

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

BALTIMORE CITY DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING
AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMISSION MEETING

(Webex)

Tuesday, December 14, 2021

BEFORE: CINDY TRUITT, Interim President
TISHA GUTHRIE, Co-Chair

MEMBERS PRESENT:

- MATT HILL
- ILETHA JOYNES
- VERNADINE KIMBALL
- KATE EDWARDS

Reported by:
Roland Thomas Bowman, III

1 Also Present:

2 JOHN MOBLEY, Program Manager, Affordable Housing Trust
Fund, DHCD

3 EBONY RECTOR, Project coordinator, Affordable Housing
4 Trust Fund, DHCD

5 CAROLYN WATSON, Community Aide/Administration, Affordable
Housing Trust fund, DHCD

6 STACY FREED, Senior Advisor to Chief Operations Officer,
7 DHCD

8 STEPHANI ESTRADA, Project Coordinator, Affordable Housing
Trust Fund, DHCD

9 WENDY REDFERN, Director of Grants

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

INDEX

Page

Meeting Called to Order by Interim President Truitt	4
Roll Call	4
Approval of November Minutes	7
Departmental Updates/Commission Q&A Dialogue with DHCD	8
Public Comments	25
Other Business	43
Adjournment	47

P R O C E E D I N G S

(6:00 p.m.)

1
2
3 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Good evening
4 everybody. It is December 14, 2021. The time is now
5 6:00 p.m., and I officially welcome you to the Baltimore
6 City Affordable Housing Trust Fund Commission. My name
7 is Cindy Truitt, the Interim President of the Commission;
8 and I'm joined by my Co-Chair, Commissioner Tisha
9 Guthrie. And we're calling our meeting to order.

10 I'd like to start by moving right into our
11 agenda. We'll take attendance to make sure we have a
12 quorum. When you hear your name, please answer it
13 affirmatively.

14 Kate Edwards.

15 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Present.

16 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Matt Hill.

17 COMMISSIONER HILL: Present.

18 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Tisha Guthrie.

19 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Present. Thank you.

20 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Thank you.

21 Alicia Joynes.

1 COMMISSIONER JOYNES: Present.

2 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Vernadine Kimball.

3 COMMISSIONER HILL: I got a message from
4 Ms. Kimball that she is trying to get on still.

5 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Wonderful. Okay.
6 We'll hold on for her.

7 Shannon Snow informed me that she was unable to
8 attend.

9 Ernst Valery.

10 And Tiara Watkins.

11 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Okay. We have a
12 quorum. So we can proceed. I'll turn it over to you
13 Commissioner Guthrie.

14 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Yes. Good evening. Thank
15 you. So the first matter of business is the adoption,
16 the review, and the adoption of the, the minutes from
17 last month's meeting. So I would invite all
18 Commissioners to review the summary of the minutes. And
19 after you have done some, you are free, or you are
20 welcome to make a motion to adopt the minutes.

21 COMMISSIONER JOYNES: This is Commissioner

1 Joynes. The only thing that I didn't see was the -- I
2 think at the last meeting before the approval of the
3 minutes there was another motion to make a small
4 amendment to the agenda to highlight the department
5 update on nominations. I don't see that here. So if we
6 could add that in, I guess, at a later time.

7 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. So Commissioner
8 Joynes is noting that there needs -- the minutes need to
9 be amended to reflect the motion that was made to amend
10 the agenda. Is that what you're asking?

11 COMMISSIONER JOYNES: Yes, ma'am.

12 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. Would the Department
13 reflect or address that issue?

14 COMMISSIONER HILL: I'll second the motion if
15 that's -- is it Iletha's motion to correct the minutes
16 to --

17 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Yes.

18 COMMISSIONER HILL: -- add that as a revision?
19 I second the motion.

20 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Thank you.

21 So all in favor, respond by saying aye.

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

2 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Any in opposition?

3 Any abstentions?

4 Okay. So it is agreed that the minutes should
5 be amended to reflect the motion that was made by
6 Commissioner Joynes to amend the agenda for last months'
7 meeting.

8 Are there any more, any further amendments?

9 And if there are no additions, please feel free
10 to motion that the minutes be approved.

11 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: I'll make that
12 motion -- this is Cindy Truitt -- that the minutes be
13 approved pending the addition of the motion.

14 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. We have a motion.
15 Any seconds?

16 COMMISSIONER HILL: I'll second.

17 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. Commissioner Hill
18 seconds. All in favor.

19 COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

20 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Any in opposition?

21 Any abstentions?

1 Okay. Motion is so moved.

2 Okay. So the next agenda item we have the
3 Department updates, and we have an update for nominations
4 listed as the first item.

5 MS. FREED: Good evening everyone. I'm Stacy
6 Freed. I'm with the Department of Housing and Community
7 Development. Going to update you on the nominations,
8 nominations for the Commission. On December 6th, three
9 candidates were nominated at the City Council meeting:
10 Catherine Stokes representing experience in housing,
11 community development, and planning; Ramsey Ferris,
12 representing the lending community with experience in
13 affordable housing; and Matt -- Commissioner Hill was
14 renominated as the fair housing advocate.

15 On December 9th, two Commissioners were
16 nominated at the Council meeting: Bishop Kevin Daniels,
17 representing the social service provider; and Ms. Kimball
18 was renominated again to serve as the homeowner 50
19 percent of the area median income.

20 The next Council meeting is January 10, 2022.
21 The Mayor's Office of Government Relations is working

1 with other nominees to submit the requisite forms and
2 paperwork so those nominations can move forward.

3 The Council, when the Council will announce a
4 hearing, we don't know a date. Following the hearing,
5 there will be a second reader where the members are
6 against approved, and then a final approval at a third
7 meeting, but we don't have a schedule for that. It's
8 really kind of up -- the Council schedule is not in our
9 purview.

10 There will be beginning tomorrow there will be
11 three nominations posted for open call. One will be the
12 representative of a Realtors and/or Home Builders
13 Association; one will be a tenant, who -- a renter-
14 tenant, who owns 30 -- 30 percent or less of the area
15 median income as required in the -- Council legislation.
16 The third will be a tenant or renter who owns 30 percent
17 or less of the area median income.

18 Happy to answer any questions.

19 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Thank you, Ms. Freed. So
20 we're to understand that there are three positions or
21 three seats that will be open for an application process

1 to the public?

2 MS. FREED: Currently there are three. Again,
3 as a reminder, nominations and what is, what was put
4 forth to the City Council, and who is determined final on
5 open nominations process, it's the decision of the
6 Mayor's Office. We will be, you know, we're starting --
7 we will be posting three. There may be additions to,
8 additions added, as we move -- additions added down the
9 road. Once the link is live, we are happy to share it
10 with the Commissioners.

11 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: I'm sorry. So you said that
12 there are, there are additions that can be made? I'm
13 not, I'm not really clear.

14 MS. FREED: So we are -- tomorrow, tomorrow
15 morning, an open nominations form will be posted for the
16 three positions that I mentioned, and it's -- there are
17 -- it is not -- the application could be amended at some
18 point in time.

19 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. So the process is not
20 clear, and is not a concrete process as of now? There's
21 still --

1 MS. FREED: It's -- there are the three
2 positions. There are three positions that will be posted
3 tomorrow. There is a submission form that will be due in
4 early January. The submission form can be submitted
5 electronically. There is contact information in the
6 event that an interested applicant needs to submit a hard
7 copy.

8 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Stacy, just to clarify.
9 You mentioned, you gave a list of names that were
10 introduced at two --

11 MS. FREED: Correct.

12 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: -- hearings.

13 MS. FREED: Yes.

14 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: How many total have been
15 introduced so far?

16 MS. FREED: Five.

17 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Five people.

18 MS. FREED: Three on the 6th of December; two
19 on the 9th of December.

20 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Okay. And then three
21 will be open call, which will be posted tomorrow.

1 MS. FREED: Yes.

2 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: So that's eight total.

3 MS. FREED: Correct. Eight, and there are 12
4 total commissioners.

5 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: And how is this -- how is
6 the decision being made to determine which seats will be
7 availed as an open application?

8 MS. FREED: Them that's up to -- that's a
9 decision of the Mayor's Office.

10 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: So it's just at the Mayor's
11 discretion. Okay.

12 MS. FREED: Correct.

13 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Any other questions?

14 All right, thank you, Ms. Freed. We appreciate
15 you.

16 So moving on to the revenue update -- I'm
17 sorry. Revenue report and expenses.

18 MR. MOBLEY: Hello everybody? Can you hear me?

19 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Yes.

20 MS. MOBLEY: Hello. My name is John Mobley. I
21 am the Affordable Housing Trust Fund Program Manager, and

1 this is the -- this month's finance update.

2 Going to talk about the budget; going to talk
3 about the revenue taken in so far; going to talk about
4 the expenditure; going to talk about Community Land
5 Trust; the Affordable Housing -- rest of the Affordable
6 Housing Trust Fund. The orientation meeting we talked
7 about last time, that's going to be happening in January
8 2022. We're going to talk about -- we've already talked
9 about the Trust Fund nominations, and the long awaited
10 annual report. So let's go ahead, and get started.

11 So revenue collected to date about 36-1/2
12 million dollars. It has been very interesting this year.
13 This year has been very interesting. We are now in -- in
14 December, and we've collected nearly -- we're about
15 \$2 million short, shy of what we collected all of last
16 year, last fiscal year, which meant going through
17 June 30, 2021.

18 So in the four months, July, August, September
19 and October, right, not even counting for what happens
20 in November, December, we've collected about \$2 million
21 short of what -- of all of the prior, of prior last year.

1 Next slide, please. So we can see how that,
2 how it's broken down. We've got about \$5 million --
3 we've got \$5 million coming from the City of Baltimore
4 bonds in contribution. We have another 5 million --
5 \$5.7 million coming from the revenue that we've received
6 as a result of the different taxes, and different taxes
7 that we get. It's been a pretty good year, and this is
8 just through October 30, 2021.

9 We don't have the expense information for
10 November because this meeting was moved earlier, and the
11 books for November haven't closed yet, and I haven't
12 gotten that data. Or else we'd be talking about
13 November, which also was a very good month for the Trust
14 Fund. But October was a very good month for the Trust
15 Fund. This meeting normally happens the fourth Tuesday;
16 and since it's so early, we just haven't got the books,
17 but I did get revenue information for you for the last
18 time that we -- the last month that has officially
19 closed, along with expenditure.

20 Next slide. We can see the breakdown, dollars
21 and percentages. Looks pretty good. It seems like the

1 -- it's good to see that the tax revenue is overtaking,
2 even increasing value that the, the HCD or City of
3 Baltimore has been putting forth. So you can see that
4 right now the revenue starts to take, take up much, a
5 little bit more of the pie. Every single month it's
6 looking like it's taking more, and I think that's really
7 where we want to be. We want to see the -- that the
8 revenue taxes is working, and that's really -- the tax
9 revenue takes up about 60 -- almost 66 percent of what
10 we've taken in, what we've brought in so far for the
11 Affordable Housing Trust Fund, which is -- which I think
12 is a very good thing.

13 Next slide, please. All right. So when we're
14 comparing August, September, and October, October had
15 more than double the similar transactions than the prior
16 month. It had more than double the money. The average
17 for, also, of all the transactions, if you were to take
18 the transactions, divided by the month -- revenue is
19 high, higher than the prior months.

20 And so you can see with 51 transactions
21 averaging about \$61,000, we receive 3.1 -- a little -- 3.

1 -- \$3,114,206 for this. Well, \$205.79. I should say it
2 properly. I believe it deserves the amount of respect
3 that it's got.

4 And this is why it's a very good month. Look
5 at even in comparison.

6 So on August we had about \$38,000, \$38,000
7 average. September is \$50,000 average. And October, a
8 \$61,000 average. This is quite high.

9 Next slide, please. You can look at it in
10 comparison. Look at it in comparison to other months.
11 It stands out, right? I mean, it's the only month to
12 even compare it to is May of 2021. It is very high. At
13 a higher than what we would have expected for any other
14 month, and especially high for October of the last two
15 years. So this is good news, I think. If we're just
16 looking at it, it looks like an outlier.

17 Now, for those of you -- for the people on the
18 Commission do know, who have gotten a chance to see, next
19 month, the months of November was also extremely high.
20 So it's becoming a trend. So this is a good thing. But
21 we're not exactly sure right now because it's such a

1 variable, such a variable, volatile money source, revenue
2 source. So should be careful with it, but it's
3 noticeable; it's standing out.

4 Next slide, please. The actual revenue for the
5 month -- talking about earlier, 3.1 -- \$3.1 million.
6 We're expecting about \$717,000 according to the latest
7 projection. This is a whole lot higher than we expected.
8 And when we look at, we take the \$717,000, we make --
9 about four months. We should be expecting about 2 --
10 \$2.8 million in the Fund about right now from tax
11 revenue. \$5.7 million in the Fund, almost \$5.8 million
12 in the Fund. That's just through October. Doesn't even
13 count for November and December. So this is where we're
14 at through the end of October.

15 Next slide, please. So now we can look at what
16 we've been doing with the money, and the money that we've
17 -- we've been making a lot of commitments. We've
18 increased the actual expenditures that have gone out.
19 We've been trying to make sure that we reflect those.
20 But we make commitments moving forward. It's not -- it's
21 getting large -- working on getting it larger and larger

1 because we want to make sure that the expenditures
2 percentages grows, grows a lot more. But considering
3 over the last year we made so much, so many commitments,
4 that we're now working to get -- working with the award
5 winners to get them -- the funds out the door, and work
6 through the BOE process. So it's been, so that's been
7 our focus, and we're still working on it.

8 Next slide, please. And here's who we've
9 awarded money to. You can see where, well, where via the
10 dots how much we've awarded money to. The size of the
11 dots kind of tells the story of where the funds are
12 supposed to be going, and the color also shows a
13 different individual project. It's a little bit clearer.
14 We have the final, which we'll be showing -- posted
15 online. You can see that it's not all focused in one
16 particular area. We're doing our best in order to get it
17 out to the area in need in order to impact the City as a
18 whole, and not just one particular area.

19 Next slide, please. So for the single-family
20 homeownership NOFAs, Community Land Trust, still
21 structuring deals. We're doing -- we're getting more and

1 more news, and trying to get faster at getting things
2 through the, the BOE process. It takes a lot of steps.
3 A lot of people have to touch it, but it's a, it's still
4 a process, and we're working at getting faster. The
5 Affordable Housing Trust Fund team is producing very
6 highly, and trying to work with the applicants in order
7 to work with us, and we're all doing the best we can in
8 order to get it out. And now we're heading into the
9 winter break. So, now, we're heading into the winter,
10 holiday break. So we should take that into account.

11 Next slide, please. You can see, oh, the
12 single-family, single-family homeownership NOFA number
13 two for the Community Land Trust, the award announcement
14 is still set for January 25th. The NOFA is closed.
15 Applications are under review. The applications are
16 getting scored right now. We're also reaching out to the
17 applicants, if we have additional questions, like, your
18 applications, because some of them we have some questions
19 about, and we need you to -- a little more information
20 will help with its -- well, hopefully, better scoring.
21 So that way we can award more of the funds, and feel

1 better about it.

2 The panel members are -- include planning,
3 sustainability, project development, and project finance.
4 And we're working on this one with everything we've got,
5 and trying to make sure that we take -- do all the steps
6 necessary for a -- to get a fair, and good scoring
7 process where we evaluate the applications. We had,
8 like, seven applications in total, and not all of them
9 necessarily met threshold. But of the one, of the ones
10 that we have, we've been reaching out to try to work
11 with, try to work with the applicants in order to, to do
12 the best we can with the, with the information that we
13 have available.

14 So next slide, please. The inclusionary
15 housing RFP. The consultant is supposedly onboard.
16 There's a monthly meeting, still third Wednesday of the
17 month, and going to the link to the leading archives is
18 here, and should -- there's enough -- should be a
19 notification on the Affordable Housing Trust Fund
20 website. Please take -- and please attend, if you're
21 interested in that.

1 Next slide, please. New construction,
2 preservation, rental housing NOFAs still structuring.
3 The rental housing NOFAs, as you know, were very much
4 oversubscribed the last, in the last year for both
5 rounds, and now we are still working with the applicants
6 and the builders in order to, like, get through the BOE
7 process, get the contract signed, go back and forth with
8 the legal teams, and kind of to make sure that the
9 applications work, and the deals work. Because we would
10 like to get rid -- hand this money over, and feel very
11 good about it moving forward. So that's where we are
12 with the new construction NOFAs. Nothing new here.

13 Next slide. Here's the Affordable Housing
14 Trust Fund orientation that's going to happen in January
15 2022. This is what we're going to go over in the, in the
16 awardee orientation, being that every one who is able to
17 attend, please try to attend. I think it's going to have
18 some really valuable information for all interested
19 parties. So good time for you to talk to the Affordable
20 Housing Trust Fund team, who is doing their best in order
21 to help guide you all through the process. Got some good

1 people over here trying to work with you; Stephani
2 Estrada, Ebony Rector, and Carolyn Watson, and the team
3 are doing a good job. So show up, and work with them.
4 They really help.

5 Next slide. We've already been over this. And
6 the annual report for Fiscal Year '21. I actually have a
7 question. Has it been mailed out to everyone, the
8 Commission Members? Yeah. I'm seeing different kinds of
9 nods.

10 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: No. Speaking, speaking for
11 myself, I have not received anything.

12 MR. MOBLEY: Okay. Hmm. All right. Well, if
13 --

14 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: -- e-mail. This is Tisha
15 again. Received it via e-mail today.

16 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Yes. Likewise.

17 MR. MOBLEY: Okay. Cool. I know there was a
18 draft under development. I know that the team has been
19 working very hard on it. Lots of recent edits. And
20 wasn't sure if it actually made it out.

21 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: -- sent out to the --

1 MR. MOBLEY: Great.

2 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: -- shortly before --

3 MR. MOBLEY: Okay. So the draft is now -- was
4 working its way around the Department, and I said it was
5 coming to the Commission Member soon, but that was awhile
6 ago. So, now, I think, Commission Members, you all have
7 it. I know that you all just got it now, or right before
8 the meeting. So we're going to be looking forward to
9 your comments, and making -- putting your comments in the
10 draft that was sent around, sent to you all. We would
11 love to get your advice and input on it going forward.

12 So, yeah, next slide, please.

13 COMMISSIONER HILL: John --

14 MR. MOBLEY: -- that's it.

15 COMMISSIONER HILL: I apologize, John. Real
16 quick, when do you need those comments by?

17 MR. MOBLEY: Well, the best answer would have
18 been yesterday, but we just -- without -- as a -- I don't
19 have a due date. I mean, we're all trying to get it over
20 to the Mayor's Office, and out to the public. So I'm not
21 -- I don't have a date for --

1 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I would say the first
2 week of January, if possible. I think our next meeting
3 is the 25th of January, right? So that would give us
4 time to incorporate those comments, and have it together,
5 hopefully, for the January 25th meeting.

6 MR. MOBLEY: Yeah, what she said. So I mean, I
7 go, I go with that.

8 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: So at the end of the
9 first week so that by January 7th, I believe, that
10 Friday.

11 COMMISSIONER HILL: That works. Thank you.

12 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Thank you.

13 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Yes. Thank you, John. I do
14 have a question. This is really old business, but if
15 there's -- I think it really bears reintroduction. I
16 believe it was August we had Ms. Janet Abrahams come, and
17 one of the things that was covered was Fair RAD Cloth. I
18 mean, I'm sorry -- the Faircloth-to-RAD. And we were
19 supposed to be -- we asked for an update as to whether or
20 not there were any, any possible ways that that money
21 would be, would be -- was able to be used by Baltimore to

1 improve the finances, and wondering -- we haven't heard
2 anything. We haven't gotten an update. And if, in fact,
3 HABC can be present next month to address that. It would
4 be a great way to start the year to have Housing here.

5 MS. FREED: We're happy to ask them, and if
6 they're not available, we'll ask them for an update.

7 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Wonderful. Thank you.

8 MR. MOBLEY: So it was a great month, at least
9 money-wise. It was a great month for the money. So
10 makes my charts more interesting, not just so flat. So
11 thank you all so much. Thank you people who burgessed in
12 Baltimore for large dollar amounts. We sincerely
13 appreciate what they're doing. And do what we can in
14 order to move forward from here.

15 I think there were some comments in the -- from
16 the chat. What were the comments? I think -- so of the
17 money awarded, Ms. Sharon Hunt, of the money awarded, how
18 much has actually been disbursed? A little over \$900,000
19 was actually disbursed. I think there was a slide about
20 that. The -- Ms. Sharon Hunt, what does he mean by
21 threshold? So each of the applications that come in get

1 scored on a score from, I guess, zero to, I think, its
2 125 generally. Sometimes it varies. And it has to meet
3 a minimum, minimum amount of score for it to really move
4 forward. And so the threshold is -- can be as low as
5 102, I think is one of the more recent scores, but it has
6 to be -- have score more than 102 points out of the 125
7 possible, plus bonus points that can bump it up past 102.
8 So that's what we mean by threshold.

9 Is the -- Ms. Sharon Hunt. Is the annual
10 report going to be made public, and available online to
11 the Baltimore City website? Yes. I believe the annual
12 report should be public. Right now sent around the
13 draft, and we're going to get comments from the
14 Commission Members. Make their way around. Love to get
15 your comments, and move forward, and the Commission
16 Members comments. And even after it comes out, still
17 love to get your comments. So what is AHTF?
18 (Indiscernible) panelists. AHTF stands for Affordable
19 Housing Trust Fund. That's what we're here for today.
20 (Indiscernible). Yes. So, yes, so I think that's,
21 that's all the questions that I see.

1 Is there something else?

2 MS. ESTRADA: Q&A. Is there a time for the
3 awardee meeting? That's from Melanie Thomas.

4 MR. MOBLEY: Time for the awardee meeting?

5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Orientation.

6 MS. ESTRADA: I think the orientation, yes,
7 that she's speaking.

8 MR. MOBLEY: Oh, I don't --

9 MS. ESTRADA: No, not yet.

10 MR. MOBLEY: (Indiscernible) but I know we'll
11 do our best to make it as convenient as possible.

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, well, actually,
13 John, you know what? Yeah. It's actually, it's going to
14 be at the Affordable Housing Trust Fund. We're doing it
15 for the Commission. So six o'clock, January 25th.

16 MR. MOBLEY: That wasn't my department, but,
17 but, yeah, now I know. So -- okay. If there's nothing
18 else, I'll fade into the background.

19 COMMISSIONER HILL: John, hi. This is Matt
20 Hill. Thanks for the update. That's great news about
21 the revenue. Quick question. I know that the DHCD was

1 working on a, a bar chart that kind of shows progress
2 toward getting the disbursement of the money for those
3 projects that have been approved. Is that -- I guess I
4 was under the assumption that was going to be part of the
5 discussion tonight based on the agenda I saw. Is that
6 later or is that not going to be part of the discussion
7 at this point?

8 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I think that was going
9 to be part of the meeting next month with the
10 orientation.

11 COMMISSIONER HILL: Okay. That's fine. I
12 think I am -- I think that's a really useful chart, and I
13 appreciate the, the Department developing that. It's a
14 great starting place to understand what projects are in
15 the pipeline, where they are in the pipeline. And I do
16 want us to drill down as much as possible in January and
17 months going forward on what are the sticking points that
18 are preventing these projects from moving forward. I am
19 very concerned that a couple years into this, and we
20 still only have \$1 million in actual expenditures. And
21 so the more time I think the Commission can spend on

1 trying to understand where the hangups are, and the
2 holdups, and trying to devote any resources we have to
3 getting rid of those obstacles, and getting this money
4 moving should be priority number one. And then it also
5 concerns me that now this \$18 million or half the Fund
6 that does not have a commitment. So I think it's worth
7 thinking through when the next RFP is going to go out for
8 rental housing, for instance, or some of the other
9 categories that I know need attention.

10 MR. MOBLEY: Yeah, I would love to give, I
11 would love to give it away. We're hoping that it will
12 work -- I know that we would like to have another one as
13 well. That will be fantastic. I'll take that note back
14 to the team and --

15 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Well, we have been
16 discussing the date for the next rental. So we're
17 working on that. It's in the works.

18 MS. ESTRADA: John, one more question. What
19 opportunities are in play for the -- for community
20 members to access equitable home ownership?

21 MR. MOBLEY: Oh, well, the Community Land Trust

1 funds that have been given out have done -- have basic --
2 mostly so far been focused around affordable
3 homeownership. So all the funds that you can see that
4 were going towards Community Land Trust the award
5 recipients -- posted online, the NOFAs that have been --
6 the NOFAs that have dealt with Community Land Trust, each
7 of those organizations, so far, have been -- their
8 applications and their funding is based on them applying
9 -- of granting or finance, granting homeownership
10 opportunities to people below 50 percent of the area
11 median income for people in Baltimore City.

12 So, I mean, I would check with those
13 organizations. We give them the money to do said
14 projects. It's their task to take those funds, and then
15 with other funds, and then create the housing
16 opportunities. You can look on the website, and it will
17 point you to exactly who has the funds, and what
18 opportunities are available currently.

19 COMMISSIONER HILL: Before we wrap up this
20 section, I know Ms. Vern Kimball has been trying to get
21 on, and I think she is, she's on the phone, and I just

1 want to recognize her, and see if she has any questions.
2 I don't know if she can speak her -- she's on the phone.
3 It's 443-929-6051. Is there a way to elevate her to a
4 panelist or something like that?

5 MS. ESTRADA: Yes. Ms. Kimball, I unmuted you.

6 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yes. Yes. Okay. I
7 have to get the right understanding of what's really
8 going on, okay? Could you kind of brief me a little bit
9 with the last thing that you said about the Commissioners
10 being nominated to -- tell me that.

11 COMMISSIONER HILL: Vern, I think John was just
12 wrapping up his presentation on what's going on for DHCD.
13 I just wanted to recognize --

14 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Oh, okay.

15 COMMISSIONER HILL: I'm not trying to cut off
16 your question. I just wanted to make -- recognize that
17 you were here, if you had questions on the DHCD.

18 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Okay, that's -- I can
19 wait. I can wait. Thank you for answering my request.

20 MR. MOBLEY: Where is all the revenue coming
21 from? Where is all the revenue coming from? And what

1 are those -- where -- are those transactions you
2 mentioned? So the Affordable Housing Trust Fund really
3 has two separate revenue sources. Revenue source number
4 one is City of Baltimore, City of Baltimore
5 contributions. So we take funds that are available from
6 the City of Baltimore, whether it be bond funds, et
7 cetera, or other areas, and it comes into the Affordable
8 Housing Trust Fund that way. That's the easiest most
9 easily predictable one that we have.

10 And then revenue source number two, which is a
11 result of excise and transfer taxes for buildings over a
12 million dollars. Buildings sold or refinanced over a
13 million dollars. So the larger, like, construction
14 transfer taxes or purchases over a million dollars
15 involving real estate, small tiny bit of that revenue
16 from those transactions comes into the Affordable Housing
17 Trust Fund.

18 So the City of Baltimore contribution, and then
19 tax revenue contribution, they come together, and form
20 the Affordable Housing Trust Fund, and that's where the
21 revenue for the Affordable Housing Trust Fund or AHTF

1 comes -- that's how it comes together.

2 The transactions mentioned. I'm not exactly
3 sure what transactions I mentioned, but I'm not exactly
4 sure what we're talking about. Talking about where the
5 actual expenditures have actually been going to, we can,
6 we can see the dollar amounts that have gone out. The
7 actual commitments, haven't actually been spent yet, but
8 these are dollars from the -- what has come into the
9 Fund, which has been set aside, or as we say earmarked,
10 for example, to go out as soon as the projects are ready,
11 and get through the process.

12 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Yeah. I think the
13 transactions referred to are the transactions that are
14 actually resulting in the revenue. That's the context I
15 think.

16 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Yeah, the real estate
17 transactions that generate the revenue.

18 MR. MOBLEY: Yeah. So there's a, there's a --
19 every month we get a list of the transactions that
20 qualify, and feed into the Affordable Housing Trust Fund.
21 Generally, it's passed around to our team and the

1 Commissioners, and so we can see where it comes from.

2 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What is the limit on
3 those, John? It's transactions over -- is it over a
4 million dollars?

5 MR. MOBLEY: So that's before. It's
6 transactions over a million dollars. Anything over a
7 million dollars, that's where it starts the transfer tax
8 and revenue from, from those transactions flow in --
9 parts over to the Affordable Housing Trust Fund. But
10 they're such big dollars in some cases that it actually
11 comes into no money, and then -- take that, and then
12 volume, that's how, that's how it comes in.

13 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: John, this is Cindy.
14 Could I just jump over? I have a quick question, and
15 maybe for you, maybe for the Department, and maybe this
16 has been said before I just don't remember. With the
17 money being handed out, so the awards, is there at some
18 point, and I was just trying to glance through the annual
19 report, some kind of a report back in terms of the
20 success of the deployment of the capital? So X, Y, Z
21 company is developing five affordable housing units. Do

1 you then know, and do a look-back if they did, and it
2 took this amount of time, and it was very successful? So
3 that we can see if the deal falls apart, or if there was
4 success in the deployment of the capital.

5 MR. MOBLEY: Well, I think that's a really good
6 idea, and I would absolutely be open to it. Currently,
7 we haven't, we haven't had that as a part of the reports
8 yet, but I really think that is, that is an excellent,
9 excellent idea, and would love to have that as a part of
10 any comments that come back as part of the annual report,
11 or a supplemental report possibly. I'm not advocating
12 for that, but at this point hasn't come up yet, but that
13 makes total sense. We would love to boast about our
14 successes. So --

15 (Simultaneous comments.)

16 MR. MOBLEY: That would be good. So as of
17 right now, we don't quite have --

18 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: That's great.

19 MS. ESTRADA: John, two more questions; is that
20 okay?

21 MR. MOBLEY: Sure.

1 MS. ESTRADA: How many applications were
2 submitted for the second CLT NOFA? Will those applicants
3 be posted on the website as it was with the first
4 applicant? That's from Melanie Thomas.

5 MR. MOBLEY: There were seven applications that
6 were submitted for the, for the last NOFA. Putting in
7 the application -- the applicants, I don't -- putting in
8 just whoever applied, I don't know that we're going to be
9 --

10 (Simultaneous comments.)

11 MR. MOBLEY: In what respect? Go ahead Kate.

12 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I was saying, I think
13 the last time we did not put up applicants. We put up
14 the awardees. We put up the after the awards are
15 announced, then we would list those that would be
16 awarded. That's what would go on the website.

17 MS. ESTRADA: Okay. Next one. I have a
18 question related to the eventual, I guess, eventually
19 return of these meetings to a more in-person rather than
20 virtual platform; as well as a question related to the
21 Mayor's process for choosing committee applicants to fill

1 vacancies on the Commission. Hold on. I was going to
2 say --

3 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I can address the first
4 one. As of now all the City Commission meetings, even
5 beyond the Affordable Housing Trust Fund are still
6 virtual. So for now, that is the way the City is still
7 holding virtual meetings due to Covid. So until that
8 policy is changed, we'll continue to have virtual
9 meetings.

10 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Thank you, Kate. I think a
11 more direct question would be what is the policy?
12 Because as it is right now we don't -- I haven't heard
13 any kind of expressed standard or how we're measuring,
14 how we're -- what benchmark we'd be trying to meet to
15 indicate when we can start having these meetings back in
16 person. Not just the Trust Fund meeting, but commission
17 meetings across the Board. And I think if there is a
18 more transparent policy that can be availed to the
19 public, then at least people will have an expectation.

20 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I think that would have
21 to be a question that would have to float up to the

1 Mayor's Office. We've just been instructed that as of
2 now we're continuing with virtual meetings. I know that
3 there has been some discussion of technology in the
4 future, investment in the technology to have hybrid
5 meetings, but we'd have to get more information on that.
6 I'm not prepared with the specific policy at this point.
7 That's been our instructions.

8 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. Because we have
9 mentioned this a couple of time before.

10 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Yes. And we've
11 inquired, and what we've been told is that the City is
12 still continuing with virtual meetings.

13 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: No. I mean we've talked,
14 we've asked about like a documented -- I mean, just like
15 with hospitals. When they talk about visitation, and
16 having a red, a yellow, or green, and patients and
17 families understand what, what numbers have to be met
18 before they can start visiting their loved ones in the
19 hospital. Kind of the same idea of having something very
20 concrete so that the public can have an expectation. So
21 just, I think, working on something like that would be

1 very beneficial to really communicate with the public
2 that it is important to have the meetings in person, but
3 it's also important to protect public safety.

4 Are there any -- do we have --

5 MR. MOBLEY: I believe there's one more
6 question from Ms. Shannon Hunt. It says what's the
7 objection to listing those who apply for the second NOFA?
8 It is not -- be a manifestation of transparency.

9 Kate, would you --

10 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I mean, that just has
11 not been how we've handled it in our past. It's always
12 been the awardees, people who have applied. I think we'd
13 have to take that under consideration.

14 COMMISSIONER HILL: Can I --

15 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: -- evaluate that.

16 COMMISSIONER HILL: I'm sorry. I didn't mean
17 to interrupt.

18 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Go ahead, Matt.

19 COMMISSIONER HILL: My memory is there was some
20 -- I'm sorry -- is somebody else speaking? My memory is
21 there was some discussion of having a little more

1 transparency in that sense in the way they do the
2 Affordable -- excuse me -- the Low Income Housing Tax
3 Credit awards where there's a listing of who applied,
4 their scores, and from there who was, who was selected.
5 And I'll have to go back, and look at the notes, but I
6 thought that had been the agreement at some point, but
7 that was, that was --

8 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: You said there was an
9 agreement to have? Say it again, Matt.

10 COMMISSIONER HILL: Right. So State Low Income
11 Housing Tax Credit awardees are listed. They're listed,
12 and their scores are listed, and the folks that are not
13 chosen are listed as well with their scores. So that
14 there's a measure of transparency in whose being awarded
15 these funds, and what their scores were. I favor that
16 kind of transparency with this Trust Fund. I can dig up
17 the Low Income Housing Tax Credit awards just so you all
18 can see what that looks like, and I think it, yeah, it
19 just provides more, hey, what's going on here? So people
20 know what's really happening.

21 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: Okay. We'll take that

1 under consideration. It's just not the practice that
2 I've seen in the past, but that's something we have
3 discussed, talk about it a little bit.

4 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: And just one, one more thing
5 on my part with regards to the meeting moving forward.
6 It would be -- kind of to echo what Commissioner Hill
7 indicated, having a visual to reflect the money that's
8 actually getting into the hands of the awardees. It's --
9 of course, it's great to see the revenue coming in, but
10 there also needs to be a reflection of what is actually
11 getting out the door. Not only for full transparency,
12 but to also lend credibility to what some of our, some of
13 our residents, some of the awardees are expressing when
14 they do attend the meetings, and when they do express
15 their concern about the slow, the slow, the slow pattern
16 of the money getting out the door. It's one thing to
17 hear it from -- hear it in chat, and for people to have
18 their voice lifted up, but it's another thing to actually
19 have it documented, have it visible so that others, who
20 are maybe just joining the meetings for the first time,
21 or who don't really have a clear grasp of what the

1 frustration is, just to show the whole picture. It's
2 wonderful. I think everyone is pleased that we have
3 revenue in the pot, but showing the whole picture it is
4 only fair and comprehensive. So I'm really hoping that
5 we can, we can start doing that as was promised.

6 MR. MOBLEY: Shannon Hunt said there's no
7 reason to keep doing everything as it was done in the
8 past. We absolutely (indiscernible). That's all.

9 MS. ESTRADA: One last one, John. Has the
10 Department adopted the position of being last in relative
11 to capital (indiscernible) financing for awardees of AHTF
12 funding?

13 MR. MOBLEY: Well, I don't think that that is
14 the official position. However, it would be nice to know
15 what we have the last dollars in. We want to make sure
16 that we are trying -- we're trying to fund the best
17 projects possible, and move them. That would be ideal.
18 However, I don't think that's the official position. So
19 it will be nice. But we're doing everything that we can
20 in order to, to help fund the best projects that we can,
21 whatever we can get in to do as presented. So I think

1 that's, that's the (indiscernible).

2 Okay everyone. It was nice seeing you. See
3 you next month.

4 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Thank you so much,
5 Mr. Mobley.

6 MS. KIMBALL: Thank you.

7 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: All right. So
8 Commissioners, do we have anything you'd like to put on
9 the table? Any further discussions?

10 COMMISSIONER HILL: Yes. This is Matt Hill. I
11 have business -- just e-mailed you all a motion that I'd
12 like to introduce, and I've been disappointed with the
13 selection process around the Affordable Housing Trust
14 Fund Commission. There have been positions vacant for
15 more than 120 days. It's been more than one year since
16 the Mayor was brought into office, and there are --
17 sounded like about five replacement Commission members
18 nominated, another three where there's some form of a
19 process, but even that doesn't fully round out the
20 Commission.

21 So I'm going to make a motion to help with that

1 process, and I'll just read it. Again, I just e-mailed
2 this to you all. Where there are at least two positions
3 on the Affordable Housing Trust Fund Commission that have
4 been vacant for at least 120 days, and for which the
5 Mayor has not submitted any replacement nominations to
6 the City Council, accordingly, pursuant to Article 4,
7 Section 6(g) of the Charter, I move that the following
8 persons be certified, and submitted to City Council for
9 confirmation as members of the Affordable Housing Trust
10 Fund Commission: One, Anthony Smith, a current member of
11 the Lived Experience Committee at the City's Continuum of
12 Care Board for the position of representative of the
13 Homeless Services Board; and, two, Tisha Guthrie, a
14 tenant, who is a member of an extremely low income
15 household, for the position created by Ordinance 20-0625,
16 Landlord-Tenant Right to Counsel in Eviction Cases.

17 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Thank you, Commissioner
18 Hill.

19 Do we have a second?

20 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Yes. I second that
21 emotion (verbatim).

1 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. Commissioner Kimball

2 --

3 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Can you hear me?

4 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Yes, ma'am. Commissioner

5 Kimball has seconded Commissioner Hill's motion.

6 All in favor.

7 COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

8 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: All opposed.

9 Any abstentions.

10 COMMISSIONER EDWARDS: I abstain. Commissioner

11 Edwards.

12 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. We have on the record

13 Commissioner Edwards as an abstention.

14 The motion is moved forward.

15 Thank you, Commissioner Hill.

16 So I believe the protocol would be that this

17 would be sent to City Council.

18 COMMISSIONER HILL: Yes, that's right. Looking

19 at the Charter, it appears that this needs to be sent to

20 the City Council. I'd ask that Cindy --

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: How many -- I'm sorry.

1 How many Commissioners? Could we have the official count
2 of ayes?

3 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Commissioner Guthrie aye.

4 COMMISSIONER HILL: Commissioner Member Matt
5 Hill. Aye.

6 COMMISSIONER JOYNES: Commissioner Joynes.
7 Aye.

8 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Commissioner Truitt.
9 Aye.

10 COMMISSIONER KIMBALL: Aye.

11 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: There are five ayes and
12 one abstention.

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. Thank you.

14 COMMISSIONER HILL: So as a point of
15 (indiscernible) my understanding from the Charter is that
16 the names should then be -- essentially, the motion
17 should be forwarded to the City Council, which I assume
18 is the City Council President's Office, and maybe the
19 Parliamentarian, to move that forward.

20 Tisha, I hate to put it on you but --

21 CO-CHAIR GUTHRIE: Okay. We will take on the

1 task.

2 Is there any further discussion amongst the
3 Commission?

4 I will turn it back over to Chairperson Truitt.

5 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: Okay. Are we going
6 to reopen for public comment? If there's any additional
7 comment?

8 MS. ESTRADA: No more comments.

9 INTERIM PRESIDENT TRUITT: No more comments.
10 Okay. Then if there's -- any other -- no other business?
11 Then we could officially adjourn the meeting at 6:55 p.m.

12 (Whereupon, at 6:55 p.m., on December 14, 2021,
13 the meeting was adjourned.)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

C E R T I F I C A T E

This is to certify that the foregoing transcript in the matter of:

AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRUST FUND COMMISSION MEETING

BEFORE: Cindy Truitt, Interim President

DATE: December 14, 2021

PLACE: (Webex)

Represents the full and complete proceedings of the aforementioned matter as reported and reduced to typewriting by Free State Reporting, Inc.



Roland Thomas Bowman, III, Reporter
Free State Reporting, Inc.