjourn?

7 COMMISSIONER JONES: I'll move to adjourn.

8 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Just going to do a roll
9 call here. Motion to adjourn.

10 Commissioner Stokes.

11 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Ramsey.
12 Commissioner Edwards.

13 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Agreed.

14 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Joynes.
15 Commissioner Kimball.

16 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Griffin.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: Yes.

18 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Fox.
19 Commissioner Williams.

20 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS: Yeah.

21 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner Jones.

1 COMMISSIONER JONES: Yes.

2 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Commissioner McClain.

3 COMMISSIONER MCCLAIN: Yes.

4 PRESIDENT DANIELS: And Commissioner Guthrie?

5 MS. GUTHRIE: Thank you.

6 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Okay. The motion carries.

7 MS. ESTRADA: Thank you.

8 PRESIDENT DANIELS: Good evening everybody.

9 (Whereupon, at 7:01 p.m., on February 28, 2023,
10 the meeting was adjourned.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

C E R T I F I C A T E

This is to certify that the foregoing transcript in the matter of:

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMISSION MEETING

BEFORE: Kevin Daniels, President

DATE: February 28, 2023

PLACE: Baltimore, Maryland

Represents the full and complete proceedings of the aforementioned matter as reported and reduced to typewriting by Free State Reporting, Inc.



Roland Thomas Bowman, III
Reporter